

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL  
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government RFP# CAUD-170010-DH  
 and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR: 3 DATE: 11/7/16  
 FIRM NAME: BAKER TILLY VIRCHOW KRANSE, LLP

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	55	Extensive auditing team experience from technical experience 8 team members for audits Author of utility industry books and trainings Prior experience w/ GRU regarding cost allocation, business process reviews, and rate consulting services
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	WISCONSIN location + budget might be an issue
TOTAL			
	100	95	

P

**WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR#: 3 RFP#: CAUD-170010-DH DATE: 11/7/16

FIRM NAME: BAKER TILLY VIRCHOW KRAUSE, LLP

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	30	Extensive knowledge of subject matter + experience
o Project Approach	30	30	Very detailed listing
o Project Manager	15	15	33 years experience; 64 experience
o Project Team	15	15	Comprehensive team
o Project Schedule	5	5	Thorough + realistic
o Project Organization	5	5	
<b>TOTAL</b>	100	100	✓

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL  
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government RFP# CAUD-170010-DH  
and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR: 3 DATE: 11/7/18  
 FIRM NAME: CARR, RIGGS & INGRAM, LLC dba CR1

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	<i>A team members w/ minimum of 7 yrs and most of 20 yrs experience. Has auditing experience w/ utilities Electric, water, WPD, Gas, &amp; Telecom. Largest, most experience in Florida. Have worked on ERM's Fuel Adj. Calc. and utility tax examination.</i>
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	<i>January 2018 time line - realistic level location. Good relevant list of past audits</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	100	90 ✓	

## WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR#: 3

RFP#: CAUD-170010-DH

DATE: 11/7/16

FIRM NAME: CARR, FEGGS & INGRAM, LLC dba CRI

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	30	Thorough listing of team's experience
o Project Approach	30	25	Didn't locate use of comp. assisted audit techniques. Uncertain of staff assignments.
o Project Manager	15	10	Audit managers 7-9 years of experience
o Project Team	15	15	9 team members with various capabilities
o Project Schedule	5	5	Realistic schedule w/ January 2018 time-line
o Project Organization	5	4	RFP wasn't as easy to navigate for information
TOTAL	100	89	

## TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government RFP# CAUD-170010-DH  
 and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR: 3 DATE: 11/7/16

FIRM NAME: MALCOLM & JENKINS, LLC

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	40	Partner, Supervisory, & Staff Qualifications and Experience minimum of 8 yrs w/ not of 34. Engagement partner & mgmt has significant Florida experience. Audit experience includes electric, water & wastewater but no examples of gas & gascon.  Didn't see past performance on similar audits Audit schedule July-December with December being unrealistic completion date
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	75	

## WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR#: 3  
 RFP#: CAUD-170010-DH  
 DATE: 11/7/16

FIRM NAME: MAULDIN & JENKINS, LLC

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	20	No gas + gruem experience
o Project Approach	30	30	very thorough
o Project Manager	15	15	Engagement lead partner has extensive (20 yrs) electric, water, + wastewater exp.
o Project Team	15	15	years of experience mini of 8; max of 34
o Project Schedule	5	4	unrealistic December deadline
o Project Organization	5	5	good details
TOTAL	100	89	✓

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL  
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government RFP# CAUD-170010-DH  
 and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR: #3 DATE: 8/7/16

FIRM NAME: PURVIS, GRAY AND CO., LLP

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	55	Extensive experience and qualifications of staff. Current auditor and has unique experience. Auditing group for GRU has minimum 7 yrs and max of 38 years of experience.
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	Has the benefit of being aware of GRU auditors and has the ability of producing realistic audit schedule and meeting deadlines.
TOTAL	100	95 ✓	

## WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Professional Auditing Services for General Government and Gainesville Regional Utilities  
 EVALUATOR#: 3

RFP#: CAUD-170010-DH

DATE: 11/7/16

FIRM NAME: PARVIS, GRAY AND CO., LLC

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	30	Current auditors and have unique experience
o Project Approach	30	25	Very thorough; specific work plan
o Project Manager	15	15	Extensive years of relevant experience
o Project Team	15	15	Extensive years of experience w/GEU experience
o Project Schedule	5	5	Specific work plan outlines tasks with associated time lines
o Project Organization	5	5	Very organized
TOTAL	100	95 ✓	