

City of Gainesville

City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes - Final

January 5, 2021

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Elizabeth Hauck - Member
Michael Hill - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Michelle Hazen, Michael Hill, Danielle Masse, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hausauer, Elizabeth Hauck

Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Brittany McMullen, Andrew Persons

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion to Approve
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hill
Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

OLD BUSINESS:

[200488.](#)

RECOMMENDATION *Staff recommends that the board review the request for the proposed window replacement for Petition HP-20-101.*

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Richard Wagner, contractor spoke to the matter. Luis D. Rodrigues, one of the owners, also spoke to the matter. It was revealed that most of the proposed windows have already been installed, so the board felt there was no need for a vote.

[170343.](#)

RECOMMENDATION *Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.*

Motion to Continue
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Nesberg
Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

200481.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-90 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish and make the finding that the property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and the proposed improvements are eligible improvements.

Motion to approve the reroof and the ad valorem tax exemption part 1 application.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Hill

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

200571.

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

Petition HP-20-111. Alan G. Weinstein, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 626 NW 1st Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 626 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation) (See Figure 1). The site was a combination of two tax parcels (14941-000-000 & 14941-001-000) which have since been combined into one tax parcel, 14191-000-000. The site is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.250 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 3 bathrooms, with approximately 1,800 to 2,000 square feet of conditioned space and a detached garage of approximately 600 square feet. It will be a 1 story structure that will be facing NW 1st Street. The house will feature a brick foundation; horizontal siding; a fiberglass shingle roof; a stucco chimney; a 2-car detached garage with two garage doors and horizontal siding; a breezeway connecting the house with the garage featuring brick and decorative metal; an arbor located in the back yard; and a pool with pavers around it. There is a proposed arch over the door in the breezeway and the house features several gable vents.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00111 with the following conditions:

§ Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the

chosen window.

§ *Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.*

§ *Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Motion to approve

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by:: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

NEW BUSINESS:

[200663.](#)

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

Petition HP-20-105. Alejandro & Camille Pauly, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 300 NE 10th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story early Ranch style house with a hipped roof form and a horizontality characteristic of the style. There is a masonry structural system with concrete blocks, a stem wall foundation with concrete block, a chimney, asphalt shingles on the roof, a shed roof for the porch, and metal casement windows. The house is a contributing structure that was built in 1948 according to the Florida Master Site File. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.340 acres in size. The house is approximately 3,414 square feet in total area, 3,365 square feet in heated area.

The proposal replaced the existing shingle roof with a new acrylic coated 26 gauge grade 80 residential panel in Galvalume from Reed's Metals. The work involved renailing the decking to meet building code requirements, building up the flat section of the roof, replacing the drip edges, sealing all of the penetrations, installation of the underlayment, and installing the panels. The roof has already been installed. The applicants submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness application for the proposal to be heard at the December Historic Preservation Board meeting. However, the roofing company started work on the project prematurely, which prompted a stop work order from Code Enforcement. At that time some of the house was exposed to the elements and a determination was made by the Building Official to let the applicants complete the work, since at that time there was almost a month to go before the December meeting, too much time to leave the roof open to the elements.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of

a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. In this case the low profile roof of a Ranch house further limits the view of the exposed fasteners.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-105.

Motion to approve

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

[200662.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-114. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 1. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, just east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 1 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the

property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00114 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Motion to continue

Motion by: Member Nesberg

Seconded by: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

[200664.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-126. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 2. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 2 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00126 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the*

back of curb.

2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.

3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to continue

Motion by: Member Nesberg

Seconded by:: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

[200665.](#)

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

Petition HP-20-127. Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 3. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church and on the southwest corner of NW 5th Avenue and NW 3rd Street, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 3 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place and on the east on NW 3rd Street. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding

and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00127 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Motion to continue

Motion by: Member Nesberg

Seconded by:: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

MEMBER COMMENT:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Megan Atwater and Carolyn Webber, owners, spoke about the proposed demolition of the house at 423 NW 6th Avenue (Petition HP-20-94), which was denied at the December HPB meeting and answered questions from the board. They discussed in further detail the condition of the property and the next steps to move on. The board indicated that the pictures of the condition of the house that were in the backup do not convey the true condition of the house as they have described because they cannot see the details. They suggested that the architect write up details of the condition of the house and/or attend the next meeting to tell the board exactly what she has seen concerning the condition of the house.

Motion to Re-open Petition HP-20-94 for the demolition of a single-family dwelling at 423 NW 6th Avenue.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Hausauer

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

[200666.](#)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness (B)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness. September 2020 through December 2020.

Project Description

This is a list of staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness from September of 2020 to December of 2020.

RECOMMENDATION *Historic Preservation Board review the information.*

INFORMATION ITEMS:

[200667.](#)

Support the nomination of the University Evangelical Lutheran Church to the National Register of Historic Places (B)

Information Item A. National Register Nomination: University Evangelical Lutheran Church. Located at 1826 West University Avenue. University Evangelical Lutheran Church, owner.

RECOMMENDATION *Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board support the nomination of this property to the National Register of Historic Places. In addition, the HPB may provide official comments to the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation as to whether or not this property meets eligibility criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.*

**Motion to support the nomination of the University Evangelical Lutheran Church Complex onto the National Register of Historic Places
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Nesberg
Motion passes following a 8-0 vote**

[200668.](#)

Support the nomination of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church to the National Register of Historic Places (B)

Information Item B. National Register Nomination: Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church. Located at 429 NW 4th Street. Pleasant Hill Baptist Church & Mount Carmel Baptist Church, owners.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board support the nomination of this property to the National Register of Historic Places. In addition, the HPB may provide official comments to the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation as to whether or not this property meets eligibility criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Motion to Support the nomination of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church onto the National Register of Historic Places.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Hill

Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

NEXT MEETING DATE: February 2, 2021

ADJOURNMENT