

City of Gainesville

*City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



Meeting Agenda

December 3, 2019

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

*Jay Reeves - Chair
Scott Daniels - Vice Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Eric W. Barkhurst - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison*

CALL TO ORDER**ROLL CALL**[190697.](#)

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: May 5, 2019 Through Decemeber 3, 2019 (B)

Explanation: Historic Preservation Board attendance roster for Board Members to review.

[190697_HP6-month Attendance 2019_20190903](#)

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-4.28G. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES[190698.](#)

Draft Minutes of the November 5, 2019 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the November 5, 2019 meeting and vote to approve the minute.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minute.

[190698_HP6 November2019 Minutes draft_20191203](#)

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD**OLD BUSINESS:**[190207.](#)

Northeast Residential Historic District. Request to Enclose 2nd Floor Screen Porch with Vinyl Slider Windows (B)

Petition HP-19-63. The Home Depot, agent for Judith Coffey Russell Life Estate, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing screen on the second floor porch with three windows on a single-family house. Located at 516 NE 4th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Explanation: The existing house is a two-story, Colonial Revival house dating back to the early 1920's, with architectural details such as narrow weatherboard siding, a hip roof with a cross gable secondary roof structure, a brick chimney, a foundation of brick piers, double hung 1 over 1 windows and a composition shingle roof. The porch has masonry plinths and paneled columns. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house represents a typical Gainesville dwelling of the 1920's, appearing on the Sanborn Map of 1922. The project involves the existing screen porch on the second floor of the house. The existing screen framing is white and the screen is clear. The house has wood framed walls and headers. The existing wood frame knee wall and the existing abutting frame wall are to remain.

The applicant is proposing to install 3 windows into the existing wood frame openings to create a Category II sunroom of 98 square feet (14 x 7). The windows will be the Simonton/Ply Gem 6500 Series, 5500 Reflections vinyl 3 panel horizontal slider windows. The proposed windows have white vinyl frames and the glass is clear, with no grids. The series features a deeply beveled miter-cut sash to create the classic look of wood. ProSolar Low E glass with Argon gas or ProSolar Shade Low E and triple pane options are available. The 3-lite design features two operable sashes at both ends of a fixed center window.

Staff finds that proposed alteration of the second story porch into a sunroom does generally meet the guidelines. Transparent materials such as clear glass enclosures will maintain the visual openness of the porch. The porch is on the second floor of the house and on a less visible secondary elevation. The distinctive lattice material will be removed but this feature can be easily replicated and put back in the future. However, the subject property is a contributing structure within the Northeast Residential Historic District, and the Historic Preservation Board has clearly indicated that the preservation of the historic features of the structures is paramount. Although the project is on a less visible secondary elevation, the new windows to be added are not proposed to utilize the same material as the nearest historic windows. The board can approve windows not of the same material on a case-by-case basis.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the board hear the request for vinyl windows to be allowed due to the location of the proposed sliding glass windows on a less visible secondary elevation.

[190207_HP-19-63_Staff Report_20191001](#)

NEW BUSINESS:

[190695.](#)**Certificate of Appropriateness & Administrative Modification & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for an Addition. (B)**

Petition HP-19-97 & HP-19-104. Gordon Clemans, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness & ad valorem tax exemption for the construction of an addition to a single-family house with an application for modification of the south side building setback line. Located at 635 NE 10th Place. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing house is a one-story Early Ranch style masonry structure with concrete block, a slab on grade foundation, vinyl windows largely installed around the year 2000, a side gable roof with asphalt shingles and a brick chimney. It is a 3 bedroom, 1 bath house with approximately 1,000 square feet of floor area, with a heated and cooled porch on the east side and a finished screened porch on the back or south elevation. According to the Florida Master Site File, the house is built in the Ranch-style made evident by its rectangular form. The subdivision is typical of American suburban development during the World War Two era. The Sanborn Maps indicate the dwelling was constructed between 1941 and 1963. The dwelling retains its essential form and integrity.

The applicant is proposing to add a 636 square foot addition with a 36 square foot porch slab onto the rear of the house. The impact on the historic structure will be minimal since one non-egress window will be converted to the doorway into the addition. The addition will match the existing house with the simple Florida vernacular style and architectural elements including wood frame construction, slab on grade foundation, Hardieplank siding, architectural asphalt shingles for the roofing material, and vinyl American Craftsman brand windows to match existing.

The proposed new bathroom addition is located on the south side of the house and will not be highly visible from the street, with six feet of the end of the addition to be visible from the street. The addition is located at the rear of the building and it is smaller in size in relationship to the historic building. It is one-story in height and the peak height is intended to match the existing roof peak height of the historic house. The new windows are to be 1/1 single-hung, vinyl windows that match the existing 1/1 windows on the house, as well as fixed and slider windows. The proposed materials for the addition are consistent with the materials on the principal building. The overall character of the house will be maintained. The new addition will be consistent with Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction

shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.” The proposed size of the addition is over 300 square feet, meaning that in conjunction with the other review criteria, Historic Preservation Board approval is required for this application.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-19-97 for a COA with the conditions as follows:

- 1. The HPB approve the Application for Administrative Modification reducing the rear yard setback from 15 feet to 12 feet.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and roofing material.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Staff recommends approval of HP-19-104 for a “Part 1” ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

- 1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and*
- 2. The proposed improvements are eligible.*

[HP-19-97 & HP-19-104_635NE10thPL_StaffRprt](#)

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Petition HP-19-00098. 215 NE 3rd Street. Reroof a multiple-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Anna Kirkpatrick, owner. Robert Tracy, Bobby’s Roofing of the Florida Keys, Inc., agent.

Petition HP-19-00099. 1114 NE 7th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Ronald Bates, owner. Daryle Flesher, Custom Roofing and Coatings, agent.

Petition HP-19-00100. 200 NE 9th Street. Replacement of a deteriorated garden door with a compatible door on a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Teresa Myhre, owner.

INFORMATION ITEM:

[190696.](#)

Masonic Lodge #41: Local Register of Historic Places Nomination Process (B)

Explanation: On November 7, 2019, the City Commission directed Staff to register the Masonic Lodge #41, located on 215 N Main Street, on the Local Register of Historic Places. The building has been on the National Register of Historic Places since 1998.

This presentation is to introduce the Masonic Lodge #41 building to the Board, and discuss the nomination process, and proposed next steps.

Fiscal Note: None.

RECOMMENDATION

1) *Hear staff presentation.*

Backup:

1. *Masonic Lodge #41 Drawing Set, surveyed by University of Florida, Office of Archeology and Historic Preservation. Library of Congress, Survey No. FL 368. 1997.*
2. *Application packet to the National Register of Historic Places, dated 1998*
3. *Universal improvements feasibility study & cost estimate for the Gainesville Masonic Lodge #41, dated June 2019, by Jay Reeves & Associates, Inc. and Joyner Construction Partners, LLC*
4. *Memo to the Commission, dated November 18, 2019*
5. *Staff Presentation*

[190696A Masonic Lodge-Survey UF Library of Congress 20191203](#)

[190696B National Register of Historic Places Registration Form_AL00488_201](#)

[190696C Masonic Report Reeves June 2019 20191203](#)

[190696D Memo Masonic Lodge 20191203](#)

[190696E PPT Masonic Lodge Update HPB 20191203](#)

MEMBER COMMENT

NEXT MEETING DATE: January 7, 2020

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.