City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes

September 5, 2017 5:30 PM

City Commission Auditorium

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair
Ann Stacy - Vice Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Scott Daniels - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Eric Neiberger - Member
Jordan Brown - Member
David Enriquez - Student Appointee

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

170340.

Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: March 7, 2017 through

August 1, 2017 (B)

<u>Attachments:</u> 170340_HPB 6-month Attendance_20170905.pdf

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Scott Daniels

Moved To: Approve agenda with modification to have a vote on a new

Vice-Chair.

Upon Vote: 7-0

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-355 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board, including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-112(d)(7) of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-112(d)(7)i. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES- August 1, 2017 - No Quorum

The board could not vote to approve the July 5, 2017 minutes because of the lack of a quorum at the August meeting. Staff gave board members the July minutes for review and approval.

REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

Cleary Larkin, Planner, introduced the property at 1015 SW 3rd Avenue to the board for Eric Leightman, agent for the property owner, to speak about a contributing accessory structure on the site. The owner feels that the structure is holding up the sale of the property because of its contributing status. Mr. Leightman is looking for guidance to give to future buyers about a project that would keep the contributing principle structure and demolish the accessory structure to allow for a development that could be approved by the board. The chair indicated that the board could only give an opinion of the significance of the structure as anything else would be contingent on the specific plans for the property. The board indicated that the accessory structure was not compatible with the primary structure and it is a utilitarian design that does not fit in with

the general character of the area.

Board Election

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By:

Moved To: Elect Scott Daniels as Vice-Chair

Upon Vote: 7-0

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

170251.

Relocation of a House within the Same Lot (B)

<u>Petition HP-15-60.</u> John Hudson, agent for Juan Carlos Hernandez. Renewal of a previously approved petition to relocate a single-family dwelling within the same lot and demolish non-contributing additions on the building. Located at 504 SW 10th Street. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to HP-15-61.

Attachments: 170251_staff report w exhibits 1-6_20170905.pdf

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition

HP-15-60.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation.

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Approve with the condition that the entire house is moved minus the small front porch

Upon Vote: 7-0

170337. Re-roof a Residential Building with a Metal Roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-17-38.</u> Shane Smalley, Atlantic Roofing, agent for Perry Properties, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of metal roofing. Located at 205 NE 3rd Street. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Attachments: 170337 Staff report w Exhibits 1-3 20170905.pdf

170337 Staff report w Exhibits 1-3 20171003.pdf

RECOMMENDATION Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition

HP-17-38 with the condition that the roof shall be 5V Crimp and that the finish shall be Galvalume or a light to medium

gray paint finish.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Board member Bill Warinner indicated that the proposed 5V Crimp style metal roof was a more utilitarian style of metal roof and not appropriate for the Northeast Residential Historic District. Shane Smalley of Atlantic Roofing spoke to the matter and answered questions from the board.

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Michelle Hazen

Moved To: Continue the item with the condition that if applicant comes before staff with a proposal for architectural grade shingles, that could be staff approved; anything else will need to come back before the board for review.

Upon Vote: 7-0

170343.

Northeast Residential Historic District. Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of contributing primary structure; demolition, new construction and zoning modification request for non-contributing accessory structure; Part 1 Ad Valorem tax exemption for 609 NE 6th Street.

<u>Petition HP-17-39.</u> Steffen Vala, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of contributing primary structure; demolition, new construction and zoning modification request for non-contributing accessory structure; Part 1 Ad Valorem tax exemption for 609 NE 6th Street. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Attachments: 170343 Staff Report w Exhibits 1-5 20170905.pdf

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of

Appropriateness and a continuance of the Part 1 review.

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Steffen Vala, owner, spoke about the project and Doug Nesbitt of Atlantic Design indicated a willingness to work with staff on the proposal.

Motion By: Michelle Hazen Seconded By: Bill Warinner

Moved To: Approve with the staff recommendations.

Upon Vote: 7-0

170339.

Re-roof a Single-Family Dwelling with a Metal Roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-17-35.</u> Ron Thomas and Denise Guerin, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to re-roof a single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 824 NE 4th Avenue. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Attachments: 170339 Staff Report w Exhibits 1-3 20170905.pdf

170339 Staff Report w Exhibits 1-3 20171003.pdf

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-17-35 with the condition that the roof shall be 5V Crimp and that the finish shall be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Denise Guerin, owner, spoke to the issue of other 5V Crimp metal roofs in the neighborhood. The board discussed whether there was precedent at this location for approving 5V Crimp since the rear addition has existing 5V Crimp. They determined that the house is significant in architectural character which places it above a utilitarian type structure where 5V Crimp may be more appropriate.

Motion By: Jordan Brown Seconded By:

Moved To: Approve Upon Vote: (Motion died for lack of a second)

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Scott Daniels

Moved To: Continue to the next meeting.

Upon Vote: 7-0

170341.

Northeast Residential Historic District. Certificate of Appropriateness for Rehabilitation Including New Roof Form, Window and Door Replacement and New Fencing for 217 NE 10th Avenue (B)

<u>Petition HP-17-40.</u> Leslie Murray and Sophia Acord, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation including new roof form, window and door replacement and new fencing for 217 NE 10th Avenue. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Attachments: 170341 Staff Report w Exhibits 1-3. 20170905.pdf

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of

Appropriateness with conditions.

Cleary Larkin, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Leslie Murray and Sophia Acord, owners, spoke to the board.

Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Jordan Brown

Moved To: Approve with staff recommendations.

Upon Vote: 6-0 with Jay Reeves recusing himself

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

1. Petition HP-17-29. City of Gainesville, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for signage installation at 25 SE 2nd Place, Hippodrome Theater. The property is an individual landmark.

- 2. Petition HP-17-30. City of Gainesville, owner. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness for canvas awning installation at 306 NE 6th Avenue, Thomas Center B. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
- 3. Petition HP-17-33. Mona Rippe, owner. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness for wood shed installation in backyard at 644 NE 10th Place. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
- 4. Petition HP-17-34. Stellar, LLC, owners. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness for minor rehabilitation of 106 and 114 SE 6th Street. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.
- 5. Petition HP-17-37. Bill Warinner, agent; Susan Shure, owner. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness for minor rehabilitation and addition to 630 NE 10th Avenue. The property is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

INFORMATION ITEMS:

Dangerous building designation by Code Enforcement for single-family structure located at 507 NW 2nd Street.

Pulled from the agenda to be heard at the October 3, 2017 HPB meeting.

Discussion on roof material replacement

Cleary Larkin, Planner, asked for feedback from the board concerning appropriate roof material in the historic districts and a rough timeline for when metal roofs may have been introduced into the districts. Chair Reeves indicated that most of the original roofs in the older parts of the districts would have been wood shingle. Metal roofs with a 5V Crimp style came in with utilitarian structures while pressed-in shingles were the more common style of metal roof in the teens and twenties (20th Century). High end Victorians might have a standing seam metal roof, but there are not a lot of examples of historic metal roofing in the districts. Asphalt shingles became common after the wood shingles and asbestos shingles were used to prevent a common problem concerning roof fires. It was stated that the insurance companies have encouraged people to install metal roofs to replace shingles that they want taken off after 15 years. There was further discussion about roofing in the districts.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call 334-5022.

If any person decides to appeal a decision of this body with respect to any matter considered at the above-referenced meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purposes it may be necessary to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Persons with disabilities who require assistance to participate in the meeting are requested to notify the Equal Opportunity Department at 334-5051 (TDD 334-2069) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting date.