City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes

August 2, 2016 5:30 PM

City Commission Auditorium

Historic Preservation Board

Bill Warinner - Chair Jay Reeves - Vice Chair Betsy Albury - Member Michelle Hazen - Member Charlotte Lake - Member Jason Straw - Member Ann Stacey - Member Scott Daniels - Member

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: January 5, 2016 through July 5, 2016 (B)

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve Upon Vote 5-0

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - July 5, 2016

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Approve Upon Vote: 5-0

Draft minutes of the July 5, 2016 Historic Preservation Board meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board

review the draft minutes from the July 5, 2016 meeting and

vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and

approve the draft minutes.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Approve Upon Vote: 5-0

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

Bud Reeger, architect, discussed a proposal for constructing an accessory

structure mother-in-law suite at 560 NE 7th Avenue, and received guidance and comments from the board.

Lendel Lanier, Florida Concrete Recycling, Inc. explained requesting a waiver of several 90-day demolition delays.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay for the structures at 1934 NW 1st Avenue, 109 NW 20th Street, 115 NW 20th Street, and 1935/1937 NW 2nd Avenue.

Upon Vote:5-0

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay at 1035 SE 4th Street.

Upon Vote:5-0

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Waiver the remaining days on the 90-day demolition delay at 1105

W. University Avenue.

Upon Vote:5-0

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

Pleasant Street Historic District - Demolish a Single-family Dwelling at 414 NW 6th Avenue (B)

<u>Petition HP-16-56.</u> Robert Pratt, owner. Demolish a single-family dwelling located at 414 NW 6th Avenue. This home is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff's recommendation of approval for the petition is based on the following condition:

1. The permit to demolish the structure shall not be issued until the finalization of the lot split associated with this property.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Robert Pratt, owner, spoke to the matter and answered questions from the board. He answered questions about the proposed lot split and the placement of the new lot line in relation to the house. The board discussed the fact that part of the house is in the NW 6th Avenue right-of-way. Melanie Barr spoke to the matter to indicate this would be a loss of an African-American house in Pleasant Street, the first predominantly African-American historic district in Florida. Brian Kalt, who was in attendance for another item, spoke in favor of the demolition.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Approve demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way and based on the conditions of the building.

Upon Vote: 3-2 (Reeves, Warinner, & Stacy yay; Straw & Hazen nay; motion not adopted because a COA needs an affirmative vote of at least 4 members if 5 members are voting).

Motion By: Michelle Hazen Seconded By: Jason Straw

Moved To: Amend the motion to approve the demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way and based on the conditions of the building, by adding a provision that the properties that are part of the lot split be divided in a 50/50 split.

Upon Vote: 4-1 (nay: Straw)

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Straw

Moved To: Approve demolition based on the conditions, based on the physical aspects of the location of the building on the property in city right-of-way, based on the conditions of the building, and based on the condition that the properties that are part of the lot split be divided in a 50/50 split.

Upon Vote: 4-1

Re-roof a Single-family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-16-61.</u> Brian Kalt, owner. Re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 105 NW 7th Terrace. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-61 with the condition that the roof be standing seam or 5V Crimp and that the finish is Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Laura Kalt and Brian Kalt, owners, spoke to the petition. They proposed installing a Gulfrib Tuff Rib metal roofing system. They mentioned two houses located to the east of their property had recently had Gulfrib style metal roofs installed. Mr. Simmons indicated that there was apparently no COA for either of those reroof projects, and the board indicated that the matter should be further investigated.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Ann Stacy

Moved To: Approve with staff conditions that the roof be a standing seam or a 5-V Crimp metal roof and that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Upon Vote: 5-0

Request a Part II Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Rehabilitation Work

(B)

<u>Petition HP-15-40.</u> Aner & Sarit Sela, owners. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for conversion of a room into a master bathroom in a single-family dwelling. Located at 405 NE 10th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION Historic Preservation Board to City Commission - The City

Commission approve Petition HP-15-40. Historic

Preservation Board vote 5-0.

Staff to City Commission - The City Commission approve

Petition HP-15-40.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition

HP-15-40.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Sarit Sela, owner, spoke to the petition and answered a question from the board.

Motion By: Jay Reeves, Jr. Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Approve Upon Vote: 5-0

Request a Part II Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for rehabilitation work (B)

<u>Petition HP-12-16 & HP-12-18</u>. Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Jason and Rachel Haeseler. Part 2. Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the rehabilitation of a single-family dwelling. Located at 306 N.E. 7th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION Historic Preservation Board to City Commission - The City

Commission approve Petition HP-12-18. Historic

Preservation Board vote 5-0.

Staff to City Commission - The City Commission approve

Petition HP-12-18.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition

HP-12-18.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Approve

Upon Vote: 4-0, with Jay Reeves recusing himself.

Request a Part 1 Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for Renovation and an

Addition (B)

Petition HP-16-63 & HP-16-64. Jay Reeves and Associates, Inc., agent for Mike and Michelle Jaffee. Certificate of Appropriateness & Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the interior renovation, and a guest house addition to an existing garage. Located at 621 NE 5th Terrace. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-16-63 & HP-16-64. Staff recommends approval of Petition HP-16-63 with the conditions as stated below, and approval of HP-16-64 for a "Part 1" ad valorem tax exemption based on the following:

- 1. The property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and
- 2. The proposed improvements are eligible.

Staff's recommendation of approval for the petition is based on the following conditions:

- 1. The addition cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the RSF-3 zoning district.
- 2. No range, stove, or oven shall be installed in the proposed addition.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Jay Reeves, agent, spoke to the petition and answered questions from the board.

Motion By: Jason Straw Seconded By: Ann Stacy

Moved To: Approved with staff conditions.

Upon Vote: 4-0, with Jay Reeves recusing himself.

Demolition of a Non-Contributing Accessory Structure and New Construction of an Accessory Structure (B)

<u>Petition HP-16-66.</u> Anthony Ackrill, owner. Demolition of a non-contributing accessory structure and new construction of an accessory structure. Located at 717 NE 3rd Avenue. This building will be non-contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Staff recommends a) a waiver of the 90 day demolition delay for the non-contributing accessory structure and b) conditional approval of the COA for the new construction Petition HP-16-66, based on the condition that the applicant submits a copy of building permit application drawings for final

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Anthony Ackrill, owner, spoke to the petition and answered questions from the board.

Motion By: Jason Straw

Seconded By: Jay Reeves, Jr.

Moved To: Approve with staff conditions.

Upon Vote: 5-0

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

Petition HP-16-60. 1017 NW 2nd Street. Construct a rear screen porch addition onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Abby Hogan, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-62. 306 NE 7th Street. Remove an existing exterior stair case and replace with a new stair case onto a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Terry Fleming, owner. Joshua Shatkin, Shatkin Architecture LLC, agent.

Petition HP-16-65. 525 NE 9th Avenue. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Julie Knox and Craig Smith, owners. Christopher Tenney, Godwin Green Roofing, agent.

Petition HP-16-67. 542 NW 3rd Street. Reroof a single-family structure. This building is contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Lillie Harris, owner.

INFORMATION ITEMS: N/A

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.