

City of Gainesville

*City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



Minutes

October 4, 2016

5:30 PM

City Commission Auditorium

Historic Preservation Board

*Bill Warinner - Chair
Jay Reeves - Vice Chair
Michelle Hazen - Member
Ann Stacey - Member
Jason Straw - Member
Scott Daniels - Member
Brian Smith - Member*

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: March 1, 2016 through September 6, 2016 (B)

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve

Upon Vote: 5-0

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 6, 2016

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Ann Stacy

Moved To: Approve with the change to the minutes to reflect the revised status of Charlotte Lake from being removed from the board for lack of attendance to no longer being a board member because of term expiration.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Draft minutes of the September 6, 2016 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the September 6, 2016 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

OLD BUSINESS

OB1. Petition HP-16-79. City of Gainesville, owner. City of Gainesville, owner. New exterior stair, ADA accessible ramp, handrail and guardrail at Thomas Center Building B entry. Removal of existing, non-historic stair and railings. Replacement of two non-historic, metal fire doors at the western breezeway with paneled, glass and metal doors to match existing main lobby doors on Building B. Located at NE 6th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Cleary Larkin, Planner, Wendy, Thomas, Director, Department of Doing, and Sarit Sela, Project Manager, gave the staff presentation. Donald Shepard, citizen, spoke in support of the proposal. Carrie Blanchard Bush, Director of Citizen Centered Gainesville, spoke to the overall context of the proposal. Bud Reeger, architect, addressed the board concerning the building code requirements for the circles in the hand rails and the proposed plexiglass to be placed over the circles to meet the building code. John Freeland, Building Official, also spoke about options to meet this building code requirement. Staff indicated that they would come back with an informational item concerning the plexiglass detail.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Approve HP-16-79 with the recommendation for the replacement of the existing fire doors with new fire doors that have glazing and the selection of proposal #2 with the flaring stairs for the new stair and ramp design for the east entry into the Thomas Center Building B.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Demolish an Existing Accessory Structure and Construct a New Accessory Structure (B)

Petition HP-16-75. Linda Lombardino, owner. Demolish an existing accessory structure and construct a new accessory structure. Located at 560 NE 7th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION *Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-75.*

Gigi Simmons, Planning Technician, gave the staff presentation. Bud Reeger, architect, spoke to the matter.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Approved as presented during the last meeting.

Upon Vote: 6-0

NEW BUSINESS

After-the-fact COA for installation of 60” aluminum fence (B)

Petition HP-16-89. Carl Nelson, owner. After-the-fact COA for installation of 60” aluminum fence. Located at 301 NW 2nd Street. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-89 with the following conditions:

- 1. Existing fence be cut-down to meet the height of the adjacent picket fence, 40”.*

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Carl Nelson, owner, spoke to the matter and answered questions from the board. Donald Shephard also spoke to the matter.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By:.

Moved To: Deny (Motion dies for lack of a second)

Upon Vote:

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Scott Daniels

Moved To: Approve with the staff recommendation of a 40 inch height for the fence and acceptance of proposed gates for staff approval if the heights are appropriate.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Exterior rehabilitation including replacement of front door and windows and removal of chimney.(B)

Petition HP-16-91. John Cowvins, owner. Exterior rehabilitation including replacement of front door and windows and removal of chimney. Located at 411 NW 4th Street. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-91 with the following conditions:

- 1. Replacement of wood windows to be insulated, wood double-hung sash with exterior simulated divided lites with a 1” square muntin profile to match the existing. The setback of the sash within the jamb shall match the existing. Glazing shall be non-reflective with a tint no more than 10%. A 6/6, 2/2, or 1/1 lite configuration is acceptable.*

2. Approve the locations of window infill and new window installations as noted on the attached plans. The size of the new windows shall match the existing. The head and sill locations of the new windows shall match the existing.

3. Approve repair of existing door or wood door replacement with horizontal panels and smaller vision lites for security, but in dimensions to fit in existing opening. Submit an elevation drawing of the door for staff review.

4. Approve the repointing and repair of the chimney to include new roof flashing.

5. Approve the replacement of existing 2x4s with 4x4 painted wood posts. Approval of new trim and porch roofing beams is dependent upon an elevation drawings submitted for staff review.

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. John Cowvins, owner, spoke to the matter and answered questions from the board. Dotty Faibisy, chair of the Pleasant Street Neighborhood Association and member of the Pleasant Street Historic Society, spoke in support of the proposed rehabilitations. Melanie Barr, Duckpond Neighborhood Association, also spoke in support of the projects and indicated that Preston Cowvins was a member of the historic society in the 1980s and it is good that an old family is staying in the neighborhood and taking care of the houses.

Motion By: Michelle Hazen

Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve with staff recommendations including:

1. Wood windows, 6/1 or 6/6 with exterior muntins;
2. Window infill locations;
3. Allow a 36 inch front door to replace existing door with staff approval of elevation;
4. Repair and repoint the chimney with the new roof flashing; and
5. Replace the 2x4s with 4x4 painted wood posts with staff approval of submitted sketch of new trim and porch beams.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Exterior rehabilitation including replacement of front door and windows and removal of chimney (B)

Petition HP-16-92. John Cowvins, owner. Exterior rehabilitation including replacement of front door and windows and removal of chimney. Located at 415 NW 4th Street. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-92 with the following conditions:

1. Replacement of wood windows to be insulated, wood double-hung sash with exterior simulated divided lites with a 1" square muntin profile to match the existing. The setback of

the sash within the jamb shall match the existing. Glazing shall be non-reflective with a tint no more than 10%. A 6/6, 2/2, or 1/1 lite configuration is acceptable.

2. Approve the locations of window infill and new window installations as noted on the attached plans. The size of the new windows shall match the existing. The head and sill locations of the new windows shall match the existing.

3. Approve repair of existing door or wood door replacement with horizontal panels and vision lites for security, but in dimensions to fit in existing opening. Submit an elevation drawing of the door for staff review.

4. Approve the removal of the chimney. In-kind infill replacement of the wall and roof is reviewable by staff.

5. Approve the replacement of existing 2x4s with 4x4 painted wood posts. Approval of new trim and porch roofing beams is dependent upon an elevation drawings submitted for staff review.

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation, which was combined with the presentation for HP-16-91. Audience comments as noted above.

Motion By: Michelle Hazen

Seconded By: Ann Stacy

Moved To: Approve with staff recommendations including:

- 1. Wood windows, 2/2 with exterior muntins;**
- 2. Window infill locations;**
- 3. Allow a 36 inch front door to replace existing door with staff approval of elevation;**
- 4. Removal of the chimney with staff approval of infill replacement of the wall and roof; and**
- 5. Replace the 2x4s with 4x4 painted wood posts with staff approval of submitted sketch of new trim and porch beams.**

Upon Vote: 6-0

Re-roof a Single-family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

Petition HP-16-93. Howard Eckenrode, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 216 NE 6th Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-93 with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Howard Eckenrode, owner, spoke to the petition.

Motion By: Michelle Hazen

Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve with condition that the metal roof shall be a standing seam or 5V-Crimp metal roof and the finish shall be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

- 1. Petition HP-16-87. 403 SW 10th Street. In-kind roof asphalt shingle replacement. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District. Lelani Cook, Owner. Melvin Holt, Agent.
- 2. Petition HP-16-88. 111 NW 7th Avenue. Replace deteriorated wood porch flooring with Trex decking. Install white security door over existing side-rear door. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. City of Gainesville, Owner. James Southerland, Housing & Community Development, agent.
- 3. Petition HP-16-90. 630 NW 2nd Street. Install a low wood post and hanging chain barrier around the perimeter of an empty lot used for parking. The empty lot is in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Mt. Pleasant United Methodist Church, applicant.

INFORMATION ITEM:

Support the Nomination of the Devil’s Millhopper to the National Register of Historic Places (B)

Information Item A. National Register Nomination: Devil’s Millhopper Geological State Park. Located at 4732 NW 53rd Avenue/Milhopper Road. State of Florida, owner.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board support the nomination of this property to the National Register of Historic Places. In addition, the HPB may provide official comments to the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation as to whether or not this property meets eligibility criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Ann Stacy

Moved To: Support the nomination of the Devil’s Millhopper Geological State Park onto the National Register of Historic Places.

Upon Vote: 6-0

Discuss Membership into the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC) (B)

Information Item B. Discussion concerning the City of Gainesville becoming a member of the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC).

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board review and discuss the information concerning membership in the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve membership into the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC).

Upon Vote: 6-0

Discussion of the proposed windows for the new construction of a house at 423 NW 4th Avenue, Petition HP-16-50. The Certificate of Appropriateness was approved at the July 5, 2016 HPB meeting with the condition to bring the selected windows back for review.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve the window details as presented with the condition that the casing depth be 1 ½ inches.

Upon Vote: 6-0

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Chairman Warinner discussed an upcoming workshop sponsored by the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation in conjunction with the City of St. Augustine on November 15 and 16, 2016, concerning technical matters that are applicable to preservation boards. The cost is \$50 per person and the chairman is looking for support from the City of Gainesville for interested members to attend.

ADJOURNMENT

**For further information, please call 334-5022.
If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.**