

# City of Gainesville

*City Hall  
200 East University Avenue  
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



## **Minutes - Final**

**January 7, 2020**

**5:30 PM**

**City Hall Auditorium**

## **Historic Preservation Board**

*Jay Reeves - Chair  
Bill Warinner - Member  
Michelle Hazen - Member  
Danielle Masse - Member  
Kyra N. Lucas - Member  
Eric W. Barkhurst - Member  
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member  
Nicole Nesberg - Member  
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison*

**CALL TO ORDER****ROLL CALL**[190828.](#)

**Historic Preservation Board Attendance Roster: June 4, 2019 Through January 7, 2020 (B)**

**Members Present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Kyra Lucas, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hausauer**

**Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Yvette Thomas**

**ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**Motion to approve the agenda. Motion made by Bill Warinner, seconded by Kyra Lucas. Motion passes following a 5-0 vote.**

**ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-4.28G. of the Land Development Code.**

**REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD****OLD BUSINESS:**[190825.](#)

**Revision of an approved COA to construct two duplexes with a shared wall on the property line (B)**

**Petition HP-19-00070. Elliot Larkin, Larkin Rentals II LLC, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of two duplexes with an application for modification of the front setback and the first floor building height. Located at 516 NW 1st Street. These buildings will be non-contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.**

**Project Description**

**The property is located at 516 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of DT (Downtown). The parent parcel (14188-000-000) is located in**

the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.2 acres in size. The lot is currently vacant after the recent demolition of two single-family structures. The property was approved for a lot split, creating two lots with dimensions of 41.5 feet by 100 feet each. Tax parcel 14188-000-000 is the north parcel with addresses of 518 and 520 NW 1st Street; tax parcel 14188-001-000 is the south parcel with addresses of 514 and 516 NW 1st Street. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating four dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a 2-story duplex on each of the newly created lots. The DT zoning district is a transect zone which allows side setbacks of 0 feet, meaning the building wall can be placed on the side property line. However, because the building code considers that type of building to be multiple-family, stormwater treatment on site would have been required. It was determined that due to the lack of space on the properties, the building should be split into two separate buildings. The duplexes will be 2x4 frame construction with a stem wall and slab. The siding will be HardiePlank lap siding for the first floor level and HardiePanel vertical siding for the second floor level. Each of the four total units will be 3 bedrooms and 3 bathrooms. Each duplex will have approximately 3,082 square feet under roof, with 1,269 square feet of conditioned space on each floor, 228 square feet of porch area on the first floor including the laundry, and 316 square feet of balconies on the second floor including the laundry and air conditioning. There will be a hip roof with 30 year architectural shingles. The windows are to be Silver Line by Andersen V3 series, double-hung with simulated divided lights, in dark bronze. The exterior doors will be Simpson Bellaire 7598 or equivalent. A sidewalk will have to be installed along NW 1st Street.

The revised plans have incorporated the conditions that the HPB applied to the original petition at the October 1, 2019 meeting. There are one over one windows instead of the original Prairie-style windows, there are straight columns on the second floor, and there is ordinary glass in the front doors instead of frosted glass.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (east) setback. The required front yard setback in the DT zoning district is 15 - 20 feet. The request is for a front setback of 13 feet, 6 inches. The other request for administrative modification is for the minimum first floor height for a residential building, which is 12 feet in the DT zoning district. The request is for a 10 foot minimum first floor height which is more compatible with the neighboring residences in the area, such as the duplex directly south of the subject property, which appears to have a ceiling height of approximately 8 feet, and the houses west and south of the property which appear to have first floor heights of under 10 feet.

**RECOMMENDATION**

*Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve the revised Petition HP-19-00070 with the following conditions:*

1. *Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Elliot Larkin, owner, answered questions from the board. Motion to approve with conditions including changing the window next to the front door to a sidelight for the ground floor units and increasing the roof pitch to a 7/12 pitch. Motion made by Kyra Lucas, seconded by Nicole Mesberg. Motion passes following a 5-0 vote.

## **NEW BUSINESS:**

[190826.](#)

### **Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)**

**Petition HP-19-103. Bradley Hunter, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a single-family house. Located at 725 NW 4th Street. This building will be non- contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District.**

#### **Project Description**

The property is located at 725 NW 4th Street on the east side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation). The parcel (14388-001-000) is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.09 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence, a Victorian era structure. It will be a 2-story structure that faces NW 4th Street. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 2 ½ bathrooms, with approximately 998 square feet of heated space on the first floor, 985 square feet of heated space on the second floor, a 232 square foot front porch, and a 86 square foot rear porch, for a total of approximately 2,301 square feet. The house will feature 3/1 and some smaller 2/1 vinyl windows, listed as the Silver Line by Andersen V3 series. There are also some smaller windows, as well as a stained glass window on the west (front) elevation. The exterior doors will be Rogue Valley solid fir traditional doors. The front porch will be supported by brick clad piers, while the house will have a stem wall foundation; Hardie plank siding with Hardie trim details; cased columns on the front porch, and a roof featuring architectural shingles.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

*Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-19-00103 with the following conditions:*

1. *Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Lights grille for the chosen 2x1 and 3x1 grille patterns.*
2. *Provide information sheets for the proposed architectural shingle roof system.*
3. *Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

**Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. The board discussed**

among themselves several architectural features of the proposed structure including the stairwell windows on the north elevation and the roof pitch. Motion to approve with staff recommendations and with the conditions that the stairwell window on the north elevation either eliminate the transom window above or install a taller window and that this revised window along with the 2 over 1 window on the ground floor be 3 over 1 windows. Motion made by Elizabeth Hausauer, seconded by Bill Warinner. Motion passes following a 5-0 vote.

190827.

**Northeast Residential Historic District. Request to replace garage door (B)**

**Petition HP-19-108.** Richard Kurtz & Sandra Matasick, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of a garage door. Located at 214 NE 9th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

**RECOMMENDATION**

*Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:*

§ *The converted garage cannot be used as an accessory dwelling unit, which is not an allowed use in the RSF-2 zoning district.*

§ *No range, stove, or oven shall be installed in the converted garage.*

§ *Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Jason Simmons, Planner, gave the staff presentation. Sandra Matasick, owner, discussed the project with the board. Motion to approve with staff recommendations and eliminate the garage door opening look, use the Low-E FCM608 SDL Therma-Tru door, and use shutters that are proportional to the window depicted in the revised drawing. Motion made by Bill Warinner, seconded by Kyra Lucas. Motion passes following a 5-0 vote.

190696.

**Nomination for placement of the Masonic Lodge #41 onto the Local Register of Historic Places. (B)**

**Petition HP-19-112.** Sarit Sela, agent for the City of Gainesville. Local landmark nomination for the placement of the Masonic Lodge #41 on the Local Register of Historic Places. Located at 215 N. Main Street. This building is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

**RECOMMENDATION**

*Staff to Historic Preservation Board - Approve the nomination for placement of the Masonic Lodge #41 onto the Local Register of Historic Places. Staff recommends approval of the landmark nomination based on review criteria a, b, and c:*

*a. Is associated with events that are significant to our local, state, or national history; - The membership of the lodge consisted of local politicians, businessmen, and developers whom played an important role in shaping Gainesville. The lodge has served continually since its construction and was chartered on January 15, 1857. Members of the lodge have held numerous positions with the city, county, and state government to include former US Senator David L. Yulee;*

*W.A. Shands, former president of state senate; and former Gainesville mayor, William Rueben Thomas. The lodge has also produced three Grand Masters, three Grand High Priests, one Grand Eminent Commander, and two Grand Worthy Patrons.*

*b. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction; - The building is an example of the ornate form of architecture used for public and civic buildings in the early 20th century. The building was constructed in 1908 and has survived with no major alterations and maintaining its ornamental architecture. The original finishes, features, and windows remain intact. The lodge is a rectangular, 2 story Italian Renaissance style building with a pediment hip roof and wide overhanging eaves. The building was designed by architect J.H.W. Hawkins of Jacksonville, Florida. The lodge was constructed by the Edding Manufacturing Company of sand brick masonry laid in a stretcher bond and pre-cast concrete made by the W.T. Hughes Company of Tampa. The lodge is one of two buildings in Gainesville that exemplify Italian Renaissance architecture.*

*c. Represents the work of a master; - J.H.W. Hawkins graduated in 1879 from Cornell University with a degree in architecture. He designed and oversaw a number of projects between 1879-1922 in Denver, Colorado; Jacksonville, Florida; Lincoln, Nebraska; and Wilkes-Barre Pennsylvania, some of which are listed on the National Register including the Dietz Memorial United Methodist Church, formerly known as the Saint Matthias' Episcopal Church. He is most notably known for designing Nebraska Hall (demolished) at the University of Nebraska.*

**Sarit Sela, City Architect, gave the staff presentation noting that the basic information was discussed as an information item at the December 3, 2019 Historic Preservation Board meeting. Kathleen Pagan, citizen and staff liaison to the Alachua County Historical Commission. Motion to support the nomination of the Masonic Lodge #41 for placement on the Local Register of Historic Places. Motion made by Bill Warinner, seconded by Nicole Nesberg. Motion passes following a 5-0 vote.**

#### **STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:**

**Petition HP-19-00101. 517 SW 10th Street. Install a 4 foot tall metal fence in a portion of the front yard and the side yards of a multiple-family building. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - South. Ellen Smith, Phi Sigma Sigma Inc., owner. Elena Mendenhall, Berkshire Hathaway Florida Realty, agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00105. 516 NW 1st Street. Install a 3 to 6 foot tall wood privacy fence in the side and rear yard of a duplex. This building is non-contributing to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Elliot Larkin, owner.**

**Petition HP-19-00106. 635 NE 1st Street. Remove fire escape stairs and replace fixed windows with French doors in the rear of the building, and reroof, as part of the conversion from commercial back to residential. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Zach Selden and Amie Keppler, owners. Jay Reeves, agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00107. 715 NE 2nd Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Chris Brew, owner. Travis Timmons, Worthmann Roofing and Construction, agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00109. 421 NE 4th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Claire Lamar, owner. James Whitton, Whitton Roofing, agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00110. 1205 NE 5th Street. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Christine Koopman, owner. Holt Professional Inc., agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00111. 738 NE 2nd Street. Partial reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Betty Hopper, owner. James Whitton, Whitton Roofing, agent.**

**Petition HP-19-00113. 1118 NW 4th Avenue. Reroof a multiple-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the University Heights Historic District - North. Irene Salley, owner. Titus Rhea, Certified Roofing Solutions LLC, agent.**

**Petition HP-20-00001. 1205 NE 6th Terrace. Reroof a single-family dwelling. This building is contributing to the Northeast Residential Historic District. Dan Rountree, owner. Jimmy Southerland, City of Gainesville Housing & Community Development, agent.**

**INFORMATION ITEMS: N/A**

## **BOARD MEMBER COMMENT**

**Chair Reeves talked about the property in downtown Gainesville at 238 West University Avenue that had a historic structure but had no protection from demolition and that now has a “for sale” sign on it.**

**NEXT MEETING DATE: February 4, 2020**

## ADJOURNMENT