# **City of Gainesville**

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



# **Meeting Agenda**

July 5, 2016 5:30 PM

**City Commission Auditorium** 

# **Historic Preservation Board**

Bill Warinner - Chair
Jay Reeves - Vice Chair
Betsy Albury - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Charlotte Lake - Member
Jason Straw - Member
Ann Stacey - Member
Scott Daniels - Member

Historic Preservation Board Meeting Agenda July 5, 2016

### **CALL TO ORDER**

# **ROLL CALL**

160173. Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: December 2, 2015

through June 7, 2016 (B)

Explanation: City Plan Board attendance roster for Board Members to review.

160173 HPB 6-month Attendance 2015 2016 20160705

# APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

# **APPROVAL OF MINUTES - JUNE 7, 2016**

160158. Draft minutes of the June 7, 2016 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation

Board review the draft minutes from the June 7, 2016 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review

and approve the draft minutes.

160158\_HPB 160607 Minutes draft\_20160705

# REQUEST O ADDRESS THE BOARD

# **OLD BUSINESS:**

Petition HP-16-39. Ricardo Cavallino, agent for Reid Fogler/ WNC1114 LLC. Construction of a three-story apartment building. Located at 517 SW 12th Street. This building will be non-contributing to the University Heights Historic District – South.

Petition HP-16-46. Ricardo Cavallino, agent for Reid Fogler/ WNC1114 LLC. Construction of a three-story apartment building. Located at 1025, 1021, & 1015 SW 5th Avenue. This building will be non-contributing to the University Heights Historic District - South.

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

160172.

Replacement of Wood Windows with Aluminum Clad Frame Windows **(B)** 

Petition HP-16-49. James Bowman, owner. Replacement of 17 windows with new windows on existing single-family dwelling. Located at 419 NW 4th Avenue. This home is contributing to the Pleasant Street District.

Explanation: The applicant is proposing to replace 17 of the home's original wood windows with aluminum clad wood frame, Pella 850 Architect Series.

The proposed exterior rehabilitation also includes:

- Repair or replace wood window screens and;
- Replace all rotten window trim in-kind.

The property is located at 419 NW 4th Avenue. The contributing structure was built in 1930, according to the Alachua County Property Appraiser's office (parcel 14500-000-000). The property is zoned RC and is approximately 1,954 square feet in size. The building is a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-49 with the condition that the window replacements are made out of wood and match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration, and reflective qualities of the glass.

160172 Staff report and Exhibits 1-3 20160705

160163.

Pleasant Street Historic District - Construct a new single-family structure at 423 NW 4th Avenue (B)

Petition HP-16-50. Kurt Strauss, owner. New construction of a single-family dwelling. Located at 423 NW 4th Avenue. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Explanation: The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. It will be 1,776 square feet of conditioned space plus 336 square feet of covered porch for a total of 2,112 square feet. It will be a two-story structure, with proposed architectural details intended to complement existing architecture in the area.

The property is located at 423 NW 4th Avenue. The property is zoned RC and is approximately 0.11 acres in size. The property is currently vacant; the previous structure on the property was a contributing structure in the Pleasant Street Historic District that was declared a dangerous building in early 2015, and was demolished in April, 2016. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure in the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The new construction will include fiber cement siding, trim, soffit and fascia. The house will have a pilaster pier foundation; brick wrapped front columns and an architectural style asphalt shingle roof. The exterior doors are to be wood, with a Craftsman Style front door and a 16 light rear door. The windows are proposed to be vinyl double hung, vinyl single hung and vinyl casements.

The staff recommendation is based on the City of Gainesville, Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines - Demolition, Auxiliary Structures, and Design Guidelines for New Construction: Northeast, Southeast, & Pleasant Street Historic Districts, as well as the provisions of the RC zoning district.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff's recommendation of approval for the petition is based on the following condition(s):

- 1. Windows used shall be wood or wood-clad windows; and.
- 2. If the proposed vinyl windows are acceptable they should have a muntin and mullion profile that is both on the inside and outside of the glass.

160163 Staff report and Exhibits 1 -4 20160705

# 160165.

Re-roof the Bailey House with a metal roof (B)

Petition HP-16-51. Kehua Hu, owner. Re-roof the Bailey House with a metal roof and replace the handicap accessibility ramp. Located at 1121 NW 6th Street. This building is individually listed on the Local and National Register of Historic Places.

Explanation: The applicant is proposing to replace the existing 25-30 year old shingle roof with a standing seam or other sheet metal roofing system. The proposed metal roof is the same type as the metal roofs on three other buildings on the property. The proposed color for the metal roof is "Light Stone," which would match the color of the metal roofs on the three other buildings as well. Included within this petition is the replacement of the handicap accessibility ramp that is located at the back of the house. The ramp will be made out of pressure treated deck wood.

> The property is located at 1121 NW 6th Street. The Bailey House is a contributing structure that is one of the oldest houses in Gainesville, with construction beginning in 1848, according to the Florida Master Site File

for the property. The building was built in 1854, according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office, and is individually listed on the Local and National Register of Historic Places. The property is zoned PD, Planned Development. The Bailey House is not located within a historic district. At the time the nomination form for the National Register was completed (May 1958), the roofing was sheet metal. The survey form noted that alterations on the house included the replacement of the shingle roof with tin.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building.

Staff recommends approval of the petition based on the condition that the roof be a standing seam or 5-V Crimp metal roof.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-51 with the condition that the roof be a standing seam or 5-V Crimp metal roof.

160165 Staff report and Exhibits 1-3 20160705

# 160171.

# Replacement of Aluminum Windows with Vinyl Windows (B)

Petition HP-16-52. Boysie Ramdial, agent for Adele Franson. Replacement of 4 aluminum windows with vinyl windows. Located at 1104 NE 5th Terrace. This home is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The Applicant is proposing to replace four of the home's remaining awning aluminum windows with vinyl double-pane insulated windows in a white color. The proposed windows are manufactured by Simonton Windows and will be of the following types/styles: vinyl double-hung; vinyl double-hung with Transom and vinyl fixed window.

> The property is located at 1104 NE 5th Terrace. The contributing structure was built in 1954 according to the Alachua County Property Appraiser's office. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 1,808 feet in size. The building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-52 with the condition that the new windows match the original in size, general muntin/mullion configuration, and reflective qualities

160171 Staff report and Exhibits 1-5 20160705

160167.

City of Gainesville

Northeast Residential Historic District - Rehabilitate a Former Restaurant at 418 East University Avenue (B)

Petition HP-16-54 & HP-16-57. Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for the Matheson Museum. Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the renovation, restoration, reroof, and addition of a new terrace with front porch at vacant restaurant building. Located at 418 East University Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The applicant is proposing to renovate, restore, reroof, and add a new terrace with front porch at the vacant restaurant building at 418 E. University Avenue. The project will also relocate the side exit doors. The building is a contributing structure in the Northeast Residential Historic District. The contributing building was built in 1935 according to the Property Appraisers Office. The Mission Revival style masonry building was built as a church, and later became an antique store and then a restaurant. The property is zoned CCD (Central City District) and is approximately 0.14 acres in size.

> The proposed changes include a complete interior renovation involving the removal of the less historic restaurant interiors and the kitchen. The interior has multi-level floors that will be restored to the original flat floor configuration. All of the wood flooring will be replaced. There will be a restoration of the interior plaster walls and the replacement of ceilings and lighting. The project will restore the original windows and doors and remove the stained glass, which was introduced in the 1980's. The rear and side exit doors will be replaced with metal panel doors. The original front doors will be replicated; one pair of doors is damaged while the other set of doors is missing. The side exit door on the west elevation is to be relocated to the next window bay to the south. The old door opening will become a window while the new door location is an existing window opening. The existing asphalt roof will be replaced with a Gerard stone coated metal roof. Although this involves a reroof proposal from shingle to metal, the proposed roof type will have the design of a traditional roof instead of the look of the typical metal roof. The exterior brick walls of the building will be cleaned.

> A new terrace/front porch will be added to the front elevation of the building, facing East University Avenue. This will provide Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) access with a slopped sidewalk to be installed on the west side of the new terrace. It will also meet step landing requirements. A 42 inch high black powder coated aluminum guardrail will be placed around the terrace.

> The staff recommendation is based on the City of Gainesville, Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines - Additions to Existing Buildings, Roof and Roof Surface, and Windows, Shutters & Awnings.

> > Printed on 6/29/16 at 10:35 am

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-54, and approval of HP-16-57 for a "Part 1" ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

- 1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and
- 2. The proposed improvements are eligible.

160167 Staff report and Exhibits 1-4 20160705

160169.

Re-roof a Single-family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

Petition HP-16-58. Hahyung Dan, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 1108 NW 3rd Avenue. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North.

Explanation: The applicant is proposing to replace the existing shingle roof with a 5V Crimp metal roof composed of 26 or 29 gauge Galvalume panels (3 feet wide). The property is located at 1108 NW 3rd Avenue. The contributing structure was built in 1946, according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RMF-5. The building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District -North.

> Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Staff recommends approval of the petition based on the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-58 with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

160169 Staff report and Exhibits 1 -2 20160705

# Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Petition HP-16-47. 1221 NE 3rd Street. Construct a pool enclosure addition to a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Jack E. Davis / Sonya Rudenstine, owners and agent.

Petition HP-16-53. 725 NE 6th Street. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Pamela Robb, owner. W. Keith Perry, Perry Roofing Contractors, agent.

Petition HP-16-55. 719 SE 2nd Avenue. Reroof a garage. This building is contributing to the Southeast Historic District. Jay Moseley, owner. Tony Johnson, Johnson & Johnson Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-16-58. 1212 NE 4th Street. Repair a front porch on a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Patricia Wolfe, owner and agent.

#### **Information Items:**

- A. Update of Pleasant Street projects
- B. Demolition by neglect

# **BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

### **ADJOURNMENT**

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.