# **City of Gainesville**

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Meeting Agenda

September 6, 2016

5:30 PM

**City Commission Auditorium** 

# **Historic Preservation Board**

Bill Warinner - Chair Jay Reeves - Vice Chair Betsy Albury - Member Michelle Hazen - Member Charlotte Lake - Member Jason Straw - Member Ann Stacey - Member Scott Daniels - Member

## CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

<u>160340.</u>

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: February 2, 2016 through August 2, 2016 (B)

Explanation: City Plan Board attendance roster for Board Members to review.

160340 HPB 6-month Attendance 2015 2016

### APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

#### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES - August 2, 2016**

<u>160339.</u>

Draft minutes of the August 2, 2016 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the August 2, 2016 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

<u>160339\_HPB 160802 Minutes draft\_20160906</u>

### **REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD**

OLD BUSINESS

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

<u>160324</u>.

Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Part 1 for Demolition of a Non-Contributing Accessory Structure and New Construction of an Accessory Structure (B) Petition HP-16-82. Anthony Ackrill, owner. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Part 1 for demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and new construction of an accessory structure. Located at 717 NE 3rd Avenue. This building will be non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

*Explanation:* The Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and new construction of a non-contributing accessory structure was approved by the Historic Preservation Board at the August 2, 2016 board meeting under Petition HP-16-66. The applicant is now applying for Part 1 of the Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the project.

**RECOMMENDATION** Staff recommends approval of the Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Part 1.

160324 Staff report and Exhibits 1 - 3 20160906

160325.Setback Modification and New Construction of Footings, Foundation And<br/>Structural Framing for a Single-Family Dwelling (B)

Petition HP-16-73. Eastwood Holdings I, LLC, owner. New construction of footings, foundation and structural framing for a single-family dwelling. Setback modification request for front and rear. Located at 625 NW 3rd Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

*Explanation:* The property is located at 625 NW 3rd Street and is zoned RC. The parcel (14385-000-000) is currently undergoing an application for a lot split (AD-15-00082). The existing parcel is .20 acres but will be split into two lots, Parcel A (on the corner of NW 7th Ave. and NW 3rd St.) and Parcel B (south of Parcel A). Both parcels will be approx. 4,211 sf; this application is only for Parcel B. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The applicant is requesting to build a house facing NW 3rd Street, with side setbacks of 18', a rear setback of 13'-11" (proposed modification), and a front setback of 11'-0" (proposed modification). The new house will be a 1 1/2 story "gable-front-and-wing" building form of Vernacular design to complement existing architecture in the historic district. The house will be approximately 1,890 square feet, including two small, inset corner porches on the front and back of the house. A driveway will be located on the north side of the house.

**RECOMMENDATION** Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-73 with the following conditions:

1. All approvals are based upon the active lot split application AD-15-00082, currently noted by the Technical Review Committee as "approvable with conditions". If the lot split is revised in any way affecting the dimensions of the two parcels as shown in the AD application, the applicant shall return to the HPB Board

2. Approve the Application for Modification Existing Zoning Requirements requesting a modification of the front setback from 17.5' to 11' and a rear setback modification from 20' to 13'-11". A signed and notarized application has not been submitted by applicant. If the application is different from this approval, the applicant shall return to the HPB Board.

3. COA approval for only the foundation plan layout for the house as meeting the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines for new construction. Staff cannot recommend framing approval as of this time.

4. Applicant will return for a separate COA for exterior materials and enclosures, including but not limited to windows, doors, siding and roofing.

160325 Staff report and Exhibits 1-7 20160906

<u>160335.</u>	Demolish an Existing Accessory Structure and Construct a New Accessory Structure (B)
	Petition HP-16-75. Linda Lombardino, owner. Demolish an existing accessory structure and construct a new accessory structure. Located at 560 NE 7th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
	<i>Explanation:</i> The property is located at 560 NE 7th Avenue. The principal building was built in 1930 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RSF3 and is approximately 1,943 total square feet in size. The principal building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Historic District, while the new accessory structure will be considered a non-contributing structure to the district.
	<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-75
	160335 Staff report and Exhibits 1-5 20160906
<u>160326.</u>	<b>Re-Roof a Single-Family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)</b>
	Petition HP-16-80. Robert Pearce, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 927 NW 3rd Avenue. This building

is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North.

*Explanation:* The applicant is proposing to replace the existing shingle roof with GulfRib metal panels. The product is a 26 gauge GulfRib panel over 1 x 4 wood purlins over 15/32 plywood. The property is located at 927 NW 3rd Avenue. The contributing structure was built in 1930, according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers Office. The property is zoned RH-1. This building contributes in scale and character to the Fifth Avenue neighborhood. The building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - North.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Staff recommends approval of the petition based on the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

**RECOMMENDATION** 

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-80 with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

160326 Staff report and Exhibits 1-3 20160906

<u>160336.</u>

New Exterior Stair, ADA Accessible Ramp, Handrail and Guardrail at Thomas Center Building B Entry. Removal of Existing, Non-Historic Stair And Railings. Replacement of Two Non-Historic, Metal Fire Doors at the Western Breezeway with Paneled, Glass and Metal Doors to Match Existing Main Lobby Doors on Building B (B)

Petition HP-16-79. City of Gainesville, owner. New exterior stair, ADA accessible ramp, handrail and guardrail at Thomas Center Building B entry. Removal of existing, non-historic stair and railings. Replacement of two non-historic, metal fire doors at the western breezeway with paneled, glass and metal doors to match existing main lobby doors on Building B. Located at NE 6th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

*Explanation:* The property is located at 306 NE 6th Avenue and is zoned PS (Public Services). The parcel (12588-000-000) is approximately 6 acres in size and is lo acated in the Northeast Residential Historic District. This project is part of the City's "Citizen-Centered Gainesville" initiative and is the first phrase of a larger project to make Thomas Center B more welcoming and accessible to both the public and city government users. Whereas Building A and the gardens are the "community icon" of the Thomas Center, Building B is disconnected from the larger campus, with the existing entry located at the original "rear" of the building, a separate disability entry between Buildings A and B and no straightforward

access to the gardens or Building A. The construction of this new stair and ramp and the replacement of the existing fire doors will be the first step in making Building B a welcoming, well-connected hub, with universal access and public use for the city as well as citizens.

The existing ramp was constructed between Buildings A and B in the 1970s and does not contribute to the historic significance of the complex. The existing ramp is too steep to meet current accessibility code requirements. The existing stairs were added onto the west façade of Building B in the 1970s in order to provide a main entry to the building's first floor and basement level. The existing ramps will remain intact during this phase of construction. The existing stairs and stucco piers will be removed from the front of the Building B entry. The landing and basement level entry will remain.

The project proposes to install a new exterior stair, ADA accessible ramp, handrails and guardrails. Proposed materials will match the existing. The two existing fire doors at the west breezeway of the Turtle Courtyard are non-historic, solid metal doors with no glazing or "vision lites" in them. The project proposes to replace the existing doors with new metal fire doors that have multi-pane "vision lites." The doors will match the existing doors to the lobby entries at Building B and will have the added benefit of providing visibility from inside the stair wells out to the breezeway.

**RECOMMENDATION** Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-79.

160336 Staff report and Exhibits 1-5 20160906

Northeast Residential Historic District - Add A Porch at 1020 NE 3rd Street.

Petition HP-16-78. Ryan and Michelle Nall, owner. Addition of 186 s.f. front porch, including relocation and reuse of historic scalloped trim from existing entry. Located at 1020 NE 3rd Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

*Explanation:* The applicant is proposing to add a 186 square foot porch to an existing two-story single-family dwelling at 1020 NE 3rd Street. The contributing building was built in 1941 according to the Florida Master Site File. The property is zoned RSF-3 and is approximately 0.35 acres in size. The house is approximately 2,469 square feet in size. The property has right-of-way frontage on NE 3rd Street, with the front entrance of the house facing directly onto the street.

The house is a two-story Colonial Revival structure with aluminum siding. The foundation is continuous and made of brick. There is a flush gabled door hood with two centered arch and paired double hung sash 3/1 wood windows with blinds. The project is to construct a front porch onto the main facade of the house. The materials will match the existing materials including the brick, the siding, the overhang details and the

160337.

colors. The existing front entry gable has a type of scalloped detail that will be removed and relocated to the front of the porch. The gable proportions and details will match the existing structure. The new porch will have a shingled roof to match the existing shingle roof of the house. New brick for the foundation of the porch will match the existing brick. The porch will have four 10 inch wide square columns with an 8 inch base and cap. There will be a new painted wood railing with 1x pickets with 4 inch gaps top at 36 inches, secured to columns. New lap siding on the side of the porch roof will match the existing siding of the house. The proposed size of the front porch is 186 square feet, including six feet, 8 inches of depth and 28 feet of width. The proposed width will enclose the existing front door and the adjacent paired 3/1 windows on either side of the door.

As stated in the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines, new additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The proposed work is differentiated from the original historic structure and is compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property. Adding the porch will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The porch will serve as the main entrance to the building and is a transitional space between the interior and exterior. The porch will be a high profile, highly distinct feature of the house. The proposed work is reversible in that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property would be unimpaired.

The staff recommendation is based on the City of Gainesville, Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines - Entries, Porches and Balconies.

Fiscal Note: None

**RECOMMENDATION** Staff to Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-78 with condition: 1. The materials on the porch will match the existing building materials of the structure and will include painting to match the existing paint color of the existing siding.

160337 Staff report and Exhibits 1-3 20160906

## STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

1. Petition HP-16-69. 630 NE 8th Avenue. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Irvin and Lori Nachman, owners. Jason McFall, McFall Builders, Inc., agent.

2. Petition HP-16-72. 1108 NE 5th Street. In-kind replacement of wood siding on gable ends of a single-family house. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Stephen Robson, owner. Richard Pernini, Good Guys at Total Services, agent.

3. Petition HP-16-77. 619 N.E. 6th Avenue. Infill of existing garage door opening with CMU and two windows, both to match the existing house. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Carla Mavian, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture, LLC, agent.

4. Petition HP-16-84. 1104 NE 5th Terrace. Replace 2 existing windows with new vinyl windows on an existing single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Adele Franson, owner. Boysie Ramdial, The Home Depot at Home Services, Inc., agent.

5. Petition HP-16-83. 722 E. University Avenue. Re-roof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. J.W. Barnes, owner. Tom Whitton, Whitton Roofing Co., agent.

6. Petition HP-16-85. 311 NE 1st Street. Re-roof an office building. This building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. 309 LLC, owner. Mac Johnson Roofing Inc., agent.

7. Petition HP-16-86. 1200 NE 4th Street. Partial re-roof of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Curtis Cooper, owner. Tom Whitton, Whitton Roofing Co., agent.

INFORMATION ITEMS: A. Gigi Simmons: Update on Mr. Harris' new roof project.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

ADJOURNMENT