

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

August 4, 2015 5:30 PM
 City Hall Auditorium
 200 E. University Ave

Members Present	Members Absent	Staff Present
Bill Warinner (Chair)		Jason Simmons
	Scott Gill (Vice-Chair)	Sal Cumella
Betsy Albury		Dean Mimms
Jay Reeves, Jr.		
Michelle Hazen		
Charlotte Lake		
Ann Stacy		
Jason Straw		
Sandra Lamme		

I. Roll Call

II. Approval of Agenda (*Note: order of business subject to change*)

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Betsy Albury
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 8-0

III. Announcements: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

BOARD MEMBERS

Chair: Bill Warinner Vice Chair: Scott Gill
 Jay Reeves, Betsy Albury, Michelle Hazen, Anne Stacy, Charlotte Lake, Jason Straw, Sandra Lamme
 Staff Liaison: Jason Simmons

IV. Approval of Minutes: [July 7, 2015](#)

Motion By: Charlotte Lake	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 8-0

V. Requests to Address the Board

Howard McLean of Skinner, Vignola, McLean, Inc., gave an update on proposed designs for a proposed multiple-family development at 504 and 508 SW 10th Street. Mr. McLean wanted feedback on some architectural renderings of the development.

VI. Old Business

VII. New Business

1. **Petition HP-15-39** Aner & Sarit Sela, owners. Replace and extend an existing fence with a 6-ft. high wood privacy fence. Located at 405 NE 10th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
Planning Division staff recommends approval of Petition HP-15-39.

[Staff Report](#)

[Exhibit 1](#) Site Plan

[Exhibit 2](#) Photos of Property

[Exhibit 3](#) Application, survey, and photos of property and neighboring properties

[Exhibit 4](#) Examples of fence products

[Citizen Comment](#)

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Sarit Sela gave the owners presentation, indicating that they could meet staff conditions except for the condition about setting the fence back 5 feet from the sidewalk. The board discussed the setback issue and the style of fence appropriate along NE 4th Terrace. Aner Sela, owner, also spoke to the issue of where the six foot fence height would be measured from.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve, with the fence next to the sidewalk to be a 6-foot fence with up to 4 feet of the bottom part of the fence to be a board on board solid wood fence and the top 2 feet to be lattice work, with a 2 foot setback from the sidewalk.	Upon Vote: 8-0

Historic Preservation Board
 August 4, 2015
 (Continued)

2. **Petition HP-15-40** Aner & Sarit Sela, owners. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for conversion of a room into a master bathroom in a single-family dwelling. Located at 405 NE 10th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
Planning Division staff recommends approval of Petition HP-15-40.

Staff Report

- Exhibit 1 Application
- Exhibit 2 Photos and Elevations
- Exhibit 3 City of Gainesville Code of Ordnances Section 25-65
- Exhibit 4 Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Michelle Hazen
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 8-0

3. **Petition HP-15-41** Jon Rehfuss, agent for Jason Straw. New construction of a single-family house. Located at 619 NW 3rd Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.
Planning Division staff recommends approval of Petition HP-15-41 with conditions.

Staff Report

- Exhibit 1 Photos of Site and Similar Architecture of Existing Contributing Structures
- Exhibit 2 Plans
- Exhibit 3 Specification Sheet
- Exhibit 4 Excerpts from City of Gainesville *Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines*
- Exhibit 5 City of Gainesville Land Development Code Section 30-52 *Residential low Density Districts (RMF-5, and MH)*
- Exhibit 6 Application for Modification of Existing Zoning Requirements
- Exhibit 7 COA Application
- Exhibit 8 Form 8B Memorandum of Voting Conflict for Jason Straw

Sal Cumella, Temporary Professional, gave the staff presentation. Mr. Cumella indicated that the board would need to make two separate motions to approve the petition. One motion would be to approve the new construction COA for the proposed single-family house; the second motion would approve the modification of the required front setback from 20 feet to 15 feet.

Historic Preservation Board
August 4, 2015
(Continued)

Motion By: Michelle Hazen	Seconded By: Charlotte Lake
Moved To: Approve with the stipulation to use a wood-clad window of some variety that would mimic the proportions of a historic window.	Upon Vote: 7-0, with Jason Straw recusing himself

Motion By: Charlotte Lake	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve the staff recommendation to allow a 15 foot front setback for the house.	Upon Vote: 7-0, with Jason Straw recusing himself

4. **Petition HP-13-27** Jay Reeves, agent for John and Susan Brennan. Request a Part II Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitation of the contributing principal building and construction of a new accessory structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Located at 420 NE 5th Street.

Planning Division staff recommends approval of Petition HP-13-27 for a "Part 2" ad valorem tax exemption.

Staff Report

- Exhibit 1 Part 1 Application and Backup Materials
Exhibit 2 Rehabilitation Costs and Receipts
Exhibit 3 Photos
Exhibit 4 Application

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Betsy Albury
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 7-0, with Jay Reeves recusing himself

5. **Petition HP-15-42** Barney Cuddington, owner. Replacement of an 8-foot wood privacy fence and gate with similar materials and design. Located at 408 SE 7th Street. The buildings are contributing to the Southeast Historic District.

Planning Division staff recommends approval of Petition HP-15-42 with conditions.

Staff Report

- Exhibit 1 Photos of Property
Exhibit 2 Site Plan
Exhibit 3 All Florida Enterprises, Inc. Proposal
Exhibit 4 FL Master Site File 8AL2100
Exhibit 5 Application

Historic Preservation Board
August 4, 2015
(Continued)

Sal Cumella, Temporary Professional, gave the staff presentation. Barney Cuddington, owner of the property, spoke to questions from the board.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve 8-foot tall gate with the understanding that this action is not intended to set a precedent.	Upon Vote: 8-0

6. [Waiver of 90-day](#) 1316/1320 NW 4th Lane.
[Demolition Delay](#) 1316 NW 4th Place.

Tony Flegert of CHW gave a brief presentation about needing these properties as a staging area for, "The Standard," mixed-use development which will soon start construction.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Betsy Albury
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 8-0

VIII. Information Items: N/A

IX. Board Member Comments

X. Adjournment

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.

Chair, Historic Preservation Board
Bill Warinner

Date

Staff Liaison, Historic Preservation Board
Jason Simmons

Date

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

August 2, 2016 5:30 PM
 City Hall Auditorium
 200 E. University Ave

Members Present	Members Absent	Staff Present
Bill Warinner (Chair)		Jason Simmons
Jay Reeves, Jr. (Vice Chair)		Andrew Persons
Michelle Hazen		Cleary Larkin
	Charlotte Lake	Gigi Simmons
Ann Stacy		
Jason Straw		
	Scott Daniels	
	Betsy Albury	

I. Roll Call

II. Approval of Agenda *(Note: order of business subject to change)*

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote 5-0

III. Announcement: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

IV. Approval of Minutes: July 5, 2016

BOARD MEMBERS

Chair: Bill Warinner Vice Chair: Jay Reeves
 Betsy Albury, Michelle Hazen, Ann Stacy, Charlotte Lake, Jason Straw, Scott Daniels
 Staff Liaison: Jason Simmons

Historic Preservation Board
August 2, 2016
(Continued)

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Jason Straw
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 5-0

V. Requests to Address the Board

Bud Reeger, architect, discussed a proposal for constructing an accessory structure mother-in-law suite at 560 NE 7th Avenue, and received guidance and comments from the board.

Lendel Lanier, Florida Concrete Recycling, Inc. explained requesting a waiver of several 90-day demolition delays.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay for the structures at 1934 NW 1 st Avenue, 109 NW 20 th Street, 115 NW 20 th Street, and 1935/1937 NW 2 nd Avenue.	Upon Vote: 5-0

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Michelle Hazen
Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay at 1035 SE 4 th Street.	Upon Vote: 5-0

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Jason Straw
Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay at 1105 W. University Avenue.	Upon Vote: 5-0

VI. Old Business

VII. New Business

1. **Petition HP-16-56** Robert Pratt, owner. Demolish a single-family dwelling located at 414 NW 6th Avenue. This home is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Robert Pratt, owner, spoke to the matter and answered questions from the board. He answered questions about the proposed lot split and the placement of the new lot line in relation to the house. The board discussed the fact that part of the house is in the NW 6th Avenue right-of-way. Melanie Barr spoke to the matter to indicate this would be a loss of an African-American house in Pleasant Street, the first predominantly African-American historic district in Florida. Brian Kalt, who was in attendance for another item, spoke in favor of the demolition.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Jason Straw
-----------------------------------	---------------------------------

Moved To: Approve demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way and based on the conditions of the building.	Upon Vote: 3-2 (Reeves, Warinner, & Stacy yay; Straw & Hazen nay; motion not adopted because a COA needs an affirmative vote of at least 4 members if 5 members are voting).
--	---

Motion By: Michelle Hazen	Seconded By: Jason Straw
Moved To: Amend the motion to approve the demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way and based on the conditions of the building, by adding a provision that the properties that are part of the lot split be divided in a 50/50 split.	Upon Vote: 4-1 (nay: Straw)

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Straw
Moved To: Approve demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way, based on the conditions of the building, and based on the condition that the properties that are part of the lot split be divided in a 50/50 split.	Upon Vote: 4-1

2. **Petition HP-16-61** Brian Kalt, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 105 NW 7th Terrace. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District – North.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Laura Kalt and Brian Kalt, owners, spoke to the petition. They proposed installing a Gulfrib Tuff Rib metal roofing system. They mentioned two houses located to the east of their property had recently had Gulfrib style metal roofs installed. Mr. Simmons indicated that there was apparently no COA for either of those reroof projects, and the board indicated that the matter should be further investigated.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Ann Stacy
Moved To: Approve with staff conditions that the roof be a standing seam or a 5-V Crimp metal roof and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.	Upon Vote: 5-0

3. **Petition HP-15-40** Aner & Sarit Sela, owners. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for conversion of a room into a master bathroom in a single-family dwelling. Located at 405 NE 10th Avenue.

This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Sarit Sela, owner, spoke to the petition and answered a question from the board.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr.	Seconded By: Michelle Hazen
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 5-0

- 4. **Petition HP-12-16 & HP-12-18** Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Jason and Rachel Haeseler. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitation of a single-family dwelling. Located at 306 NE 7th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Michelle Hazen
Moved To: Approve	Upon Vote: 4-0, with Jay Reeves recusing himself.

- 5. **Petition HP-16-63 & HP-16-64** Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Mike and Michelle Jaffee. Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the interior renovation, and a guest house addition to an existing garage. Located at 621 NE 5th Terrace. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Jay Reeves, agent, spoke to the petition and answered questions from the board.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Ann Stacy
Moved To: Approved with staff conditions.	Upon Vote: 4-0, with Jay Reeves recusing himself.

- 6. **Petition HP-16-66** Anthony Ackrill, owner. Demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and the new construction of an accessory structure. Located at 717 NE 3rd Avenue. This building will be non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Historic Preservation Board
 August, 2 2016
 (Continued)

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Anthony Ackrill, owner, spoke to the petition and answered questions from the board.

Motion By: Jason Straw	Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.
Moved To: Approve with staff conditions.	Upon Vote: 5-0

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Petition HP-16-60. 1017 NW 2nd Street. Construct a rear screen porch addition onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Abby Hogan, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-62. 306 NE 7th Street. Remove an existing exterior stair case and replace with a new stair case onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Terry Fleming, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-65. 525 NE 9th Avenue. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Julie Knox and Craig Smith, owners. Christopher Tenney, Godwin Green Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-16-67. 542 NW 3rd Street. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Lillie Harris, owner.

VII. Information Items: N/A

Kehua Hu, owner of the Bailey House, asked the board to allow a 5-V Crimp metal roof for the reroofing of the historic structure. At the July 5, 2016 HPB meeting, the board approved a standing seam style metal roof, as the most appropriate for a house with the significance of the Bailey House. There was discussion about roofing options if she could not afford the standing seam metal roof. The board felt the standing seam was the most appropriate and the 5-V Crimp was not appropriate for this significant historical structure.

IX. Board Member Comments

X. Adjournment

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.

Historic Preservation Board
August 2, 2016
(Continued)

Chair, Historic Preservation Board
Bill Warinner

Date

Staff Liaison, Historic Preservation Board

Date