

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: ADN CONSULTING, INC.

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	BROAD BASE INCLUDING A NUMBER OF PRECATA CURRENTS IS A POSITIVE
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	85	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund

EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 06-26-18

FIRM NAME: AON CONSULTING, INC.

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	20	
o Project Approach	30	20	
o Project Manager	15	12	
o Project Team	15	12	
o Project Schedule	5	3	
o Project Organization	5	3	
TOTAL	100	70	✓

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-26-18
 FIRM NAME: Boston Partners, INC.

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	GRAT DEM OF FORWARD EXPERIENCE AND EXISTING ACCOUNTS
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	85	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: BALTON PARTNERS, INC.

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	o NEW CREDENTIALS TEAM WITH FLORIDA SPECIFIC KNOWLEDGE THAT SHOWN BE HELPFUL, SEEMS TO BE A GOOD TEAM WITH QUALITY DEPTH.
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	12	
o Project Team	15	12	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	84	

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18
 FIRM NAME: BOMBERSHINE CONSULTING GROUP, LLC

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	
TOTAL	100	90	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18

FIRM NAME: BOMIESHINE CONSULTING GROUP, LLC

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	12	
o Project Team	15	13	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	85	

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH

Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund

EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: CONDUMENT HR CONSULTING, LLC

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	45	WILL COORDINATED PEOPLE ON THE TEAM BUT THE FACT THAT THEY WERE JUST PURCHASED BY A PRIVATE EQUITY FIRM DOES ARISE CONCERN
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	MORE DETAIL WOULD HAVE BEEN HELPFUL AS TO HOW A TYPICAL VALUATION WORKING COMMUNICATION TEAMWORKS
TOTAL	100	(80) ✓	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: CONQUENT HR CONSULTING, LLC

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	
o Project Approach	30	20	
o Project Manager	15	15	
o Project Team	15	10	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL			
	100	80	

NOT CURRENTLY STARTED

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18
 FIRM NAME: FOSTER AND FOSTER CONSULTING ACTUARIES, INC.

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	55	CLEAR ABILITY AS WELL AS EXPERIENCE — BREADTH OF KNOWLEDGE AND DEPTH OF TEAM BOTH VERY STRONG
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	FLORIDA KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERIENCE MEANINGFUL
TOTAL			
	100	(95)	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-27-18

FIRM NAME: FOSTER AND FOSTER CONSULTING ACTUARIES, INC.

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	30	
o Project Approach	30	28	
o Project Manager	15	15	
o Project Team	15	15	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	(98)	

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18
 FIRM NAME: SABRIEL, ROEDER, SMITH AND COMPANY

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	45	GOOD FROM THE EXPERIENCE DEED TEAM
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	
TOTAL	100	(85)	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-27-18

FIRM NAME: GABRIEL, ROEDER, SMITH AND COMPANY

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	15	
o Project Team	15	12	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	87 ✓	

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION**

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPN-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: GALLAGHER BENEFIT SERVICES, INC.

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	85	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: GAUBERT BENEFIT SERVICES, INC.

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	15	
o Project Team	15	15	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	(90) ✓	

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPen-180084-DH
Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18
 FIRM NAME: THE HOWARD E. NYHART COMPANY, INC.

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	40	
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	(75)	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund

EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-18

FIRM NAME: THE HOWARD E. NYHART COMPANY, INC.

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	20	
o Project Approach	30	20	
o Project Manager	15	10	
o Project Team	15	10	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	(70)	

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH

Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund

EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: THE SIEGAL COMPANY

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	45	MORE FROM NA SPECIFIC HAVE REASSURE NOW HAD SCORE HEURPED
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	35	
TOTAL	100	(80)	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-26-18

FIRM NAME: THE SEGM COMPANY

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	25	WEAK FLORIDA EXPERIENCE PARTIALLY OFFSET BY NATIONAL EXPERIENCE - BUT FLORIDA EXPERIENCE IS IMPORTANT AS THESE ARE A NUMBER OF ISSUES AND REBORING REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE SPECIFIC TO FLORIDA
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	12	
o Project Team	15	10	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	82	✓

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employees RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH

Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund

EVALUATOR#: 2

DATE: 6-27-18

FIRM NAME: USI CONSULTING GROUP

TECHNICAL QUALIFICATIONS (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Ability	55	50	APPEAR TO BE WELL QUANTIFIED BASED ON TEAM CREDENTIALS AS WELL AS THE FIRM'S DEPTH
o Capability of Meeting Time and Budget	45	40	
TOTAL	100	90	

WRITTEN PROPOSAL EVALUATION

PROJECT: RFP for Actuarial Services for COG General Employee RFP#: FPEN-180084-DH
 Pension Plan and COG Retiree Health Insurance Trust Fund
 EVALUATOR#: 2 DATE: 6-27-19

FIRM NAME: ASI CONSULTING GROUP

WRITTEN PROPOSAL (100 PTS)	POINT VALUE	POINTS AWARDED	COMMENTS
o Project Understanding/Experience	30	20	
o Project Approach	30	25	
o Project Manager	15	15	
o Project Team	15	12	
o Project Schedule	5	5	
o Project Organization	5	5	
TOTAL	100	82	