

City of Gainesville

City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes - Final

March 3, 2020

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Elizabeth Hauck - Member
Michael Hill - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Members present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Kyra Lucas, Danielle Masse, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hausauer, Michael Hill

Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Yvette Thomas

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion to approve the agenda
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Nesberg
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

[191087.](#)

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: September 3, 2019 Through February 4, 2020 (B)

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-4.28G. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[191088.](#)

Draft Minutes of the December 3, 2019 and February 4, 2020 Historic Preservation Board Meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the December 3, 2019 and February 4, 2020 meetings and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

Motion to approve

Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hill
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD:**OLD BUSINESS: N/A****NEW BUSINESS:**[191071.](#)**Install a roof mounted photovoltaic solar system on a principal building (B)**

Petition HP-20-00007. Selena Patterson, Power Production Management Inc., agent for Steve & Elizabeth Nichtberger. Certificate of Appropriateness to install a roof mounted photovoltaic solar system on a single-family house. Located at 550 NE 6th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The applicant is requesting approval of a 5.232kW solar photovoltaic system on the roof, with 16 SunPower SPR-E20-E-AC residential modules and 16 SunPower SPR-E20-327-E-AC micro inverters, placed on the eastern roof surface of the principal structure. The modules are the flush mount type to be installed in the same plane as the roof. Due to a mix-up with the address of the property, the building permit for this project was not flagged as a property within a historic district. As a result, the system has been constructed, but has not received final building permit approval.

The existing house is a one-story, stucco covered bungalow style house dating back to 1928. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house at 550 NE 6th Avenue represents a typical Gainesville house of the 1920's. The house has a wood frame structural system, a stucco covered chimney, a hip roof with a gable vent on the secondary roof structure, and double-hung windows. There has been exterior work done in recent years on the structure. A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a reroof from shingle to shingle was approved in April of 2018 (HP-18-41), while in June of that year COA HP-18-64 was approved for a new raised porch, two small rear additions of less than 150 square feet total, and installation of new Marvin Integrity windows.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. A rooftop solar photovoltaic power system is a system that uses one or more photovoltaic panels installed on the surface of a roof, either parallel to a sloped roof/surface or rack-mounted on a flat roof, to convert sunlight into electricity and is ten kw or less for residential structures and 300 kw or less for nonresidential structures. The subject power system has been placed on the principal structure on the property which is a single-family dwelling. The building is considered a contributing structure in the Northeast Residential Historic District.

The system is located on a primary roof facade elevation. The installation will not result in the permanent loss of significant character-defining features of a historic resource, such as existing roof lines or dormers; the installation is reversible; the system is flush to the roof or low profile, to the extent feasible; and the system blends into the surrounding features of the historic resource to the extent possible.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Alex Khokhlov of Power Production Management, agent for the owners, answered questions from the board. After discussion about placement of the solar array and what could work and be efficient, the representative wishes to invoke the solar rights act due to the concerns made by the Board with the current placement of the solar panels.

Motion to continue and refer to city legal

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

[191072.](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for two additions. (B)

Petition HP-20-8 & HP-20-22. Jay Reeves, agent for Oscar Sanchez & Lida Rodriguez-Taseff, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness and a Part 1 ad valorem tax exemption application for additions to a single-family dwelling and a roof alteration to a garage. Located at 1021 NE 4th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The site contains a one-story gable-front and wing house, built in 1948 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office and listed as a contributing structure to the Historic District. The site also contains a single-story, flat roofed, non-contributing garage with a studio that lies to the side of the principal structure. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.25 acres in size. The house has masonry bearing wall - brick shaped concrete block and is an example of the Early Ranch style. The roof has asphalt shingles over a low pitched wood structured gable roof. The interior walls are rough stucco plaster over concrete masonry unit (CMU) blocks. The doors and the primarily 3 over 1 windows are wood.

The applicant is proposing to build two additions onto the existing house. One will be on the north end of the house at the front, extending the length by approximately

15 feet. This addition will be for a den and a new kitchen. New 8 inch tall and 6 foot wide metal French doors will be installed to provide access to the court yard in the back yard. The other addition will be in the rear yard extending to the east for approximately 18 feet. This addition is for a master bathroom. Both additions will have 8 inch CMU with architectural shingle roofs that match the pitch of the existing house. The project will reuse wood windows that are displaced by the additions including windows in the back for the dining room and the second bedroom and the gable siding will be wood ship lap siding to match the existing siding on the house. The old window openings will be entryways between rooms in the historic house and the addition. A new front door will replace the existing door and the vinyl siding on the gable end of the roof will be removed in order to expose the wood underneath. In addition to the new French doors for the den/kitchen addition, two sets of metal French doors will be added to the rear of the existing structure, providing access to the court yard. The size of the den/kitchen addition is 15 feet by 29 feet or 435 square feet, while the size of the master bathroom addition is 18 feet by 13 ½ feet which is 243 square feet. The flat roofed garage with studio will have a new conventionally framed gable roof to match the house. An existing door on the north side of the garage is to be removed and infilled with CMU block.

The overall character of the house will be maintained. The new additions will be consistent with Standard 10: *“New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”*

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-20-8 for a COA with the conditions as follows:

- 1. Provide information sheets for the proposed French doors, the front door, the Carriage style roll up door, and the roofing material.*
- 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Staff recommends approval of HP-20-22 for a “Part 1” ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

- 1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and*
- 2. The proposed improvements are eligible.*

Motion to approve with staff recommendations

Motion by: Member Nesberg
Seconded by: Member Hausauer
Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

a [191076.](#)

Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a non-contributing auxiliary structure. (B)

Petition HP-20-9. Jay Reeves, agent for Tim Garren & Bart Birdsall, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to build an accessory structure for a single-family dwelling. Located at 825 NE 5th Avenue. The principal structure and the accessory building will be non-contributing structures to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing house is a one and a half-story, frame building built in the “Arts and Craft Style,” in 2007. The property has RSF-2 zoning on a lot with approximately 0.35 acres of land. The building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District. The applicant is proposing to build a 1 ½ story Arts and Craft building with a garage on the first floor and a guest quarters on the second floor. It will be a wood frame building with a 24 foot by 35 foot footprint (840 square feet), a two-car garage, stairs, an elevator, and a storage room, with a one bed, one bathroom guest unit above. There will not be a kitchen. This proposal must obtain Historic Preservation Board approval because the proposed building is over one-story in height and the square footage exceeds 400 square feet in area.

The proposed new garage and guest suite accessory structure is located behind the house near the rear sideyard of the property and it will be visible from the street. However the distance from the property line to the front of the proposed structure is approximately 108 feet, which minimizes the visual impact on the street. The new structure utilizes materials and textures consistent with the principal building such as the hardie plank siding, and the roof type and pitch are similar to the existing house. The main windows proposed on the new structure are 6/1 style, which matches the main windows on the house. The new auxiliary building will be consistent with Standard 9: *“New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”*

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The accessory building cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the RSF-2 zoning district.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and roofing material.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Motion to approve with staff recommendations with the fence alterations as discussed.

Motion by: Member Hill

Seconded by: Member Hausauer
Motion passes following 6-0 vote

[191073.](#)

Reroof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof(B)

Petition HP-20-10. Shane Smalley, Atlantic Roofing & Exteriors, agent for Barbara Watson, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 426 NW 7th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The existing house is a two-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1997. It is a 3-bedroom, 2 bathroom house with 2,376 square feet of heated space and hardie board siding. The existing gable/hip roof has 3-tab asphalt shingles. The applicant is proposing to install an Ultra rib metal roofing system in Galvalume, with 26 gauge metal panels over 15/32 “ plywood, to replace the existing grey 3-tab shingles. The project involves tearing off the existing shingles and the installation of Atlas Summit 60 underlayment. The metal roofing panels will be installed over the underlayment.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building’s overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building.

It should be noted that rib style metal roofing has not been found to be inappropriate for residential use. The house located across the street from the subject property at 425 NW 7th Avenue has a sheet metal, 3-V crimp roof. This is the historic roof surface according to the Florida Master Site File for this structure which was built in 1926 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The house at 427 NW 7th Avenue received a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for an Ultra rib Galvalume metal roof in 2016. The site file for the house at 413 NW 7th Avenue, also built in 1926, indicates a sheet metal, 3-V crimp was the historical roof surface. The non-contributing structure at 412 NW 7th Avenue is the same architectural style as the subject property and received a COA for the installation of a 26 gauge rib style metal roof. A variety of metal roof types are evident in the Pleasant Street neighborhood. The staff recommendation is that the roof finish for the proposed metal roof be Galvalume or a medium to light gray paint finish, which is consistent with the finish/color recommendation adopted by the Historic Preservation Board on April 2, 2013.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-10 with the condition that the roof finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to approve

**Motion by: Member Hausauer
Seconded by: Member Hill
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote**

[191075.](#)

Install a 6 foot tall privacy fence in the side and rear yard of a single-family dwelling (B)

Petition HP-20-14. Ryan Duffy, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to install a fence in the side and rear yard of a single-family dwelling. Located at 610 NE Boulevard. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- The portion of the fence along NE 6th Avenue can be solid for up to four feet in height and then have a more open design for the remaining two feet in height, for a total of no more than six feet in height.*
- The portion of the fence along NE 6th Avenue should be set back at least five-feet from the back of the sidewalk.*

Motion to continue

**Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hill
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote**

[170941.](#)

Re-Roof the Bailey House with a Metal Roof (B)

Petition HP-16-51. Kehua Hu, owner. Renewal of a previously approved petition to re-roof the Bailey House with a metal roof. Located at 1121 NW 6th Street. This building is individually listed on the Local and National Register of Historic Places.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-51 with the condition that the roof shall be a standing seam metal roof and that the finish is a light to medium light gray color.

Motion to approve with staff recommendations

**Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hausauer
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote**

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Petition HP-20-00011. 119 NW 7th Terrace. Roof over of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North. Haynes Shepley, owner. Brendan Hosack, R-Value Roofing & Insulation, LLC, agent.

Petition HP-20-00012. 617 E. University Avenue. Reroof a bed and breakfast facility. This building is contributing to the Southeast Residential Historic District. Stellar, LLC, owner. Barry Joye, Energy Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-20-00013. 710 NW 3rd Street. Install a 5 foot tall wood fence in the rear and side yard of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Chris Fillie, owner.

Petition HP-20-00017. 845 NE 5th Avenue. Replace four windows on single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Jennifer Anne (Rice) Bridge, owner.

Petition HP-20-00018. 404 NE 4th Avenue. Replace old wood fencing in the interior yard with new 4 foot tall wood fencing. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Richard Drummond, owner.

Petition HP-20-00019. 201 NE 8th Street. Install fencing in the front and side yard of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Kristopher & Nancy Jackson, owners.

Petition HP-20-00020. 1106 NE 5th Street. Install fencing in the side and rear yard of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Haley Marae Jackson, owner.

Petition HP-20-00021. 710 NW 4th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. David & Beverly Coburn, owners. Eric Shane Smalley, Atlantic Roofing & Exteriors, agent.

Petition HP-20-00023. 1036 NE 4th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Melvin Gregory Charleston, owner. Mike Bennett, Mac Johnson Roofing Inc., agent.

Petition HP-20-00024. 319 NE 6th Avenue. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Jay Parrish, owner. Emily Wheeler, Perry Roofing Contractors, agent.

Petition HP-20-00025. 353 NE Boulevard. Reroof a condominium dwelling unit. This building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Frederick & Bee Kates, owners. Travis Timmons, Worthmann Roofing and Construction, agent.

INFORMATION ITEM:

[191077.](#) Proposed new building in the Northeast Residential Historic District (B)

Information Item A. Proposed new office building in the Northeast Residential Historic District at 203 NE 1st Street.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the board hear the presentation and provide feedback to the applicants.

Michael Richmond, architect, Brame Heck Architects gave a presentation about the proposed building and how they want to design it to fit into the area. Chris Gmuer, Gmuer Engineering, discussed how the proposed building is less intense than what a form-based code allows.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

NEXT MEETING DATE: April 7, 2020

ADJOURNMENT

7:27 PM

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.