City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes - Final

February 8, 2021 5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair Bill Warinner - Member Michelle Hazen - Member Danielle Masse - Member Kyra N. Lucas - Member Elizabeth Hausauer - Member Nicole Nesberg - Member Elizabeth Hauck - Member Michael Hill - Member Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

Members present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Kyra Lucas, Michael Hill, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hausauer

Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Brittany McMullen, Elizabeth Chazulle

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Lucas Motion passes following a 5-0 vote

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

200794.

Draft Minutes of the March, 2021 Historic Preservation Board Meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the March, 2021 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hill Motion passes following a 5-0 vote

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.

OLD BUSINESS:

170343.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion for Conditional approval of the item subject to staff approval of the revised drawings and plans after further review and approval by Chairman

Reeves and /or others that may participate. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hill Motion passes following a 5-0 vote

200780.

Pleasant Street Historic District. Demolition of a single-family dwelling. (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-00094.</u> C. Webber, M. Atwater, & S. Stevenson, Pleasant Street 6th Avenue Land Trust, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a single-family dwelling located at 423 NW 6th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Related to Petition HP-19-00022.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition
HP-20-00095 with the following condition:
1. Salvage and re-use of historic materials that are in good condition.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 5-0 vote

200783.

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-114.</u> Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 1. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, just east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 1 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00114 with the following conditions:

1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.

 Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.
 Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to Approve with conditions including revisions to the south elevation by eliminating the 5 foot roof overhang and eliminating the Spanish balcony on the east elevation. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Lucas Motion passes following a 4-1 vote

The board voted to revisit the petition to add another condition. Elliot Larkin, owner, indicated they could probably accommodate the proposed change. Motion to Approve with conditions including modification to reduce the front setback from 20-25' to 10', 5" from back of curb, revisions to the south elevation by eliminating the 5 foot roof overhang and eliminating the Spanish balcony on the east elevation, and adding a condition to extend the front porch over to the entry of the upstairs unit. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Lucas Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

200784.

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-126.</u> Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 2. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 2 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north)

building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00126 with the following conditions:

1. The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb.

 Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system.
 Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to Approve with conditions including modification to reduce the front setback from 20-25' to 10', 5" from back of curb, revisions to the south elevation by eliminating the 5 foot roof overhang and eliminating the Spanish balcony on the east elevation, and extend the front porch over to the entry of the upstairs unit.

Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Nesberg Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

200785.

Construct a 2-story duplex (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-127.</u> Elliot Larkin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling and a request for modification of the front building placement requirement. Located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue, parcel 3. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located in the 300 block of NW 5th Avenue on the south side of the street, east of the Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church and on the southwest corner of NW 5th Avenue and NW 3rd Street, with a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6). This property has recently gone through the process of creating a minor subdivision from the parent tax parcel 14288-000-000. The subdivision created three lots which at this point in time are designated as parcels 1, 2, and 3. The

minor subdivision and the lots are located in the Pleasant Street Historic District. Parcel 1 has a land area of approximately 2,653.5 square feet, parcel 2 has approximately 2,631.4 square feet, and parcel 3 has approximately 3,468 square feet. The project involves building one duplex on each lot, creating six dwelling units. The proposed duplexes will be non-contributing structures to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

This petition involves the construction of a new duplex residential building on parcel 3 of the minor subdivision. The 2-story structure will have one unit on each floor, 3 bedrooms and 2 full bathrooms in each unit, with approximately 2,436 square feet of conditioned space and 2,721 square feet of total space for the building. The structure will be facing NW 4th Street but also has frontage on the south side of the property on NW 4th Place and on the east on NW 3rd Street. The house will feature primarily 1/1 single-hung white vinyl windows. All of the windows will be from the Mi 3500 vinyl series. The proposed exterior doors will be Therma-Tru doors. The foundation for the house is proposed to be a stem wall foundation approximately 24 inches above grade, which will be coated with stucco for a smooth finish and then painted. The front porch will be tongue and groove lumber on piers covered in brick. The proposed siding for the house is Hardie lap siding and trim. The proposed roof will be a gable roof using a TAMKO 30 year architectural shingle roof system.

This proposal is requesting an administrative modification for the front (north) building placement distance. The applicants are indicating a distance of approximately 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb to the front edge of the proposed building, which is the porch. The proposed modification will improve the public safety, health, and welfare of abutting property owners and the historic district by enabling the development of a multiple-family building on a property that is vacant. The new development will be consistent with the traditional development pattern in the district. The proposed setback for the duplex is compatible with the setback for the adjacent historic church to the west, and the commercial businesses across the street from the subject property are right on the sidewalk. The requested modification is appropriate for the zoning district and the particular situation at this location.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>	Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-20-00127 with the following conditions:	
	 The HPB concurrently approve the administrative modification for the front (north) yard setback from 20 feet minimum and 25 feet maximum to 10 feet, 5 inches from the back of curb. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and the architectural shingle roof system. Notify staff of any changes during construction. 	

Motion to Approve with conditions including modification to reduce the front

setback from 20-25' to 10', 5" from back of curb, revisions to the south elevation by eliminating the 5 foot roof overhang and eliminating the Spanish balcony on the east elevation, and extend the front porch over to the entry of the upstairs unit. Motion by: Member Nesberg Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

NEW BUSINESS:

200781.

Pleasant Street Historic District. Construction of a single-family dwelling. (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-00095.</u> C. Webber, M. Atwater, & S. Stevenson, Pleasant Street 6th Avenue Land Trust, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling on lot 21 with a zoning modification request to reduce the side setback from 5 feet to 4 feet. Located at 423 NW 6th Avenue. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Related to Petition HP-20-00094 and HP-20-00096.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following condition(s):

1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the chosen 9x1 and 4x1 grille pattern.

2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and roofing material.

 The HPB concurrently approve the request for the modification of existing zoning requirements reducing the side yard setback(s) from 5 feet to no less than 4 feet.
 Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to Approve as recommended in the staff report. Motion by: Member Hausauer Seconded by: Member Nesberg Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

200782.

Pleasant Street Historic District. Construction of a single-family dwelling. (B)

<u>Petition HP-20-00096.</u> C. Webber, M. Atwater, & S. Stevenson, Pleasant Street 6th Avenue Land Trust, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling on lot 22 with a zoning modification request to reduce the side setback from 5 feet to 4 feet. Located at 423 NW 6th Avenue. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District. Related to Petition HP-20-00094 and

		······································	
	HP-20-00095.		
	RECOMMENDATION	Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:	
		 Staff recommends approval of the application with the following condition(s): 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the chosen 2x2 grille pattern. 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows and roofing material. 3. The HPB concurrently approve the request for the modification of existing zoning requirements reducing the side yard setback(s) from 5 feet to no less than 4 feet. 4. Notify staff of any changes during construction. 	
		Lucas	
<u>200786.</u>			
	Reroof multiple-family building with a metal roof (B)		
	Wetherington, owner multiple-family build	rl Warmack, Allen Roofing LLC, agent for Leon . Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing ing with a metal roof. Located at 102 NW 9th Terrace. -contributing structure to the University Heights rth.	
	Project Description		
	The existing multiple-family building is a two-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1997. It is a 5-unit building with approximately 4,656 square feet of heated space and 4,760 of total area. The existing gable/hip roof has asphalt shingles.		
	The proposal would install a 26 gauge rib panel metal roof over the existing asphalt shingle roof using purlins. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals.		
	a building's overall des discussed and adopted which would be allowe Board approves metal use of the building. Re	ble component of historic buildings and are an integral part of sign and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing ed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and ecommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more	

sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The existing structure is a non-contributing multiple-family building that sits back in a wooded area just south of another non-contributing multiple-family building, north of a vacant convenience store, and across the street from a fast food drive-thru facility. Noting the mix of roof types in the University Heights Historic District - North, the proposed metal roofing is compatible with the neighborhood.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-1 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

200787.

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-2.</u> Lawrence C. Hood, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof a portion of an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 629 NE Boulevard. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1954. It has a mid-century modern style architectural style with a gable/hip roof, a portion of which is flat and the rest has a low slope. The building is approximately 1,492 square feet of heated space and 2,062 square feet of total area. The existing roof has a tar and gravel surface and is currently leaking, causing wood rot to the fascia boards and ceiling damage in the kitchen. The applicant indicates that he cannot find anyone in town that will replace the built-up roof with the same materials. This type of roofing material is also used on the separate 2-car carport structure in the back of the primary structure.

The proposal under consideration with this application would install a 26 gauge Ultra-Lok panel metal roof over 15/32" plywood. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals. The primary structure has a slightly sloped roof on the approximately front 2/3's of the house; the back 1/3 is flat, along with the carport. The metal roof is proposed only for the sloped portion of the roof. The flat roof portion of the house as well as the carport will be replaced with TPO (Thermoplastic Polyolefin), which is a single-ply roofing membrane that can be used to cover flat roofs.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board

approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The existing structure is a non-contributing single-family building but was part of the recent mid-century modern survey of the City. The covering on flat roofs is not visible from the right-of-way. The principal structure has a low slope roof and it is not easy to see the surface of the roof from the right-of-way. The installation of a metal roof on this structure will have very little visual impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed metal roofing is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-2 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to Approved, noting the low visibility of the roof from the street. Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

200788.

Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a non-contributing auxiliary structure. (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-3.</u> Doug Nesbit, Atlantic Design & Construction, agent for Paul S. & Laura J. Richards, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a detached guest house (accessory dwelling unit) with associated modification to the north side setback. Located at 206 NE 7th Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a two-story, contributing structure that was built circa 1913 according to the Florida Master Site File. It is a wood frame Colonial Revival according to the site file (Queen Anne Style Victorian per real estate websites) house noted for its size and details.

The applicant is proposing to build a one story detached guest house in the northwest corner of the lot. This will be considered an accessory dwelling unit (ADU) under the provisions of Sec. 30-5.35 of the City's Land Development Code. An ADU is an allowed use by right in the Urban 2 zoning district. The size of the proposed structure is 498 square feet of conditioned area. The roof slope is 10:12 to match the existing roof pitch of the house. The gable details mimic the existing elevations with a horizontal eyebrow separating cementicious board shingles on the upper section and hardie plank siding wrapping the walls below. Silver asphalt architectural shingles will be used to approximate the style of the existing roof. The proposed doors are PGT swinging doors while the windows are PGT single hung style. The foundation is monolithic.

The proposal meets most of the provisions of Section 30-5.35. - Accessory dwelling units (ADUs). The proposed 498 square feet is less than the maximum 850 square foot provision. The auxiliary building has been designed as a subordinate structure to the primary structure on the lot in terms of its mass, size, height, and architectural character. The proposal does not meet the provision about compliance with all standards applicable within the zoning districts, including required setbacks, as the applicants are requesting a modification to the rear setback for the proposed ADU, from the required 10 feet to 2 feet, to place the ADU in the proposed location.

The ADU as shown, would not meet the current rear yard setback requirements for the Urban 2 zoning district, which requires a rear setback of 10 feet minimum when there is no adjacent alley for all buildings. The ADU will require a rear yard setback reduction at the north property line to no less than 2 feet where 10 feet minimum is required. The applicants are in discussion with the Building Department about proximity of the proposed ADU to the principal structure, with the idea that it may be possible to move the ADU closer to it and increase the setback to at least 3 feet.

The adjacent lot owner has expressed opposition to the zoning modification request, indicating that 2 feet is not enough distance. The request may affect the public safety, health, or welfare of abutting property owners or the district in accordance with the concerns of the adjacent lot owner. The proposal does reflect a typical development pattern or design theme in the district concerning the location of accessory structures near property lines. The design of the ADU will not detract from the aesthetic character of the house. The requested modification is generally appropriate for the historic district but the board should deliberate on the request and the appropriate distance between a dwelling unit and the adjacent property line.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. The HPB approve the Modification of Existing Zoning Requirements, reducing the rear yard setback from 10 feet to no less than 2 feet with conditions, including no windows to be placed on the north elevation of the ADU, shift the building as much as possible towards the principal structure to gain a foot or some extra inches for the setback distance, and explore the placement of a fence to provide a barrier between the properties in the location of the ADU.

2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion continued Motion by: Member Hausauer Seconded by: Member Warinner Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

200789.

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-4.</u> Kim Popejoy, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 300 NE 13th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a two-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1996-1998 in its current state. The original structure which was a one-story brick house was built in 1935. It has a gable/hip roof and wood shingle and brick exterior walls. The building is approximately 2,328 square feet of heated space and 2,798 square feet of total area. The existing roof has architectural asphalt shingles that are at the end of their useful life.

The proposal under consideration would overlay the current shingles with metal roofing. The project involves the installation of purlins over the top of the existing roof material. The purlins will be installed and nailed to the decking as well as the rafters. A 29 gauge galvalume, ultra-rib metal roofing panel system will be placed over the top of the purlins. Panels will be fastened to the purlins with metal roofing screws and all flashings will be installed over the eave, gable, ridge, valley, chimney stack, vent, and pipe boots. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The existing structure is a non-contributing single-family building. The structure has a high slope roof but it is not highly visible from the street since the slope faces away from the street. In addition, there is currently extensive tree cover on either side of the house, further limiting the visual impact of a metal roof on the adjacent neighboring properties. The installation of a metal roof on this structure will have very little visual impact on the surrounding neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-4 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to continue Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Nesberg Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

200790.

Install fencing around the yard of a single-family dwelling (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-6.</u> Amie Kreppel & Zachary Selden, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to install fencing around the property of an existing

single-family dwelling. Located at 635 NE 1st Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The applicant is proposing to fence the property since it has become necessary in recent months due to the unwelcome use of the property (including hoses, trash bins, and bushes) by a variety of people. The proposed fencing includes a four foot tall black metal fence along the front of the property adjacent to NE 1st Street, and partially along the side yard adjacent to NE 7th Avenue and partially along the side yard adjacent to the property on the south. The applicants are also proposing to install a six foot tall slip fence to run along the rear (east) property line, partially along the side yard adjacent to the property on the south, and partially along the side yard adjacent to NE 7th Avenue. The new fence will run behind a large tree at the northeast corner of the property and parallel to 7th Avenue across the old driveway that provided access to the parking spaces for the old office use. This area will now be the back yard with a pool for the residents. The fence will continue across a grass area and then turn south to the house at the mid length point of the structure and also tie in to the metal fence that will run up 7th Avenue. A grass area between the fence and the sidewalk would be landscaped by the owners to tie in with the landscaping of the front yard. The fence will be a vertical model slip fence made of wood and metal. The fences will include three gates as well.

The proposed four foot metal fence in the front yard of the property is largely in compliance with the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines for fencing because it will be no greater than 48 inches tall as it is mostly open and will be metal. The metal is a black-coated aluminum material. The proposed new fence in the rear yard of the property meets the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines for fencing because it is in the rear yard, it is proposed to be made of wood and metal, and it would be no greater than six feet in height. However, for the proposed fence in the side yard of the property along the highly visible NE 7th Avenue, the petitioner is requesting a height that exceeds what is allowable through staff approval, and therefore requires approval of the Historic Preservation Board (HPB).

In the past the HPB has heard discussion about fencing on corner lots in the neighborhood. Design considerations at these times included consideration of a six foot fence that was solid for four feet in height and then more of an open design for the remaining two feet in height, and location of the fence relative to the sidewalk. The proposed six foot tall fence will be off of the sidewalk approximately four feet. The corner lot was the home of an office use for many years. Many office uses still exist on NE 1st Street, which gets vehicle traffic as well as pedestrian traffic and is a designated Storefront Street. The zoning map identifies a hierarchy of street types that determine the relationship of buildings to the street and the standards for the design of street landscaping and sidewalks. Street types include: Storefront, Principal, Thoroughfare, and Local Streets. Storefront streets are designed to encourage a high level of pedestrian activity. North Main Street is just one block to the west. The

board should deliberate on the height issue of the fence proposed near the public sidewalk along NE 7th Avenue.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff recommends approval of the application.

Motion to approve with condition that six foot fence along NE 7th Avenue be moved back five feet from the edge of the sidewalk instead of four feet. Motion by: Member Hausauer Seconded by: Member Hill Motion passes following a 5-0 vote (Member Reeves abstained)

200791.

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-7.</u> Anthony C. Vargas, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing multiple-family building with a metal roof. Located at 824 SE 1st Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Southeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing multiple-family building is a one-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1978. It is a 4-unit building with approximately 2,966 square feet of heated space and 3,692 square feet of total area. The existing gable/hip roof has asphalt shingles.

The proposal would install a 29 gauge Ultra-Rib panel metal roof over the existing asphalt shingle roof with a synthetic underlayment between the old and the new roofing material. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The existing structure is a non-contributing multiple-family building that sits back approximately 80 feet from the paved area of SE 1st Avenue. Adjacent contributing structures to the east of the subject property have metal roofs, as do two homes across the street from the multiple-family building that are not in the historic district. The proposed metal roofing is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-7 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Warinner Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 5-0 vote

200792.

Certificate of Appropriateness for a deck in the front yard. (B)

Petition HP-21-00009. Lawrence N. & Pamela B. Lahiff, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a deck in the front yard of an existing single-family dwelling with associated modifications to the front and side setback. Located at 506 NE 2nd Street. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story, contributing structure that was built circa 1928 according to the Florida Master Site File. It is a weatherboard covered bungalow that represents a typical Gainesville house of the 1920's. It is a wood frame structure with brick piers, a gable roof with cross gables for the secondary roof structure, novelty shingles, wood windows, and an arched entry hood with brackets over the front door. The building is approximately 1,113 square feet of total area and heated space.

The proposal under consideration with this application is the construction of a slightly raised wood deck around the southeast corner of the house. Landscape material would occupy the area between the deck and the fence on the east and south property lines. The proposal must receive approval from the Historic Preservation Board because the deck is proposed for the front and front side yard of the building.

Decks can be staff approved if they meet certain conditions: The historic building on which the deck is to be built does not front on two or more streets; the deck is sited to the rear or rear sideyard of the building; and the deck must utilize simple designs that are mostly open. As indicated above the deck is sited on the front and front side yard of the building. The building does not front on two or more streets. As shown in Exhibit 3, the proposed deck is wood construction, with a proposed width of 6.7 feet, with little elevation above grade. The visual impact of the deck will be minimal, particularly since the existing fence will largely block the view of the deck from the street. No railing is proposed and the deck utilizes simple design that is open.

The deck as shown, would not meet the current front and side yard setback requirements for the Urban 4 zoning district, which requires 15 feet minimum to 20 feet maximum from the curb on the front and 5 feet minimum on the side yard. The deck will require a front yard setback reduction at the east property line to no less

200793.

than 12 feet where 15 feet minimum to 20 feet maximum is required from the back of curb. The deck will require a side yard setback reduction at the south property line to no less than 4 feet.

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions: 1. The HPB approve the Modification of Existing Zoning Requirements, reducing the front yard setback from the 15 feet to 20 feet required to no less than 12 feet and reducing the south side yard setback from 5 feet to no less than 4 feet. 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve with the modifications to the front yard setback (no less than 12 feet) & to the south side setback (no less than 4 feet). Motion by: Member Nesberg Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

Obtain COA for fencing installed around the yard of a single-family dwelling (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-10.</u> P.J. & Gina van Blokland, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to gain approval of installed fencing around the side and rear of a single-family dwelling. Located at 310 NE 13th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking the approval of a six foot tall chain link fence that was installed without receiving a COA for the proposal. The owners have been cited by the Code Enforcement Division for a fence installation without receiving a COA. This petition makes the request that the installed fence remain in place on three sides of the back yard; on the west side, the north side, and on the east. These portions of the fence are not visible from the right-of-way. The western segment of the fence is adjacent to a chain link fence on the adjacent property. The south portion of the chain link fence is visible from the right-of-way, and would be replaced with a six foot tall wood stockade fence over metal posts painted black, with partially open gates. The board pattern for the gates would be 1x6, 1x2, 1x2, and 1x6, for a 40% transparency and some visibility into the side yard. The six foot height is requested because of the need to keep a large dog (Great Dane) in the yard and not jumping a four foot tall fence. The small segment of chain link fencing on the south elevation on the east side of the house will be replaced with the six foot tall wood stockade fence.

The six foot tall wood stockade fence does not extend in to the front yard beyond the front wall of the house and this property is not a corner lot with a highly visible side or rear yard. The three sides of the fence on the east, west, and north, are not highly visible from the right-of-way. Chain link fencing is not recommended in the historic districts but is not outright prohibited. The proposed wood fence for the visible south elevation is not more than six feet in height and is an appropriate material. This south elevation fence with the gates would be set back from the street over 40 feet, while the proposed fence on the east side would be set back over 60 feet from the street. The proposed south elevation fencing meets the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines for fencing because it does not extend in to the front yard beyond the front wall of the house, it is proposed to be made of wood, and it would be no greater than six feet in height. The chain link portion of the installed fencing is not highly visible from the public right-of-way.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Staff recommends approval of the application.

Motion to approve Motion by: Member Hill Seconded by: Member Nesberg Motion passes following a4-1 vote (Member Reeves abstained)

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

200666.

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness (B)

<u>Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness</u>. September 2020 through December 2020.

Project Description

This is a list of staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness from September of 2020 to December of 2020.

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u> Historic Preservation Board review the information.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

MEMBER COMMENT:

NEXT MEETING DATE: MARCH 2, 2021

ADJOURNMENT