City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes - Final

December 1, 2020 5:30 PM

1st Tuesday; City Hall Auditorium, City Hall, 200 East University

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair Bill Warinner - Member Michelle Hazen - Member Danielle Masse - Member Kyra N. Lucas - Member Elizabeth Hausauer - Member Nicole Nesberg - Member Elizabeth Hauck - Member Michael Hill - Member Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Michelle Hazen, Kyra Lucas, Michael Hill, Danielle Masse, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hasuauer, Elizabeth Hauck

Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Yvette Thomas

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion to approve modification of the agenda to move demolition Petition HP-20-94 ahead of the related new construction petitions, HP-20-95 & HP-20-96. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hill Motion passes following a 9-0 vote

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the City Commission and must be filed within 14 days from the date the decision by the Historic Preservation Board is reduced to writing and served by certified or registered mail. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-4.28G. of the Land Development Code.

NEW BUSINESS:

OLD BUSINESS:

200272.

| <u>RECOMMENDATION</u> | Staff finds that the requested action, as presented, is substantially consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and the Historic Preservation, Rehabilitation, and Design Guidelines. |
|-----------------------|---|
| | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approval of HP-20-65 with the condition: 1. The metal roof be standing seam in design. |

Chair Reeves indicated that the applicants were going ahead with reroofing the structure with standing seam. No additional vote is necessary.

<u>170343.</u>

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion to continue Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 9-0 vote

200271.

| <u>RECOMMENDATION</u> | Staff finds that the requested action, as presented, is substantially consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and the Historic Preservation, Rehabilitation, and Design Guidelines. |
|-----------------------|---|
| | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approval of HP-20-63 with the condition: 1. The metal roof be standing seam in design. |
| •• | e 5V crimp noting that this structure uniquely qualifies for |

5V crimp as the roof has a low pitch and it is 2 stories tall, thus the roof has low visibility from the street and this will not serve as a precedent for more conspicuous roofs in the area to primary dwellings Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 8-1 vote

200510.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board: - Approve Petition HP-20-80.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Lucas Motion passes following a 8-0 vote with Member Masse recusing herself

200503.

RECOMMENDATION Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-87.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Hausauer Seconded by: Member Hazen Motion passes following a 7-2 vote (nay from Member Warinner and Member Lucas)

200483.

| RECOMMENDATION | Staff recommends approval of the application with the | |
|-----------------------|--|--|
| | following conditions: | |
| | 1. Please provide a site plan showing the proposed deck with | |
| | distance from property lines. | |
| | 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction. | |

| | Motion to approve with recommended modifications to the entry door roof pitch and the use of wood or wood clad French doors in the back. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member HIII Motion passes following a 8-0 vote | | |
|----------------|---|---|--|
| <u>200484.</u> | · | | |
| 2001011 | RECOMMENDATION | Staff recommends approval of the application. | |
| | Motion to approve as submitted Motion by: Member Nesberg Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 9-0 vote | | |
| <u>200488.</u> | | | |
| | RECOMMENDATION | Staff recommends that the board review the request for the proposed window replacement for Petition HP-20-101. | |
| | This item was continu information | ed at the adoption of the agenda due to no new | |
| <u>200480.</u> | | | |
| | RECOMMENDATION | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-89. | |
| | Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hauck Motion passes following a 8-1 vote (Nay from Member Lucas) | | |
| <u>200482.</u> | | | |
| | <u>RECOMMENDATION</u> | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-91. | |
| | Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hauck Motion passes following a 9-0 vote | | |
| <u>200481.</u> | | | |
| | <u>RECOMMENDATION</u> | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-90 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish and make the finding that the property is an eligible property because it is a contributing structure and the proposed improvements are eligible improvements. | |
| | Motion to continue Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hill Motion passes following a 9-0 vote | | |

200486.

| | RECOMMENDATION | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board: | |
|----------------|---|--|--|
| | | Staff recommends approval of the application with the | |
| | | following condition(s): | |
| | | 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles | |
| | | for the chosen 9x1 and 4x1 grille pattern. | |
| | | 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and | |
| | | roofing material. | |
| | | 3. The HPB concurrently approve the request for the | |
| | | modification of existing zoning requirements reducing the side | |
| | | yard setback(s) from 5 feet to no less than 4 feet. | |
| | | 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction. | |
| | Motion to continue | | |
| | Motion by: Member Hill | | |
| | Seconded by: Member H | auck | |
| | Motion passes following | a 8-0 vote. | |
| 000407 | | | |
| <u>200487.</u> | | | |
| | RECOMMENDATION | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board: | |
| | | | |
| | | Staff recommends approval of the application with the | |
| | | following condition(s): | |
| | | 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles | |
| | | for the chosen 2x2 grille pattern. | |
| | | 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and | |
| | | roofing material. | |
| | | 3. The HPB concurrently approve the request for the | |
| | | modification of existing zoning requirements reducing the side | |
| | | yard setback(s) from 5 feet to no less than 4 feet. | |
| | | 4. Notify staff of any changes during construction. | |
| | Motion to continue | | |
| | Motion by: Member Hill | | |
| | Seconded by: Member H | | |
| | Motion passes following | a 8-0 vote | |
| 200485. | | | |
| 200403. | | | |
| | RECOMMENDATION | Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition | |
| | | HP-20-00095 with the following condition: | |
| | | 1. Salvage and re-use of historic materials that are in good | |
| | | condition. | |
| | Motion to deny the demo | slition of the structure with a recommendation that the | |
| | Motion to deny the demolition of the structure with a recommendation that the applicants take action to preserve what is there right now. | | |
| | Motion by: Member Nesberg | | |
| | Seconded by: Huack | | |
| | Motion passes following | a 9-0 vote | |
| | | | |
| <u>200571.</u> | | | |

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-111.</u> Alan G. Weinstein, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 626 NW 1st Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 626 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation) (See Figure 1). The site was a combination of two tax parcels (14941-000-000 & 14941-001-000) which have since been combined into one tax parcel, 14191-000-000. The site is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.250 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 3 bathrooms, with approximately 1,800 to 2,000 square feet of conditioned space and a detached garage of approximately 600 square feet. It will be a 1 story structure that will be facing NW 1st Street. The house will feature a brick foundation; horizontal siding; a fiberglass shingle roof; a stucco chimney; a 2-car detached garage with two garage doors and horizontal siding; a breezeway connecting the house with the garage featuring brick and decorative metal; an arbor located in the back yard; and a pool with pavers around it. There is a proposed arch over the door in the breezeway and the house features several gable vents.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00111 with the following conditions:

§ Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.

§ Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.

§ Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to continue Motion by: Member Lucas Seconded by: Member Hauck Motion passes following a 8-0 vote

200572.

Construct a new single-family dwelling (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-113.</u> Michael Beard, Elevated Design and Construction, agent for Joyce Cosby, Edna Cosby, and Leslie Edwards, owners.

Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 303 NW 4th Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The previous house located on this property was a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District that contributed to the scale and character of the Fifth Avenue neighborhood. It was a 2-story frame house that was first shown on the Sanborn Maps in 1913. The Florida Master Site file for the property indicates that the building was built circa 1911. Over the years the house was resided with aluminum siding and perma-stone and the porch was enclosed with screens and casement windows. The structure was the home of Dr. Julius Augustus Parker, the first African-American doctor in Gainesville. After his death in 1953, the house became the home of his youngest daughter, Dr. E. A. Cosby, a dentist. The house had a wood frame balloon structural system, a continuous perma-stone foundation, a gable roof, a porch roof secondary structure with a gable and a low shed dormer, and 2 over 2 wood windows with casement windows as well. The house burned down in December of 2017.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will have 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms with 2 half bathrooms, with approximately 2,818 square feet under roof including 1,483 square feet on the first floor, 877 square feet on the second floor, a 404 square foot front porch and a 54 square foot back porch. It will be a 2 story structure that will be facing NW 4th Street. The house will feature primarily 2/2 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be the Silver Line V1 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru Smooth-Star and Jeld Wen steel doors. The foundation for the house will be slab on grade concrete and the porch will be a screened-in porch. The proposed siding for the house is Cemplank lap siding with Hager aluminum fascia/trim and Kaycan soffits. The proposed roof will be an Ultra-Rib raised seam metal roof.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-113 with the following conditions:

> § The board discuss the proposed use of slab on grade which is generally not recommended in the historic districts, but is confined to non-contributing structures.

§ Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Lights grille if available for the chosen 2x2 grille patterns. If not available the windows shall utilize the Grilles-between-the-glass, Contour Profile for the chosen 2x2 grille patterns.

§ Provide information sheets for the proposed Ultra Rib roof system.

§ Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve with the condition that the window muntins shall be outside

of the glass and removal of the option of the grilles between the glass for the windows. Motion by: Member Lucas Seconded by: Member Hauck Motion passes following a 9-0 vote

MEMBER COMMENT

NEXT MEETING DATE

ADJOURNMENT