

City of Gainesville

City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601



Meeting Agenda

January 5, 2021

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Elizabeth Hauck - Member
Michael Hill - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER**ROLL CALL****ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES**OLD BUSINESS:**

[200488.](#)

Addition and window replacement on Masonic Lodge located at 215 N. Main Street (B)

Petition HP-20-101. Keith Perry & Luis D. Rodriguez, ESQ, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition and replace windows on the Masonic Lodge #41. Located at 215 N. Main Street. This building is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Explanation: The Masonic Lodge was built in 1908 in the Italian Renaissance style with a pediment hip roof and wide overhanging eaves and had been well preserved and remained mostly unaltered. The site is currently listed on the National Register of Historic Places and has been since 1998 and was continuously owned and operated as a Masonic Lodge since its construction until recently. There is an existing petition (HP-19-112) in process for placement on the local register of historic places. The applicant is proposing to replace the existing wood windows.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the board review the request for the proposed window replacement for Petition HP-20-101.

[200488 StaffReport HP-20-101 20201110.pdf](#)

[200488 StaffReport HP-20-101 20210105](#)

[200488 HP-20-101 HMG Letter 202010105](#)

[HP-20-101 Masonic ~Window Sash Replacement](#)

[170343.](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of a structure located at 609 NE 6th Street.

Petition HP-17-39. Martin Vala, applicant for Steffen Vala, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of a structure at 609 NE 6th Street. The property is located within the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: This request was originally heard at the September 5, 2017, Historic Preservation Board meeting. The property is located at 609 NE 6th Street and is zoned RSF-3 and located in the Northeast Historic District.

The existing house consists of a one-and-a-half story frame structure on brick masonry piers, with "low Queen Anne Cottage" detailing, constructed circa 1913 (FMSF 8AL00639). The house has asbestos siding covering wood lap siding, a cross-gable roof with metal crimp roofing and wood doors and multi-pane windows, most in a double-hung configuration. The house had a front porch that was altered with chert hip walls and extended to cover a second front entry to a "mother-in-law" suite, not original to the house. The house also had a rear screened porch addition with a shed roof. The house was severely deteriorated, including foundation rot and termite infestation through to the attic.

An accessory structure was located at the rear of the lot. It had a gable-roof wood-frame and wood sided structure with a large garage-style opening on the front (west side). The accessory structure was also severely deteriorated.

The proposed work consists of: full rehabilitation of the house to create a single-family home, asbestos siding was removed and lead paint abatement, restoration of front elevation and porch to single entry, similar to the historic design, new wood lap siding, new bays on the new and south elevations, new wood 2/2 hung windows, new roof configuration with standing seam metal roof.

This application does not include the previously approved zoning modification request of 3.5' on the rear setback (required 7.5') for a new accessory structure and a Part 1 Ad Valorem tax exemption review for all work.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

[170343_Staff Report w Exhibits 1-5_20170905.pdf](#)

[170343_Updated Plans_20201201](#)

[170343_HP-17-39_Vala_20210105](#)

[170343_HP-17-39_MartinVala_Duckpond-Materials_20210105](#)

[200481.](#)

Reroof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof and make various

repairs with a Part 1 Ad Valorem tax exemption application (B)

Petition HP-20-90. Doug Ammerman, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness and an Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Part 1 review to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof and repair windows, the front porch, and termite damage. Located at 730 NW 2nd Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Explanation: The name of this property is the Metts / Perkins House. The existing single-family dwelling is a two-story Queen Anne style wood frame balloon house, with three large brick columns on the partially enclosed veranda which may have been added to update the style when bungalows were popular. The front door has applied carving and marginal flashed glass. There is a cross gable roof with asbestos composition shingles and a secondary shed roof structure for the porch. There are two brick chimneys, a continuous foundation of brick and brick piers, wood novelty siding with cornerboards, and 2/2 wood windows as well as metal awning windows. The porch on the east side has a one story veranda that wraps around a bay, with large brick columns. The north part of the veranda is enclosed. There is a balcony on the second floor above the porch. The house is a contributing structure that was built in 1891 according to the Alachua County Property Appraiser; a Florida Master Site File indicates the home was built circa 1905-1909. The first Sanborn map to show this location is the 1909 edition. The 1913 Sanborn map shows that the front porch was enlarged and a second story bay and porch were added, in addition to a rear porch. The property is zoned RC and is approximately 0.36 acres in size. The house is approximately 3,021 square feet in total area, 2,736 square feet in heated area. The house contributes in scale and character to the Fifth Avenue neighborhood. The applicant indicates that this house was the first bed and breakfast establishment in Gainesville.

The existing roof has asbestos and cannot be insured. The proposal would replace about 40 squares of asbestos roofing with 5V-Crimp metal roofing which the applicant feels is appropriate for the neighborhood. The proposed 5V-Crimp roofing material is Gulf Coast Supply and Manufacturing, and will have a mill finish. A variety of metal roof types are evident in the Pleasant Street neighborhood including rib style roofs, standing seam roofs, and 3-V Crimp style roofs. In addition the windows on the house are to be repaired and the broken glass replaced, as well as repair of termite damage and painting. The staff recommendation is that the roof finish for the proposed metal roof be Galvalume or a medium to light gray paint finish, which is consistent with the finish/color recommendation adopted by the Historic Preservation Board on April 2, 2013.

Section 25-61 et seq of the City Code of Ordinances authorizes ad valorem tax exemptions for historic properties. As part of its review, the Historic Preservation Board must determine whether "the proposed improvement is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and is therefore an eligible improvement.”

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-90 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish and make the finding that the property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and the proposed improvements are eligible improvements.

[HP-20-00090_730NW2ndSt_Reroof&Pt1Advlrm_StaffRprt.pdf](#)

[200481_HP-20-00090_730NW2ndSt_Reroof&Pt1Advlrm_StaffRprt_20210105](#)

[200481_AmmermanRoofDrawings_20210105](#)

[200481_Gulfseam by Gulfcoast_20210105](#)

[200481_Roof drawing_20210105](#)

[200481_Scope of Work_20210105](#)

[200571.](#)

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

Petition HP-20-111. Alan G. Weinstein, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 626 NW 1st Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 626 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation) (See Figure 1). The site was a combination of two tax parcels (14941-000-000 & 14941-001-000) which have since been combined into one tax parcel, 14191-000-000. The site is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.250 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 3 bathrooms, with approximately 1,800 to 2,000 square feet of conditioned space and a detached garage of approximately 600 square feet. It will be a 1 story structure that will be facing NW 1st Street. The house will feature a brick foundation; horizontal siding; a fiberglass shingle roof; a stucco chimney; a 2-car detached garage with two garage doors and horizontal siding; a breezeway connecting the house with the garage featuring brick and decorative metal; an arbor located in the back yard; and a pool with pavers around it. There is a proposed arch over the door in the breezeway and the house features several gable vents.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00111 with the following conditions:

§ Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.

§ Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.

§ Notify staff of any changes during construction.

[200571_HP-20-00111_StaffRprt_20201201](#)

[200571_HP-20-00111_NewCnstrctn@626NW1stSt_StaffRprt_20210105](#)

NEW BUSINESS:

[200663.](#)

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

Petition HP-20-105. Alejandro & Camille Pauly, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 300 NE 10th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story early Ranch style house with a hipped roof form and a horizontality characteristic of the style. There is a masonry structural system with concrete blocks, a stem wall foundation with concrete block, a chimney, asphalt shingles on the roof, a shed roof for the porch, and metal casement windows. The house is a contributing structure that was built in 1948 according to the Florida Master Site File. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.340 acres in size. The house is approximately 3,414 square feet in total area, 3,365 square feet in heated area.

The proposal replaced the existing shingle roof with a new acrylic coated 26 gauge grade 80 residential panel in Galvalume from Reed's Metals. The work involved reroofing the decking to meet building code requirements, building up the flat section of the roof, replacing the drip edges, sealing all of the penetrations, installation of the underlayment, and installing the panels. The roof has already been installed. The applicants submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness application for the proposal to be heard at the December Historic Preservation Board meeting. However, the roofing company started work on the project prematurely, which prompted a stop work order from Code Enforcement. At that time some of the house was exposed to the elements and a determination was made by the Building Official to let the applicants complete the work, since at that time there was almost a

month to go before the December meeting, too much time to leave the roof open to the elements.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. In this case the low profile roof of a Ranch house further limits the view of the exposed fasteners.

RECOMMENDATION *Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-105.*

[200663_Jan2021_HP-20-105_Reroof@300NE10thAve_20210105](#)

[200662.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-114. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 1. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, just east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 1 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and

2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00114 with the following conditions:

1. *The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.*
2. *Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.*
3. *Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

[200662_HP-20-00114_NewCnstrctn@300blkNW5thAvenue_StaffReport202101](#)

[200664.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-126. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 2. This building will be a

non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 2 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00126 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

[200664_HP-20-00126_Newcnstrctn@300blkNW5thAvenue_StaffReport202101](#)

[200665.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-127. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 3. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church and on the southwest corner of NW 5th Avenue and NW 3rd Street, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 3 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place and on the east on NW 3rd Street. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the

windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00127 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

[200665_HP-20-00127_NewCnstrctn@300blkNW5thAvenue_StaffReport_2021C](#)

MEMBER COMMENT:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

[200666.](#)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness (B)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness. September2020

through December 2020.

Project Description

This is a list of staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness from September of 2020 to December of 2020.

RECOMMENDATION *Historic Preservation Board review the information.*

[200666_Staff Approvals Oct-Dec_20210105](#)

INFORMATION ITEMS:

[200667.](#)

Support the nomination of the University Evangelical Lutheran Church to the National Register of Historic Places (B)

Information Item A. National Register Nomination: University Evangelical Lutheran Church. Located at 1826 West University Avenue. University Evangelical Lutheran Church, owner.

Explanation: The property, located at 1826 West University Avenue, has been nominated for inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places by the State of Florida, Division of Historical Resources. The nomination proposal will be reviewed by the Florida National Register Review Board in a public meeting early this year. If the Review Board finds that the property meets the criteria for listing established by the National register, a formal nomination will be submitted to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington D.C., who will make the final decision.

Inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places provides recognition that the property is deemed by the federal and state governments to be significant to our history at the national, state and/or local levels.

RECOMMENDATION *Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board support the nomination of this property to the National Register of Historic Places. In addition, the HPB may provide official comments to the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation as to whether or not this property meets eligibility criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.*

[200667_UnivEvnglclLthrnChrch_20210105](#)

[200668.](#)

Support the nomination of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church to the National Register of Historic Places (B)

Information Item B. National Register Nomination: Old Mount Carmel

Baptist Church. Located at 429 NW 4th Street. Pleasant Hill Baptist Church & Mount Carmel Baptist Church, owners.

Explanation: The property, located at 429 NW 4th Street, has been nominated for inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places by the State of Florida, Division of Historical Resources. The nomination proposal will be reviewed by the Florida National Register Review Board in a public meeting early this year. If the Review Board finds that the property meets the criteria for listing established by the National register, a formal nomination will be submitted to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington D.C., who will make the final decision.

Inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places provides recognition that the property is deemed by the federal and state governments to be significant to our history at the national, state and/or local levels.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board support the nomination of this property to the National Register of Historic Places. In addition, the HPB may provide official comments to the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation as to whether or not this property meets eligibility criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

[Information Item B - OldMtCarmelBptstChrch](#)

NEXT MEETING DATE: February 2, 2021

ADJOURNMENT