

ICF FINAL REPORT (RFP No. 2005-147) CITY OF GAINESVILLE ELECTRICAL **SUPPLY NEEDS**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY AND DECISION MATRIX

Presentation to the Gainesville City Commission March 30, 2006



ENERGY SUPPLY OPTIONS EVALUATED

(\$x1.000.000)

(4×1,000,000)							
PLAN CHARACTERISTICS	PLAN						
FEAN CHARACTERISTICS	1	2	3 %	4	5		
Short Hand Label	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + Max. DSM	Maximum DSM	NGCC		
Conservation Cost- Effectiveness Test Used In Forecast	RIM	RIM	TRC	TRC	RIM		
Base Load Capacity	220 MW	220 MW	75 MW	None	240 MW		
Fuel For Base Load Unit	Coal Pet Coke Biomass	Coal Pet Coke Biomass	Biomass	Not Applicable	Natural Gas		
Installed Cost ^a (\$2003)	\$470	\$445	\$229	\$44	\$129		
Annual Fuel Cost For New Base Load Unit ^b (\$2012)	\$32/уг	\$26/yr	\$14/yr	\$0/yr	\$86/yr		

RIM- Rate Impact Measure

CFB - Circulating Fluidized Bed IGCC - Integrated Gasification Combined Cycle

STUDY PERIOD 2006-2025

Average of All Cases Studied

PLAN	PLAN					
CHARACTERISTICS	1	2	3	4	5	
Short Hand Label	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + Max. DSM	Maximum DSM	NGCC	
Additional Combustion Turbine Peaking Capacity Requirement ^a (MW)	159	141	174	249	140	
Average Annual Energy Purchases MWH per Year ^b	-98	-151	357	731	3	
Generation Revenue Requirements ^c (\$NPV x 1,000,000)	\$2,067	\$1,904	\$2,096	\$2,085	\$3,236	
Typical Residential Bill (1,000 kWh) ^d \$ per Month	\$168	\$158	\$181	\$182	\$180	

a. All options assumed 30 MW firm contractual peaking capacity. Exhibit 8-26, p. 207, ICF Report b. Negative sign indicates net sales. Exhibit 8-26, p. 207, ICF Report

ENVIRONMENTAL EMISSIONS^a AND HEALTH EFFECTS

(\$ x 1,000,000)

	Energy Supply Option					
Parameter	1	2	3	4	5	
			Small CFB	Max		
	CFB	IGCC	+ DSM	DSM	NGCC	
SO ₂	780	664	15	0	0	
NO _x	517	143	76	0	76	
Hg	< 0.01	< 0.01	< 0.01	0	0	
PM Compliance with Ambient	117	not estimated	not estimated	0	< 0.01	
Standards	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Health Effects in 2020 - New Unit						
plus Purchased Power ^b	\$5-50	\$3-30	\$2.5-25	\$2-20	not estimated	
Health Effects in 2020 - Total b	\$14-140	\$12-120	\$11-110	\$11-110	not estimated	

a, Exhibit 6-12, p. 166, ICF Report, b. Exhibit 6-17, p. 179, ICF Report, 2003 dollars in millions.

CO₂ EMISSIONS^a Cumulative Millions of Tons 2006-2025

	Energy Supply Option					
Parameter	1	2	3	4	5	
*	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + DSM	Max DSM	NGCC	
New Units + Purchased Power	45	43	29	30	44	
Total Power Region	7,567	7,565	7,559	7,563	7,566	

a. Exhibit ES-31, p. 24, ICF Report.

JOB CREATION^a

	Energy Supply Option				
Parameter	1	2	3	4	5
	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + DSM	Max DSM	NGCC
Total number of job years 2006-2025	13,192	11,986	18,288	1,500	n/a

a. Exhibit ES-35, p. 26, IFC Report.

QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE FINANCIAL RISKS^a

	Energy Supply Option					
Adverse Risk Due To:	1	2	3	4	5	
	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + DSM	Max DSM	NGCC	
Performance/Capital Cost/Financing Penalties	Low	Medium High	Medium High	Medium High	Low	
High Market Power and/or High Oil/Gas Prices	Low	Low	High	Highest	High	
Low Gas Prices	Medium	Medium	Low	Low	Low	
Range in NPV of Revenue Requirements ^b (\$ x 1,000,000)	758	720	812	952	1270	

7

RANKING FACTORS

1. Affordability	F
Lowest residential bill =	່ 5
Highest residential bill =	1
2. Environment and Health	
Lowest mid-range of \$ costs =	5
Highest mid-range of \$ costs =	1
3. Climate Protection	
Lowest carbon emissions =	5
Highest carbon emissions =	1
4. Economic Development	
Highest Job -Years =	5
Lowest Job -Years =	1
5. Price Risk Exposure	
Lowest NPV range =	5
Highest NPV range =	1

<sup>a. Exhibit ES-36, p. 28, ICF Report.
b. Exhibit 8-8, p. 195, ICF Report, and results of 18 EGEAS scenarios for NGCC</sup>

UNWEIGHTED RANKING FACTORS FOR EACH OPTION AND EACH CRITERIA

FACTOR 5 = Best 1 = Worst	CFB	IGCC	Small CFB + DSM	Max DSM	NGCC
Residential Bill -\$/Month	\$167.68	\$157.54	\$180.59	\$181.77	\$179.51
Rank	3.33	5	1.19	1	1.37
Health Effects -\$M/Year	\$22.50	\$13.50	\$11.25	\$9.00	\$9.00
Rank	1	3.67	4.33	5	5
CO _{2 (tons)}	45	43	29	30	44
Rank	1	1.5	5	4.75	1.25
Number of Job Years	13,192	11,986	18,288	1,500	11,986
Rank	3.79	3.5	5	1	3.5
Revenue Risk -NPV \$M	\$758	\$720	\$812	\$952	\$1,270
Rank	4.72	5	4.33	3.31	1

a

Decision Matrix Demonstration