

City of Gainesville

*City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



Meeting Agenda

October 1, 2019

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

*Jay Reeves - Chair
Scott Daniels - Vice Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Eric W. Barkhurst - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison*

CALL TO ORDER**ROLL CALL**[190452.](#)

**Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: March 5, 2019
Through October 1, 2019 (B)**

Explanation: Historic Preservation Board attendance roster for Board Members to review.

[HPB 6-month Attendance 2019_20191001](#)

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**[190453.](#)

Draft Minutes of the August 6, 2019 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the August 6, 2019 meeting and vote to approve the minute.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minute.

[190328 HPBAugust2019 Minutes draft 20191001](#)

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD**OLD BUSINESS**[190207.](#)

Northeast Residential Historic District. Request to Enclose 2nd Floor Screen Porch with Vinyl Slider Windows (B)

Petition HP-19-63. The Home Depot, agent for Judith Coffey Russell Life Estate, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing screen on the second floor porch with three windows on a single-family house. Located at 516 NE 4th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The existing house is a two-story, Colonial Revival house dating back to the early 1920's, with architectural details such as narrow weatherboard siding, a hip roof with a cross gable secondary roof structure, a brick chimney, a foundation of brick piers, double hung 1 over 1 windows and a

composition shingle roof. The porch has masonry plinths and paneled columns. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house represents a typical Gainesville dwelling of the 1920's, appearing on the Sanborn Map of 1922. The project involves the existing screen porch on the second floor of the house. The existing screen framing is white and the screen is clear. The house has wood framed walls and headers. The existing wood frame knee wall and the existing abutting frame wall are to remain.

The applicant is proposing to install 3 windows into the existing wood frame openings to create a Category II sunroom of 98 square feet (14 x 7). The windows will be the Simonton/Ply Gem 6500 Series, 5500 Reflections vinyl 3 panel horizontal slider windows. The proposed windows have white vinyl frames and the glass is clear, with no grids. The series features a deeply beveled miter-cut sash to create the classic look of wood. ProSolar Low E glass with Argon gas or ProSolar Shade Low E and triple pane options are available. The 3-lite design features two operable sashes at both ends of a fixed center window.

Staff finds that proposed alteration of the second story porch into a sunroom does generally meet the guidelines. Transparent materials such as clear glass enclosures will maintain the visual openness of the porch. The porch is on the second floor of the house and on a less visible secondary elevation. The distinctive lattice material will be removed but this feature can be easily replicated and put back in the future. However, the subject property is a contributing structure within the Northeast Residential Historic District, and the Historic Preservation Board has clearly indicated that the preservation of the historic features of the structures is paramount. Although the project is on a less visible secondary elevation, the new windows to be added are not proposed to utilize the same material as the nearest historic windows. The board can approve windows not of the same material on a case-by-case basis.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the board hear the request for vinyl windows to be allowed due to the location of the proposed sliding glass windows on a less visible secondary elevation.

[190207_HP-19-63_Staff Report_20191001](#)

NEW BUSINESS

[190454.](#)

Election of a Chair and Vice-Chair for Historic Preservation Board.

Election of Officers. Historic Preservation Board elections for the upcoming 2019-2020 fiscal year.

Project Description

Historic Preservation Board shall annually elect officers to serve for a

one year term at the pleasure of the Board, or until a successor shall take office, and the officers shall be eligible for reelection. Nomination of officers shall be made from the floor at a meeting in October of each year prior to the expiration of the term of the Chair and Vice-Chair, and the elections shall follow immediately thereafter.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends proceed with the election of a Chair and Vice-Chair.

[190455.](#)

Replace Aluminum Windows With Vinyl Windows On a Single-Family Dwelling(B)

Petition HP-19-68. Jeff Feller & Amy Ladendorf, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 15 existing windows with new windows on a single-family house. Located at 1015 NE 5th Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 1015 NE 5th Street. The contributing structure was built in 1946, according to the Alachua County Property Appraiser's office. The property is zoned RSF 3 and is approximately 1,787 square feet in size. The building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

The existing house is a one-story, gable-front and wing Ranch style house dating back to the mid to late 1940s, with architectural details such as picture windows with double hung sashes with horizontal instead of vertical rails. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house at 1015 NE 5th Street retains its essential form and integrity. The house has a masonry structural system, stem wall foundation, brick exterior fabric, a brick chimney, lapped siding and scalloped detailing on the gable ends, and three paned awning windows on either side of the entry with paired awning windows on the south side of the house and on the gable wing. The existing windows are aluminum and awning windows and are not original windows to the structure.

The applicant is proposing to replace 15 existing aluminum windows with new replacement windows, size for size, featuring Window World 4000 Series double-hung vinyl windows. The color of the replacements would be white to match the existing window color. All windows will fit existing openings.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-19-68 with the condition that new windows match the original in size, general muntin/mullion configuration, and reflective

qualities.

[190455_HP-19-68_StaffRpt_20191001](#)

190456.

Construct Two Duplexes With a Shared Wall on the Property Line (B)

Petition HP-19-00070. Elliot Larkin, Larkin Rentals II LLC, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of two duplexes with an application for modification of the front setback and the first floor building height. Located at 516 NW 1st Street. These buildings will be non-contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 516 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of DT (Downtown). The parcel (14188-000-000) is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.2 acres in size. The lot is currently vacant after the recent demolition of two single-family structures. The property is currently in the lot split process of creating two lots, each one with dimensions of 41.5 feet by 100 feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating four dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a 2-story duplex on each of the newly created lots. The DT zoning district is a transect zone which allows side setbacks of 0 feet, meaning the building wall can be placed on the side property line. The proposed two duplexes will share a fire rated exterior wall to be placed on the property line. The duplexes will be 2x4 frame construction with a stem wall and slab. The siding will be HardiePlank lap siding for the first floor level and HardiePanel vertical siding for the second floor level. Each of the four total units will be 3 bedrooms and 3 bathrooms. Each duplex will have approximately 3,082 square feet under roof, with 1,269 square feet of conditioned space on each floor, 228 square feet of porch area on the first floor including the laundry, and 316 square feet of balconies on the second floor including the laundry and air conditioning. There will be a hip roof with 30 year architectural shingles. The windows are to be Silver Line by Andersen V3 series, double-hung with simulated divided lights, in dark bronze. The exterior doors will be Simpson Bellaire 7598 or equivalent. A gravel driveway on the northern half of "Parcel A" and the southern half of "Parcel B", where they extend into the backyard of the two parcels. Each parcel has an existing curb cut and a sidewalk will have to be installed along NW 1st Street.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (east) setback. The required front yard setback in the DT zoning district is 15 - 20 feet. The request is for a front setback of 13 feet, 6 inches. The other request for administrative modification is for the minimum first floor height for a residential building, which is 12 feet in the DT zoning district. The request is for a 10 foot minimum first floor height which is more compatible with the

neighboring residences in the area, such as the duplex directly south of the subject property, which appears to have a ceiling height of approximately 8 feet, and the houses west and south of the property which appear to have first floor heights of under 10 feet.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-19-00070 with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (east) yard setback from 15 feet minimum to 13 feet, 6 inches and the administrative modification for the minimum first floor height of 10 feet instead of the required 12 feet in the DT zoning district.*
- 2. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the chosen 6x1 grille pattern.*
- 3. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and the architectural shingle roof system.*
- 4. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

190456_HP-19-70_Staff Report_20191001

[190466.](#)

University Heights Historic District - South. Demolition of a Residential Structure. (B)

Petition HP-19-00071. Barnett Chenault, SVM Architects, agent for Gregory Stetz, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a residential structure. Located at 1006 SW 1st Avenue. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to Petitions HP-19-00072 and HP-19-00073.

Project Description

The existing house is two-story, wood-frame construction structure on brick piers, with wood-lapped siding, gable asphalt shingle roof, 2 over 2 windows, a brick chimney on the north side of the house, and Craftsman detailing. The square footage of the building is 1,256. The structure is located on the edge of the University Heights Historic District - South. The house is a contributing structure to the historic district and was built in 1926 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers office.

The proposal is to demolish the structure to allow space for a new multiple-family residential building. The current condition of the house involves renovation work that was done without permits. Electrical and plumbing work was done poorly and there was improper removal of bearing walls that is affecting the structural stability of the house. There is termite damage and rot that has contributed to the structural instability, leading to a wall in the center of the building that is bowing

under pressure. There are some issues with floor instability and windows have fallen out which has led to plant growth on the inside of the structure.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-19-00071 with the following condition:

- 1. The owner/developer recycles salvageable material from the structure, to the extent feasible, for re-use elsewhere on the development site.*

[190466_HP-19-71_StaffReport_20191001](#)

[190457.](#)

University Heights Historic District South - Relocation of a Two-Story Structure. (B)

Petition HP-19-73. Barnett Chenault, SVM Architects, agent for Gregory Stetz, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of a two-story single-family house within the existing property. Located at 1004 SW 1st Avenue. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to Petitions HP-19-71 and HP-19-72.

Explanation: The existing house is two-story, wood-frame construction structure on brick piers, with wood-lapped siding on the lower half of the house, and wood shake siding on the upper half, with an asphalt shingle roof with truncated gables, 2 over 2 and 3 over 1 windows, a brick chimney on the north side of the house, and Craftsman detailing. The square footage of the building is 2,873. The structure is located on the edge of the University Heights Historic District - South. The house is a contributing structure to the historic district and was built in 1917 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers office. The property is zoned Urban 5 and is approximately 0.13 acres in size.

The proposal is to relocate the home to the southern portion of its current lot. No changes are to be made to the structure exterior. Once the new foundation is complete the house will be reinforced with I-beams below the floor at key structural points, lifted, and set on a new set of piers. The movement of the house will allow for more space for the proposed multiple-family development that would be built on the combined development site of 1004 and 1006 SW 1st Avenue.

The staff recommendation is based on the City of Gainesville, Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines - Relocation.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to Historic Preservation Board - Approve

[190457_HP-19-73_StaffRprt_20191001](#)

190458.

Construct a New Single-Family Dwelling with Request to Modify the Rear

Setback (B)

Petition HP-19-76. Andrew Coffey, Eastwood Holdings I, LLC. Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a single-family house with an application for modification of the rear and south side yard setbacks. Located at 631 NW 3rd Street. This building will be non-contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The subject property is located on the southeast corner of NW 3rd Street and NW 7th Avenue at 631 NW 3rd Street. The parcel (14385-000-000) is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.20 acres in size, with a zoning designation of RC. The southern half of the tax parcel (Parcel "B"), currently has a recently built single-family dwelling unit, which received a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) in August 2018 as Petition HP-18-00068. The proposed single-family dwelling will be built on Parcel "A" of the tax parcel, and will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 2 bathrooms, with approximately 1,493 square feet of conditioned space, a 133 square foot front porch, and a 108 square foot rear porch. It will be a 1-story structure that will be facing NW 3rd Street. The house will feature 1/1 double-hung vinyl windows, the Silver Line by Andersen V3 series. There will also be 4 fixed windows on the house. The exterior doors will be Therma-Tru Fiber-Classic and Smooth-Star fiberglass doors. The house will have a block stem wall foundation and the porch will be built on a masonry pier and beam foundation. The proposed siding for the house includes cementitious lap siding with cementitious trim. The roof will be composed of architectural shingles.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-19-76 with the following conditions:

- 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulate Divided Light grilles for the chosen 1x1 grille pattern.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed roofing material.*
- 3. The HPB concurrently approve the Application for Administrative Modification reducing the rear (east) yard setback from 20 feet to no less than 4 feet and the south side yard setback from 5 feet to no less than 3 feet.*
- 4. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

190458_HP-19-76_Staff Report_20191001

190459.

Certificate of Appropriateness, Administrative Modification & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Non-Contributing Accessory Structure. (B)

Petition HP-19-78 & HP-19-81. Jay Reeves, agent for Mike and Michelle Jaffee. Certificate of Appropriateness & ad valorem tax exemption for the demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and the construction of a guesthouse for a single-family dwelling with an application for modification of a side and the rear setback. Located at 621 NE 5th Terrace. This building will be non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The applicant came before the board in August of 2016 (HP-16-63/64) for COA/ Pt 1 tax application of the project, which at that time proposed two phases: Phase 1, a new master bathroom and closet to replace the existing and reduce the master bedroom size in the main house and Phase 2, a guest house addition of approximately 400 square feet to the existing garage. The addition required no zoning modification. The COA and Part 1 tax application were approved.

The applicants came back to the board in December of 2016 for a revised project (HP-16-107 & HP-16-108) that did not include work on the main house but did propose demolition of the existing garage and replacement with a small guest house and carport. The proposed guest house was approximately 425 square feet, about the same square footage as the previously approved proposal. Both the carport and new guest house were of compatible architectural design, with brick, Hardi-plank, and Marvin Integrity windows. The applicant requested a rear zoning setback modification from the required 7.5' to 3'. The revised COA and Part 1 tax application were approved.

Currently, the applicant is proposing to build a detached accessory structure to be placed in approximately the same location as the existing structure, except it will be 2 feet off the north property line. The rear setback for most of the building will be 6 feet except for a 7 foot long closet which will be 4 feet, 6 inches off the rear property line. The size of the accessory structure is 506 square feet of conditioned space, with a 4 foot by 6 foot front porch that will face the house. At the north end of the proposed structure is an optional car port that is open on 3 sides, with an area of approximately 200 square feet.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-19-78 for a COA and Administrative Modification with the conditions follows:

- 1. The addition cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the RSF-3 zoning district.*
- 2. No range, stove, or oven shall be installed in the proposed addition.*

Staff recommends approval of HP-19-81 for a "Part 1" ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

1. *The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and*
2. *The proposed improvements are eligible.*

190459_HP-19-78&HP-19-81_Staff Report_20191001

[190460.](#)

Construct an Addition in the Footprint of the Existing Carport (B)

Petition HP-19-00082. Kurt Strauss, Kurt Strauss Homes, agent for David Menet & Amanda Bliss. Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a studio addition built on the footprint of the existing carport behind the existing garage and a new deck, with an application for modification of a side setback. Located at 1026 NE 3rd Street. The garage building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing house is a one-story, cross gabled masonry structure with a brick veneer exterior in the “Minimal Traditional,” style. The house has a stem wall foundation; a brick chimney; a main entrance side entry with a four paneled door with lights; a tripartite picture window with shutters on the gable wing on the east elevation; paired 1 over 1 double hung windows with shutters; two sets of paired windows on the south elevation; and a bulls eye window on the south elevation. Exterior ornamentation includes a cornice return on the gable wing and a balustrade on the roof. The house features a porte cochere and a detached garage. According to the Florida site file for this house (8AL03449), the dwelling retains its essential form and integrity.

The applicant is proposing to selectively demolish the existing car port and use some of the material for a pergola if possible. The pergola would be installed over a proposed new deck that is to be constructed between the carport / proposed studio and the existing pool deck adjacent to the pool which lies south of the carport. The deck is to be constructed with Trex composite decking. The carport is located behind the detached garage and consists of structural steel pipe columns, w-shape girders and joists, and a composite panel roof with built up roofing. A new studio is to be constructed on the footprint of the existing carport, with materials to match the existing house and garage. The approximate size of the addition is 412 square feet. A covered porch will be on the west side of the studio. The addition will have a brick facade with two paired windows. The roof will consist of asphalt shingles to match the existing shingles on the garage and the house with soffits to match the existing garage structure. Sliding glass doors will provide access from the studio to the new deck.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the north

side setback. The RSF-3 zoning district requires a 7.5 foot side setback for principal and accessory structures while the proposal is requesting a 3 foot setback for a portion of the proposed studio addition adjacent to the property at 1030 NE 3rd Street and a 7 foot setback for a portion of the building adjacent to the property at 1037 NE 2nd Street.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The addition cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the RSF-3 zoning district.*
- 2. No range, stove, or oven shall be installed in the accessory building.*
- 3. The HPB concurrently approve the Application for Administrative Modification reducing the north side yard setback from 7.5 feet to 3 feet adjacent to the property at 1030 NE 3rd Street and from 7.5 feet to 7 feet adjacent to the property at 1037 NE 2nd Street.*
- 4. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and roofing material.*
- 5. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

[190460_HP-19-82_Staff Report_20191001](#)

190461.

Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for an Addition.
(B)

Petition HP-19-84 & HP-19-89. Jay Reeves, agent for Brooke & Nicholas Armfield. Certificate of Appropriateness and a Part 1 ad valorem tax exemption application for construction of a one-story addition to a single-family dwelling with an application for modification of the rear setback. Located at 530 NE 3rd Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing house is a one and a half-story, wood frame Craftsman Bungalow house with wood shingle siding, a brick pier foundation, a hip roof with asbestos composition shingles, a secondary roof structure with a hip dormer and a cross gable, two brick chimneys, and both double hung 1/1 wood windows and several multi-pane wood windows. The house has a porch-wood shingle balustrade and paneled columns. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house represents a typical Gainesville dwelling of the 1920's. The structure appears on the 1928 Sanborn map.

The applicant is proposing to add a one-story addition of approximately 630 square feet to the rear of the house, including a master bedroom suite and a

covered porch area. There will also be some minor renovations done to accommodate the addition. The addition will include a master bedroom, an on-suite master bathroom, a closet for the master bedroom that was formerly a bedroom, another new closet for an existing bedroom made out of the former bedroom, and a covered porch. Access to the porch will be provided by two pairs of wooded French doors. Two wooden double hung windows from the existing west elevation will be moved to the south side of the proposed master bedroom. The existing old bathroom windows will be relocated to the new bathroom on the west elevation. An old transom will be reused as a fixed glass window on the north elevation of the new bathroom. The proposed exterior siding for the addition is to match the existing wood shingle siding. New roofing for the addition will be architectural style asphalt shingles and not a match to the existing asbestos composition shingles on the existing structure.

The proposed new master bedroom addition and covered porch are to be located at the rear of the house and will not be visible from the street. The view of the house from NW 3rd Street will be unchanged. The project will reuse the windows that will be removed to add the addition, thus protecting architectural details and features. The proposed materials for the addition are to match the materials on the historic house. The addition features a lower roofline than the historic building and will use architectural shingles on the addition, which will distinguish it from the historic structure with its original asbestos shingles. The overall character of the house will be maintained. The new addition will be consistent with Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-19-84 for a COA with the conditions as follows:

- 1. Provide information sheets for the proposed roofing material and the French doors.*
- 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Staff recommends approval of HP-19-89 for a "Part 1" ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

- 1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and*
- 2. The proposed improvements are eligible.*

190461_HP-19-84 & HP-19-89_StaffRprt_20191001

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPEOPRIATENESS:

Petition HP-19-00069. 612 NW 3rd Street. Install shed in the back yard of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Thomas Storey, owner. Mindy Higgins, Tuff Shed Inc., agent.

Petition HP-19-00074. 200 NE 9th Street. Replace 3 exterior doors on a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Teresa C. Myhre, owner.

Petition HP-19-00075. 630 NE 10th Avenue. Reroof of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Michael Frommer, owner.

Petition HP-19-00077. 612 NW 4th Street. Replace existing wood windows with wood-clad windows, replace non-contributing aluminum panel windows with vinyl windows and replace doors. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Joshua Blackford, Turnsole Builders LLC, agent. Winston Bradley, owner.

Petition HP-19-00079. 116 NE 3rd Avenue. Reroof of an office building. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Sharon L. Chase & John R. Nettles, owners. Duffield Home Improvement, agent.

Petition HP-19-00080. 609 NE 7th Avenue. Reroof of a single-family dwelling. This building is non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Bosshardt & Bosshardt & Bosshardt, owners. Shane Smalley, Atlantic Roofing & Exteriors, agent.

Petition HP-19-00083. 422 NW 2nd Avenue. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. John Whitener, owner. Emily Wheeler, Perry Roofing Contractors, agent.

Petition HP-19-00085. 617 East University Avenue. Partial reroof of a bed and breakfast establishment. This building is contributing to the Southeast Residential Historic District. Stellar LLC, owner. Barry Joye, Energy Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-19-00086. 720 NE Boulevard. Partial reroof of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Robin & Jennifer Hoon, owners. Lance E. Lunger, R & R Construction, Inc. agent.

Petition HP-19-00088. 439 NE 9th Avenue. Reroof of a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Diane Benton, owner. Christopher Tenney, Godwin Green Roofing, agent.

INFORMATION ITEM: N/A

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

NEXT MEETING DATE: Novemeber 5, 2019

ADJOURNMENT