

Ms. Maxine Bethea  
 1331 SE 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue  
 Gainesville, FL 32601

### *Housing Rehabilitation Complaint Timeline*

In an effort to minimize the multiple meeting entries on this timeline, please note that Housing & Community Development (HCD) staff has had multiple meetings with Ms. Bethea, her brother, Pastor Joseph Lewis and his spouse in an attempt to resolve their concerns. The following timeline depicts meeting results and/or follow-up inspections in sequential order.

- August 17, 2009 - Ms. Bethea calls Mr. Murry's office to advise that she received the hand-delivered letter from Judy Raymond, HCD staff and that the scope of work does noted not include all of the work which needs to be done and that she was going to the City Commission on October 15, 2009 to register her complaint.
- August 11, 2009 - HCD Staff hand-delivered an offer to Ms. Bethea outlining the three additional repair items that the City had agreed to pay for, not to exceed \$2,965. The approved additional work to be completed was not part of the original work-write up but was approved by Mr. Fred Murry in an effort to resolve some of Ms. Bethea's concern. (See attachment # 1)
- August 5, 2009 - HCD Staff, following several attempts to secure multiple bid proposals to complete the approved rehab work for Ms. Bethea, recommended that the single bid received be accepted from Duffield Home Improvement, dated July 28, 2009.
- June 23, 2009 - Mr. Murry received a bid quote from Ms. Bethea as submitted on April 24, 2009 from Duffield Home improvement, which included more work to be completed than the original agreed upon work to be completed and paid for by the City. The total bid from Duffield and accepted by Ms. Bethea totaled \$5,730.
- June 16, 2009 - Mr. Murry prepared a letter to Ms. Bethea outlining the three repair items that the City of Gainesville had agreed to pay subject to approval of the cost and sub-contractor by the HCD Division. (See attachment 2).
- 1) Repair Item # 1: Kitchen Ceiling Repair.
  - 2) Repair Item #10: Rear handrail is per Spec, but not to Code (not graspable).
  - 3) Repair Issue # 5: Soft spot in living room at entry.

- May 11, 2009 - HCD staff meet with Mr. Murry to discuss the proposal submitted by Ms. Bethea for the City to consider. (See attachment 3) Mr. Murry instructed HCD staff to write Ms. Bethea to specific what the City was considering doing. Additionally, Ms. Bethea was requested to secure bids and submit them back to HCD staff.
- May 6, 2009 - Ms. Bethea submitted three (3) bid proposals which were inconsistent with the work write-up outlining the items that the City was considering having done for Ms. Bethea from SL Construction (\$8,160); Duffield Home Improvement (\$5,730) and Edgar Smith Construction (\$14,640).
- May 4, 2009 - Ms. Bethea presented three bid quotes to the Asst. City Manager's Office which still exceeded the proposed/approved work to be done and paid for by the City.
- April 21, 2009 - Ms. Bethea met with Mayor Pegeen Hanrahan, Mr. Fred Murry and HCD staff. Also, in attendance at this meeting were Ms. Bethea's brother, Pastor Joseph Lewis and his spouse. Ms. Bethea presented her concerns; the Mayor and staff provided some alternative suggestions and advised that the City would get back with her.
- March 3, 2009 - Mr. Murry requested Ms. Bethea, via letter, to secure bids based on the items which were specified and that the City had agreed to have addressed. Said bids were to be submitted to HCD by June 18, 2009. (See attachment # 3) Items agreed to complete were # 1, # 5 and #10.
- February 12, 2009 - HCD staff prepares a clarification to the items noted in Ms. Bethea's response to the Building Department Inspection report.
- January 29, 2009 - Ms. Bethea submitted another independent inspection report from Drops & Watts to the Assistant City Manager's Office.
- December 3, 2008 - Ms. Bethea received inspection report from the Building Inspection Department identifying items of concern.
- November 13, 2008 - Building Inspection Department conducts an inspection with Ms. Bethea and Pastor Joseph Lewis, her brother. (See attachment 4).
- October 29, 2008 - Mr. Murry sent letter to Ms. Bethea as a thank you for the September 22, 2008 visit and follow-up to her request to have an independent inspection conducted by the City's Building Inspection Department. (See attachment 5)
- September 22, 2008 - Mr. Murry, Mayor Hanrahan and other HCD staff met with Ms. Bethea at her home to review her concerns.

- June 25, 2008 - Ms. Bethea received a complete copy of her Housing Division case file.
- June 24, 2008 - Mr. Murry responds to the March 7, 2008, letter from Ms. Bethea requesting immediate repairs and corrective measures to her home. (See attachment 6)
- April 24, 2008 - Request City Attorney's opinion regarding the Bethea's complaint specifically, provide directions on the Letter of Fact response.
- April 7, 2008 - Mr. Murry notified of Ms. Bethea's & Pastor Joseph Lewis' letter of complaint, dated March 7, 2008.
- March 21, 2008 - City Attorney's office notified of Ms. Bethea's & Pastor Joseph Lewis' letter of complaint, dated March 7, 2008 and requested legal direction on how to pursue.
- March 7, 2008 - HCD Division received former letter of complaint from Ms. Bethea & Pastor Joseph Lewis (see attachment # 7).
- April 8, 2005 - Ms. Bethea informed Mr. Tom Saunders, Community Development Director, that she considered the repair issues resolved and that the only remaining item was the flooring at the front door. (See attachment # 8). The contractor completed the floor repair on May 3, 2005.
- February 22, 2005 - Joe Hoffman of Hoffman Construction and Jimmy of Innerlight Electric met with Ms. Bethea at her home to review her concerns. (see attachment # 9).
- December 1, 2004 - The 1-year warranty period on Ms. Bethea's rehab project expired.
- October 28, 2004 - Items requested to be addressed by Ms. Bethea during the warranty period:
- 1) Requested pest control service.
- This matter was addressed by the pest control company, Pest Environmental.***
- 2) Drawer slides – Kitchen.
- The Contractor addressed this item by adjusting the slide in the drawer.***

December 8, 2003 - Items requested to be addressed by Ms. Bethea during the warranty period:

- 1) Flooring at the front door not properly braced.

***The contractor addressed this item by bracing the flooring at the front door threshold.***

- 2) Exterior Siding needed tacking in various places.

***The contractor addressed this item by nailing down siding on the East elevation of the home, the only area of siding on the home that was disturbed by the contractor during the project (a portion of the East wall of the home was reframed due to termite damage).***

December 1, 2003 - Project completed. Contractor received the Certificate of Completion from the Building Department inspection for residential remodeling permit, issued August 1, 2003.

November 24, 2003 - Certificate of Abatement issued from Code Enforcement Division indicating that all code violations were found to be in compliance with the City's Housing Code Ordinance.

November 6, 2003 - Change Order # 3 - \$700 signed – adding:

- 1) Installation of one additional 3030 upper cabinet
- 2) Replace the dining room light fixture with owner selected Chandelier (allowance \$50)
- 3) Paint the body of the house as per general specifications.

October 20, 2003 - Change Order # 2 – \$975 signed – adding:

- 1) Reframe the west bathroom wall and the bathroom ceiling to allow installation of 6'6" door. Reframe east wall of rear bathroom.

September 9, 2003 - Change Order # 1 - \$4,100 signed – adding:

- 1) Reframe the rotten portions of the **east** wall south of the chimney and install 1/2" osb sheathing and #15 vapor barrier. Reinstall the aluminum siding.
- 2) Rough in plumbing for the new 32" corner shower in the half bath and install the shower stall and shower faucets and drain connection.
- 3) In conjunction with the central heat, install energy efficient central air conditioning, 10 SEER or better.
- 4) Remove all ceiling sheet rock and install 1/2" blueboard a plaster.

- August 7, 2003 - Hoffman Construction is issued a Notice to Proceed with the work on the subject property.
- August 1, 2003 - Contractor building Permit issued.
- July 21, 2003 - Ms. Bethea entered into an agreement with Hoffman Construction to complete the repair work on her home as Hoffman Construction was the low bidder. (See attachment 10)
- July 1, 2003 - Housing Division receives \$13,502 check from NHDC on behalf of Ms. Bethea.
- June 18, 2003 - The Housing Division received confirmation from NHDC that this agency would be providing Ms. Bethea a low interest loan in the amount of \$13,502 to complete the rehabilitation work on her property.
- May 2003 - The City entered into an agreement with Ms. Bethea to complete the rehab work on her property totaling \$63,525. The bid amount exceeded the City's approved limit, therefore Ms. Bethea contacted Neighborhood Housing & Development Corporation (NHDC) regarding the possibility of her securing a low-interest home improvement loan in the amount of \$13,502.
- April 16, 2003 - The Housing Division sent Ms. Bethea a letter via Certified Mail as Ms. Bethea had indicated that she did not receive the previous letter sent to regarding the status of her rehab file. (See attachment 11). The April 16, 2003 letter advises Ms. Bethea that she must own and occupy the referenced property in order to be eligible for the rehab assistance due to Ms. Bethea having provided an alternative mailing address, different from the subject property. Ms. Bethea was given additional time to respond to the decision to provide additional financing to have her property rehabbed or not. The new deadline for her to respond in writing was May 15, 2003.
- March 19, 2003 - Ms. Bethea was sent a letter informing her of the total cost to rehabilitate her property. The total project cost, including contingency would be \$61,666, thereby exceeding the City's program limit. She was provided two alternative plans and costs, which included the funding shortage. (See Attachment # 12).
- March 18, 2003 - Bid opening date – only two bids received. Hoffman Construction at \$56,060 plus \$1,215 for alternative # 1 and M.J. Koken Company at \$59,038 plus \$1,265 for alternative # 1. Alternative # was for the installation of the 2<sup>nd</sup> bathroom in the master's bedroom.
- February 18, 2003 - The bid documents were made available for contractors to go out to do an inspection and submit a bid if they were interested in doing the work.

January 23, 2003 - The Homeowner Conference was held with Ms. Bethea and her brother, Pastor Joseph Lewis, identifying all of the items listed on the work write-up which were scheduled to be repaired. Additionally, a list of the City's approved contractors eligible to submit a bid on the proposed work was provided Ms. Bethea.

January 15, 2003 - HCD staff advises Ms. Bethea & her brother, Pastor Joseph Lewis that the rehabilitation specs on the subject property were exceeding the Housing Division's program limits; further, that the additional bath may need to be eliminated. However, if there were other financial resources available, then perhaps the new bath and more could be done to rehabilitate the subject property.

December 20, 2002 - Work Write-up specs completed on the subject property. (See attachment # 13).

During this time, Housing Division staff were negotiating with Ms. Bethea to determine what the City would be able to do and things that may need to be eliminated, just really trying to reach an agreement on the work to be done, staying within program limits; conversing with Ms. Bethea's brother via long distance as he resided in another state.

June 14, 2000 - Code Enforcement Inspection code report issued identifying numerous Code violations at the Bethea home. (See attachment # 14)

During this time, Housing Division staff was attempting to determine if 1) Ms. Bethea was actually residing in the property as many correspondence sent to her were returned undeliverable 2) the property search revealed that there were multiple owners on the property and would therefore disqualify Ms. Bethea from being eligible to participate as the program requires that the owner of the property to receive assistance must be: a) sole owner and b) own and occupy the property. As a result, Ms. Bethea requested staff to keep her name on the waiting list until she could resolve the ownership of the property as well as complete relocating back to Florida.

Housing Division staff assisted Ms. Bethea with the transfer of the heir property, via Quit Claim deeds from the 12 heirs listed to give Ms. Bethea sole ownership of the property in order to assist her, resulting in the approval of her application. The file was then referred to the rehab staff to conduct a preliminary inspection of the home.

- March 25, 1999 - Ms. Bethea was notified that she may not be eligible for rehab assistance due to her not being able to verify that she was the sole owner of the property, which is a requirement of the Housing Division Program. The property search reveled that there were 12 heirs to the subject property. (See attachment 15)
- February 6, 1995 - The Housing Division received Ms. Bethea's application for homeowner Rehabilitation for her property located at 1331 SE 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue. Her name was placed on the waiting with an anticipated timeframe of 3-5 years before her name would come up for assistance.