

City of Gainesville

*City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



Meeting Agenda

August 2, 2016

5:30 PM

City Commission Auditorium

Historic Preservation Board

*Bill Warinner - Chair
Jay Reeves - Vice Chair
Betsy Albury - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Charlotte Lake - Member
Jason Straw - Member
Ann Stacey - Member
Scott Daniels - Member*

CALL TO ORDER**ROLL CALL**[160243.](#)

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: January 5, 2016 through July 5, 2016 (B)

Explanation: City Plan Board attendance roster for Board Members to review.

[160243_HP B 6-month Attendance 2015_2016](#)

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - July 5, 2016[160236.](#)

Draft minutes of the July 5, 2016 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the July 5, 2016 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

[160236_HP B 160705 Minutes draft_20160802](#)

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD**OLD BUSINESS****NEW BUSINESS**[160227.](#)

Pleasant Street Historic District - Demolish a Single-family Dwelling at 414 NW 6th Avenue (B)

Petition HP-16-56. Robert Pratt, owner. Demolish a single-family

dwelling located at 414 NW 6th Avenue. This home is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Explanation: This project involves the demolition of the structure that is currently located at 414 NW 6th Avenue. The structure was built in 1929, according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. However, the Florida master site file for this property indicates that a house has been on this site since 1909 according to the Sanborn maps. The property is zoned RC and is approximately 0.06 acres in size. The building is a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District. The proposal is to demolish the house to allow for the future construction of a new single-family dwelling.

The structure is a one story single-family house that is approximately 608 square feet in size. There is a Florida Master Site File available for the house. The house is a bungalow that has wood horizontal siding with cornerboards. There is a one-story screened porch on the front of the house with a gable roof. The roof is a 3-V Crimp metal roof. The Florida master site file describes the significance of the house, indicating that it contributes in scale and character to the Fifth Avenue Neighborhood which has been evolving since the mid-nineteenth century. A current survey of the property indicates that a part of the home sits in the 30 foot right-of-way of NW 6th Avenue. The front entrance into the building faces east towards the side property line. The side of the house is parallel with the street frontage. Approximately 5 feet of the side of the house lies within the right-of-way.

In April of 2016, there was a Notice of Violation given to the property at 414 NW 6th Avenue because the structure was found to be a Dangerous Building as set forth in Chapter 16 of the City of Gainesville Code of Ordinances (see Exhibit 5). The remedy for the violation was repair or demolition no later than May 17, 2016. The building was not repaired or demolished by that date, thus a hearing was requested with the Special Magistrate on May 18, 2016. The public hearing before the Special Magistrate was held on June 9, 2016, where it was determined that the violations were not corrected and the property owner was guilty of violating Sec. 16-19 of the City of Gainesville Code of Ordinances. If the property is not in compliance within 90-days from the date of the signing of the Order (June 21, 2016), a daily fine of \$25.00 per day will accrue until compliance is met.

A summary report of a structural evaluation of the house by GSE Engineering & Consulting, Inc., was conducted in June of 2016. The house was unoccupied at the time of their visit to the property. They noted that the overall building envelope is in poor condition, and that most of the individual foundations were improperly designed and constructed. In order to bring the structural framing up to current Florida Building Code requirements to meet lateral wind load requirements and provide proper support for the roof and the floor, the report recommends the following:

1. *Remove all roofing and siding to re-plumb all bearing walls, inspect*

the condition of the wall and roof framing, replace all damaged and rotted framing members, and re-install roof sheathing and siding.

2. Remove all first floor sheathing to inspect the floor framing, replace all damaged and rotted framing members, to replace a majority of the foundations pads, and replace a majority of the floor sheathing with new, undamaged sheathing.

The report concludes with the opinion that the cost of repairing and replacing structural elements within the home to meet the current Building Code requirements would exceed the cost of replacing the home.

Within the City of Gainesville Land Development Code, Section 30-112(d)(6)c., indicates that the Historic Preservation Board will consider certain factors related to the issue of demolition. Those criteria are listed below:

- 1. The historic or architectural significance of the building, structure, or object;*
- 2. The importance of the building, structure, or object to the ambience of a district;*
- 3. The difficulty or impossibility of reproducing such a building, structure or object because of its design, texture, material, detail, or unique location;*
- 4. Whether the building, structure, or object is one of the last remaining examples;*
- 5. Whether there are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and what the effect for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and what the effect of those plans on the character of the surrounding area would be;*
- 6. Whether reasonable measures can be taken to save the building, structure, or object from collapse;*
- 7. Whether the building, structure, or object is capable of earning reasonable economic return on its value.*

Additionally, the Land Development Code states that a demolition decision by the Historic Preservation Board approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness in the Pleasant Street Historic District shall be guided by the significance of the property, plans for redevelopment and the condition of the building.

- 1. The significance of the property.*
- 2. Plans for redevelopment.*
- 3. Condition of the building.*

RECOMMENDATION

Staff's recommendation of approval for the petition is based on the following condition:

- 1. The permit to demolish the structure shall not be issued until the finalization of the lot split associated with this property.*

[160227 Staff report and Exhibits 1-8 20160802](#)[160239.](#)**Re-roof a Single-family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)**

Petition HP-16-61. Brian Kalt, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 105 NW 7th Terrace. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North.

Explanation: The applicant is proposing to replace the existing asphalt 3-tab shingle roof with a Gulfrib Tuff Rib Metal Roofing System from GulfCoast Supply, which will include 26 gauge, mill finished, Galvalume panels with ¾ inch ribs every nine inches. The property is located at 105 NW 7th Terrace. The contributing structure was built in 1925, according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RH-1. The building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - North.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Staff recommends approval of the application with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-61 with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish is Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

[160239 Staff report and Exhibits 1-2 20160802](#)[160228.](#)**Request a Part II Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Rehabilitation Work (B)**

Petition HP-15-40. Aner & Sarit Sela, owners. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for conversion of a room into a master bathroom in a single-family dwelling. Located at 405 NE 10th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: This is a request for an ad valorem tax exemption for a historic property located at 405 NE 10th Avenue. The contributing structure was built in 1938 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.27 acres in size. The building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Historic District. The request for an ad valorem tax exemption is a two part process: Part 1 is the pre-construction application detailing the work that will be done to qualify for the exemption; and Part 2 is the review of the work proposed

in Part 1 and the approval of the exemption.

The applicant has completed the restoration/rehabilitation approved in Part 1 - Preconstruction Application for the Historic Preservation Property Tax Exemption. The project meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation Historic Buildings and the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines.

The estimated cost of the renovation project is \$22,000.00. The applicant converted a small room attached to the master bedroom into a master bathroom. The new bathroom design would match the original designs of the existing 2.5 bathrooms in the house including black and white subway floor and wall tiles. The renovation included:

- o Installation of plumbing piping and fixtures
- o Interior paint
- o Installation of flush, straight-edged 3 inch-6 inch tiles, as well as hexagonal floor tiles, consistent with the existing pattern, using natural Carrara marble.

The Historic Preservation Board reviewed the Part 1 petition and recommended approval on August 4, 2015. Historic Preservation Board vote 8-0.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-15-40.

[160228 Staff report Exhibits 1-3 20160802](#)

[160240.](#)

Request a Part II Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Rehabilitation Work (B)

Petition HP-12-16 & HP-12-18. Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Jason and Rachel Haeseler. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitation of a single-family dwelling. Located at 306 N.E. 7th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: This is a request for an ad valorem tax exemption for a historic property located at 306 NE 7th Avenue. The contributing structure is shown on the 1928 Sanborn Map but is an earlier building and it is estimated to have been built in the 1870s. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.23 acres in size. The request for an ad valorem tax exemption is a two part process: Part 1 is the pre-construction application detailing the work that will be done to qualify for the exemption; and Part 2 is the review of the work proposed in Part 1 and the approval of the exemption. The Historic Preservation Board approved the Part 1 application on April 3, 2012.

The estimated cost of the renovations totaled \$271,281.81. The applicant has completed the renovation/rehabilitation approved in Part 1 - Preconstruction Application for the Historic Preservation Property Tax Exemption. The project meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for

Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation Historic Buildings and the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines. The renovations included both exterior and interior work. The work completed includes the following:

Interior First Floor

- *The front original rooms were to remain unchanged except for new finishes.*
- *The front West parlor will have its front original French doors restored to their original location. The walled up fireplace was reopened and rebuilt.*
- *The original fireplace and chimney that supported three fireplaces at the West of the house is structurally damaged and in a dangerous state. This will be replaced with two prefab units at the ground floor and remove the fireplace at the bedroom above. This original mantle will be placed in the downstairs replacement fireplace.*
- *The rear wing of the house consists of many additions, enclosed porches and a second floor added at a later date. Very little of the original fabric existed in this wing. The ground floor dividing walls for a kitchen and multiple bedrooms and bathrooms was removed and the space reconfigured as a kitchen and family room. The second floor framing was replaced as a part of this project.*
- *An enclosed former porch behind the east parlor was rearranged as a bath and laundry where those uses already exist.*

Interior Second Floor

- *The second floor stair hall received a new door where a replacement window eliminated the original door to the front balcony.*
- *The East bedroom was to have the closed-in closets removed and a rear bathroom rebuilt with an internal closet area. The non-functional fireplace remains.*
- *The West bedroom had the ½ bath removed and the closet restored. The fireplace in the room along with the damaged chimney was removed. A HVAC unit was installed where the fireplace existed. A closed-in closet was removed, and the sinking floor system was restored. A new door provides a connection to the rear wing.*
- *The rear wing was made structurally sound and was divided into a series of bedrooms and bathrooms removing a second floor kitchen.*

Exterior First Floor

- *There was the removal of a recent infill addition to the 1919 front porch. The low pitched hip roof of the porch was removed and a balcony floor constructed and brick piers extended to the second level with cast concrete caps. A 36" tall wood railing was installed between the piers. Areas of the brick between the piers near the ground had wood siding added to minimize the massing of the brick.*
- *Full window shutters were restored to large windows at the original front section.*

- A one-story porch off the kitchen was added at the rear wing facing the back yard.
- At the rear wing facing West two original kitchen windows will be replicated and two later short windows will be removed and siding will replace previously altered areas.

Exterior Second Floor

- At the front addition, a new central balcony door was returned to the former location of a door.
- Shutters were added to the original large double hung windows.
- At the rear wing, several of the casement windows were removed while others were shifted to accommodate bedroom and bathroom walls. Several plywood filled openings had window sashes returned.
- The rear West chimney that was replaced approximates the original with a stucco terra cotta toned finish.
- A small second floor exterior porch was added to the rear elevation above the porch addition below, which is not visible from the street.
- All roofing was replaced with Architectural grade shingles.

The Historic Preservation Board reviewed the Part 1 petition and recommended approval on April 3, 2012. Historic Preservation Board vote 7-0.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-12-18.

[160240 Staff report and Exhibits1-3 20160802](#)

160230.

Request a Part 1 Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Renovation and an Addition (B)

Petition HP-16-63 & HP-16-64. Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Mike and Michelle Jaffee. Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the interior renovation, and a guest house addition to an existing garage. Located at 621 NE 5th Terrace. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: This is a request for an ad valorem tax exemption for a historic property located at 621 NE 5th Terrace. The contributing structure was built in 1934 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.35 acres in size. The request for an ad valorem tax exemption is a two part process: Part 1 is the pre-construction application detailing the work that will be done to qualify for the exemption; and Part 2 is the review of the work proposed in Part 1 and the approval of the exemption.

The existing single-family dwelling is a California Monterey style brick, two-story structure. The project has two phases. In phase 1, the applicant is proposing to construct a new master bathroom and closet to replace the existing and reduce the master bedroom size. In phase 2, a

guest house addition to the existing garage would be constructed at the rear of the house. The size would be 400 square feet and would match the appearance of the existing garage. The single-family dwelling is a contributing structure in the Northeast Residential Historic District. The accessory garage structure is a non-contributing structure in the district.

The size of the addition is over 300 square feet, thus requiring a board approval. However, the existing garage is only visible from the driveway into the property. The proposed addition will not be readily visible when looking at the front of the house, which faces NE 5th Terrace. The addition will be at the rear of the historic building, more directly behind the mass of the building than the existing garage. The proposed HardiePlank shiplap siding will be compatible to the existing garage but will distinguish the addition from the historic principal structure. The new addition will minimize the impact on the visual character and materials of the historic structure and will be compatible in terms of mass and materials, but the character of the historic resource will be identifiable after the addition is constructed.

The addition will include a bedroom, a bathroom, and a living room /wet bar. The floor plan indicates a sink and a refrigerator in the wet bar area, which is allowed. It should be noted that the zoning for this property is RSF-3, which allows single-family dwellings by right, specifically the occupancy of a single-family dwelling by one family. A dwelling unit is a room(s) comprising the essential elements of a single housekeeping unit. Facilities for the preparation, storage and keeping of food for consumption within the premises shall cause a unit to be construed as a single dwelling unit. Each area with separate facilities for the preparation, storage and keeping of food for consumption within the premises shall be considered as a separate dwelling unit. The historic structure on the property is the one allowed dwelling unit on the site. The addition of a range, stove, or oven would categorize the addition as an area with separate facilities for the preparation, storage and keeping of food for consumption within the premises, and would then be determined to be a separate dwelling unit.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-63 & HP-16-64. Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-63 with the conditions as stated below, and approval of HP-16-64 for a "Part 1" ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and
2. The proposed improvements are eligible.

Staff's recommendation of approval for the petition is based on the following conditions:

1. The addition cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the

RSF-3 zoning district.

2. No range, stove, or oven shall be installed in the proposed addition.

[160230 Staff report and Exhibits 1-4 20160802](#)

[160231.](#)

Demolition of a Non-Contributing Accessory Structure and New Construction of an Accessory Structure (B)

Petition HP-16-66. Anthony Ackrill, owner. Demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and new construction of an accessory structure. Located at 717 NE 3rd Avenue. This building will be non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The property is located at 717 NE 3rd Avenue. The property is zoned RMF-5. The parcel (11920-000-000) is approximately .32 acres in size and is located in the Northeast Residential Historic District.

The property currently contains two structures, a c. 1928 wood frame house that is contributing to the district and a non-contributing accessory structure. The contributing structure is approximately 2,300 square feet, is located at the front on the property on NE 3rd Avenue and is not part of the application, as no work is being done to the house. The accessory structure was constructed in the 1970s and is located towards the rear of the property, about 30' behind the house. It is a one-and-a-half-story, slab-on-grade, wood frame structure with T-111 siding, aluminum multi-pane windows and shed roofs with metal roofing. It is approximately 900 square feet and is currently used as an art studio.

The Owner proposes to demolish the existing accessory structure and construct a new two-story accessory structure to function as an art studio, workshop and storage area. The building will be approximately 1,060 square feet and will use materials, forms and style that are compatible with the existing, contributing house. The building will be located in the rear southeast corner of the lot and will not be visible from NE 3rd Avenue. The building is approximately 44'x 22' with a small covered porch to function as the entry. The building will be wood frame construction with an exposed concrete block foundation, HardiePlank lap siding and trim, standing seam metal roofing and a combination of salvaged wood windows.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Staff recommends a) a waiver of the 90 day demolition delay for the non-contributing accessory structure and b) conditional approval of the COA for the new construction Petition HP-16-66, based on the condition that the applicant submits a copy of building permit application drawings for final review.

[160231 Staff report and Exhibits 1-3 20160802](#)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Petition HP-16-60. 1017 NW 2nd Street. Construct a rear screen porch addition onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Abby Hogan, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-62. 306 NE 7th Street. Remove an existing exterior stair case and replace with a new stair case onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Terry Fleming, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-65. 525 NE 9th Avenue. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Julie Knox and Craig Smith, owners. Christopher Tenney, Godwin Green Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-16-67. 542 NW 3rd Street. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Lillie Harris, owner.

INFORMATION ITEMS: N/A

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.