City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Meeting Agenda

November 6, 2018 5:30 PM

City Commission Auditorium

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair
Scott Daniels - Vice Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Eric Neiberger - Member
Jordan Brown - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Jason Diven - Member
Eric W. Barkhurst - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

180506. Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: May 1, 2018 through

October 2, 2018 (B)

Explanation: Historic Preservation Board attendance roster for Board Members to

review.

180506 HPB 6-month Attendance 2018 20181106.pdf

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-4.28G. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - OCTOBER 2, 2018

<u>180507.</u> Draft minutes of the October 2, 2018 Historic Preservation Board

meeting (B)

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation

Board review the draft minutes from the October 2, 2018 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review

and approve the draft minutes.

180507 HPB 181002 Agenda Minutes draft 20181106.pdf

OLD BUSINESS: NONE

NEW BUSINESS:

180518. Add an Addition to a Single-family Dwelling with a Part 1 Ad Valorem

Tax Exemption Application (B)

Petition HP-18-92. Jay Reeves & Associates, Inc., agent for Anita Smith Anantharam. Certificate of Appropriateness and an Ad Valorem Tax Exemption Part 1 review for the renovation with an addition to a single-family house. Located at 600 NE 9th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The existing property is a Mediterranean style house built in the late 1920's - early 1930's period, constructed of terra cotta blocks finished with stucco with a wood raised floor system and terra cotta clay barrel tile roofing. Portions of the roof are flat with a parapet. The main section of the house is 2-stories, with 3 bedrooms and 2 bathrooms. The property which is approximately 0.22 acres in size is located on the northeast corner of NE 9th Avenue and NE 6th Street. The house has a NE 9th Avenue address and the front door does face the avenue, but this is the narrow end of the house and the main mass of the house is more prominent on NE 6th Avenue. The building originally had a garage with an open breezeway connected to the north side of house which was later enclosed in the 1960's. The enclosure had interior rooms with low height and built at grade which has led to flooding issues. The enclosed garage is too small for the typical vehicle of today and currently serves as the laundry room.

> The proposed project will demolish the north side one-story section of the house and be replaced with a 2-story addition of 1,360 square feet with a 360 square foot rear porch. The building materials for the addition will be CMU with stucco to match the existing house and with a raised slab to match the existing slab. The addition will include a large single-car garage with storage; an enlarged kitchen, a new staircase, a laundry room and a powder room. On the second floor will be the new master suite with a west facing open porch. The revised connection between the addition and the house will be set back to form a service entry courtyard. Work will also include replacing some existing aluminum awning windows on the south and east elevations. The new windows are to match the existing replacement windows that are approximately 3 years old and match the appearance of the original. The windows used are to match the existing windows (vinyl) and the doors will be a Craftsman style wood door to match the original exterior doors with small vertical glass panes at the top of the door. The new garage door will be a wood carriage style door with matching hardware. The existing barrel tile roof is showing signs of failure. The applicants believe that the cost of replacement with an exact match is too expensive and not economically feasible relative to the cost of the addition and renovations. The proposed roofing is the Gerard Barrel Vault metal tile roof that simulates the look and profile of a terra cotta barrel vault roof.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. Provide product information or cut-sheets about the proposed windows, doors, and the chosen roof material.

2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Staff recommends approval of the ad valorem tax exemption application and finds that the property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure.

180518 Staff Report w Exhibit 1 - Exhibit 5 20181106.pdf

180510.

Re-Roof a Single-Family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

Petition HP-18-106. Tracy Cantley, Tracy Cantley & Company, Inc., agent for Marian Keesling. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 716 NE 6th Street. This building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The existing house is a one-story, concrete block house, which is currently designated as a non-contributing structure within the Northeast Residential Historic District. It is a simple Ranch-style building with 6/6 double hung windows and decorative iron porch supports indicative of dwellings constructed immediately before and after the Second World War. The existing roof is a side gable roof with a 3 tab asphalt shingle roof system that has reached it full life potential. Records of the structure indicate that the original roof was metal. One layer of shingles was inspected and no asbestos was found.

> The project involves the complete reroof of the house with the installation of a 26 gauge standing seam steel metal roof with 16 inch panels in Galvalume or Nevada silver color. It would be a 2,400 square feet gable roof system. There will be replacement of rotted novelty siding with concrete hardy board.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5v crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-18-106 with the condition that the finish shall be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

180510 StaffReport w Exhibit 1 - Exhibit 3 20181106.pdf

180519.

Construct a Wall, Add Awnings and Rebuild the Garage for a Single-Family Dwelling (B)

Petition HP-18-107. Doug Nesbit, Atlantic Design & Construction, agent for Joyce E. Bono. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct masonry walls on the east and north property lines with a fence on the northeast corner, add awnings on the front and rear, and reconstruct a freestanding garage for an existing single-family dwelling. Located at 719 NE 5th Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast **Residential Historic District.**

Explanation: The existing structure is the Lewis House, a one-story single family house with a flat roof and parapet on concrete block stucco walls, located at 719 NE 5th Street. There is a chimney located on the exterior front elevation with a tile cap and stucco covering. Ornamental exterior features include a porched head door and doorway and a car portal. The c. 1926 house is a Mediterranean Revival house of approximately 1,473 square feet that represents a typical Gainesville dwelling of the 1920's. The contributing garage structure in the southeast corner of the property was damaged by a fallen oak tree during Hurricane Irma in 2017. The previous owner received a Certificate of Appropriateness in May of 2018 for a partial demolition of the garage, including all of the roof, and the south and west walls. There was preservation of an archway between the garage and the house and the north and east walls were lowered to waist height.

> The proposed project includes the addition of masonry walls on the north and east property lines, including a wood fence adjacent to a large tree at the northeast property corner. Both the wall and fence will be 8 feet in height. The reconstruction of the freestanding garage will occur on the southeast corner of the lot with a request to modify the south and east side setback. The project includes the installation of a metal bracket to support a tile roof awning over the front entrance area. Also on the front elevation will be the installation of a fabric awning to be placed over the front window. There will also be a metal awning installed on the rear elevation of the house.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide wall and fence information including elevations.
- 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

180519 Staff Report w Exhibit 1 - Exhibit 6 20181106.pdf

180511.

Construct a New Single-Family Dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

Petition HP-18-108. Chris Fillie, Green Building Cooperative, agent for Alexander Boswell-Ebersole. Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a single-family house. Located in the 700 block of NW 4th Street. This building will be non-contributing to the Pleasant Street **Historic District.**

Explanation: The property is located in the 700 block of NW 4th Street on the east side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation). The parcel (14388-003-000) is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 5,548 square feet in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

> The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence, a shotgun Craftsman style bungalow. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 2 bathrooms, with approximately 1,288 square feet of conditioned space, a 123 square foot front porch, and a 64 square foot rear porch. It will be a 1-story structure that faces NW 4th Street. The house will feature 3/1 and some smaller 2/1 double-hung vinyl windows, listed as the Silver Line by Andersen V3 series. The exterior doors will be Therma-Tru Exterior doors. The house will have a stem wall foundation which will be plastered and vented; Hardie board and batten siding with Azek or Hardie trim details; and a Galvalume 5V-Crimp metal roof.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-18-108 with the following conditions:

- 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Lights grille for the chosen 2x1 and 3x1 grille patterns.
- 2. Revise the elevations to indicate a metal roof is to be installed.
- 3. Provide information sheets for the proposed metal roof system.
- 4. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

180511 Staff Report w Exhibit 1 - Exhibit 3 20181106.pdf

180512.

Re-Roof a Single-Family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

Petition HP-18-109. Clayton L. Crosier, Crosier & Son Roofing Inc., agent for Clifton A. Nelson, III. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 1200 NE 5th Terrace. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential **Historic District.**

Explanation: The existing house is a one-story, gable-front and wing house, which embodies the simple horizontal designs of the early Ranch style architecture. The Ranch style is characterized by a strongly horizontal profile of the roofline and the arrangement of the house toward the front of the lot which can partially enclose a larger private yard and patio in the

back. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house at 1200 NE 5th Terrace retains its essential form and integrity. The existing roof is cross-gabled with asphalt shingles and a low slope that has rolled roofing.

On the sloped roof the work will include removing the existing eaves drip and pipe flashings and the installation of 1x4 purlins over existing shingles. There will be installation of a 26 gauge eave drip metal and valley metal and installation of 5V galvalume metal panels using hex head woodfast screws. The low sloped roof will be removed along with the edge metal and pipe flashings. The work involves the nail off of the existing plywood roof sheathing per code; installation of an 84 pound self-adhering base sheet; and application of a 97 pound self-adhering granular cap sheet with replacement of the old material with the same material that is currently on the low sloped roof.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5v crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-18-109 with the condition that the roof shall be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish shall be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

180512 Staff Report w Exhibit 1 - Exhibit 4 20181106.pdf

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Petition HP-18-110. 530 NE 3rd Street. Partial reroof of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Nicholas Armfield, owner. Clayton L. Crosier, Crosier & Son Roofing, Inc., agent.

Petition HP-18-111. 608 NE 5th Avenue. Reroof of the front porch of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Giovanna Holbrook, owner. Jay Reeves, agent.

Petition HP-18-112. 1104 NE 3rd Street. Installation of a pool for a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Jason Hessler-Smith, owner. Dennis Ondrako, Hyperion Pools, LLC, agent.

Petition HP-18-113. 20 NE 8th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Breins World LLC, owner. Geraldine Hruda, Energy Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-18-114. 115 NW 7th Terrace. Re-roof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North. John Kraft and Bonnie Kraft, owners.

Petition HP-18-115. 405 NE 8th Avenue. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Brian and Susannah Peddie, owners. Geraldine Hruda, Energy Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-18-116. 110 NW 9th Terrace. Re-roof a multiple-family dwelling. This building is non-contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North. Newell Fox, owner. Tyler Turner, TMT Roofing LLC, agent.

Petition HP-18-117. 130 NW 9th Terrace. Re-roof a multiple-family dwelling. This building is non-contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North. Newell Fox, owner. Tyler Turner, TMT Roofing LLC, agent.

Petition HP-18-118. 627 SE 2nd Place. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Southeast Residential Historic District. Monta Burt, owner. Johnson & Johnson Roofing, agent.

INFORMATION ITEM: NONE

BOARD MEMBER COMMENT:

NEXT MEETING DATE: DECEMBER 4, 2018

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.