# **City of Gainesville**

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



## **Minutes - Final**

March 2, 2021 5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

## **Historic Preservation Board**

Jay Reeves - Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Elizabeth Hauck - Member
Michael Hill - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

## **CALL TO ORDER**

## **ROLL CALL**

Members present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Michelle Hazen, Danielle Masse, Nicole Nesberg, Elizabeth Hausauer, Elizabeth Hauck

Staff Present: Jason Simmons, Brittany McMullen, Elizabeth Chazulle

#### ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

**Motion to Approve** 

Motion By: Member Warinner Seconded By: Member Nesberg Motion passes following 6-0 vote

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

## <u>200794.</u>

## Draft Minutes of the March, 2021 Historic Preservation Board Meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the March, 2021 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve

the draft minutes.

Motion to approve

Motion By: Member Warinner Seconded By: Member Nesberg Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

## **BOARD BUSINESS:**

Renewal of membership in the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation.

#### **OLD BUSINESS:**

200788.

Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a non-contributing auxiliary structure. (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-3.</u> Doug Nesbit, Atlantic Design & Construction, agent for Paul S. & Laura J. Richards, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a detached guest house (accessory dwelling unit) with associated modification to the north side setback. Located at 206 NE 7th Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

**Project Description** 

The existing single-family dwelling is a two-story, contributing structure that was built circa 1913 according to the Florida Master Site File. It is a wood frame Colonial Revival according to the site file (Queen Anne Style Victorian per real estate websites) house noted for its size and details.

The applicant is proposing to build a one story detached guest house in the northwest corner of the lot. This will be considered an accessory dwelling unit (ADU) under the provisions of Sec. 30-5.35 of the City's Land Development Code. An ADU is an allowed use by right in the Urban 2 zoning district. The size of the proposed structure is 498 square feet of conditioned area. The roof slope is 10:12 to match the existing roof pitch of the house. The gable details mimic the existing elevations with a horizontal eyebrow separating cementicious board shingles on the upper section and hardie plank siding wrapping the walls below. Silver asphalt architectural shingles will be used to approximate the style of the existing roof. The proposed doors are PGT swinging doors while the windows are PGT single hung style. The foundation is monolithic.

The proposal meets most of the provisions of Section 30-5.35. - Accessory dwelling units (ADUs). The proposed 498 square feet is less than the maximum 850 square foot provision. The auxiliary building has been designed as a subordinate structure to the primary structure on the lot in terms of its mass, size, height, and architectural character. The proposal does not meet the provision about compliance with all standards applicable within the zoning districts, including required setbacks, as the applicants are requesting a modification to the rear setback for the proposed ADU, from the required 10 feet to 2 feet, to place the ADU in the proposed location.

The ADU as shown, would not meet the current rear yard setback requirements for the Urban 2 zoning district, which requires a rear setback of 10 feet minimum when there is no adjacent alley for all buildings. The ADU will require a rear yard setback reduction at the north property line to no less than 2 feet where 10 feet minimum is required. The applicants are in discussion with the Building Department about proximity of the proposed ADU to the principal structure, with the idea that it may be possible to move the ADU closer to it and increase the setback to at least 3 feet.

The adjacent lot owner has expressed opposition to the zoning modification request,

indicating that 2 feet is not enough distance. The request may affect the public safety, health, or welfare of abutting property owners or the district in accordance with the concerns of the adjacent lot owner. The proposal does reflect a typical development pattern or design theme in the district concerning the location of accessory structures near property lines. The design of the ADU will not detract from the aesthetic character of the house. The requested modification is generally appropriate for the historic district but the board should deliberate on the request and the appropriate distance between a dwelling unit and the adjacent property line.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The HPB approve the Modification of Existing Zoning Requirements, reducing the rear yard setback from 10 feet to no less than 2 feet with conditions, including no windows to be placed on the north elevation of the ADU, shift the building as much as possible towards the principal structure to gain a foot or some extra inches for the setback distance, and explore the placement of a fence to provide a barrier between the properties in the location of the ADU.
- 2. Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve the revised plan with no change or reduction to the setbacks.

Motion by: Member Nesberg Seconded by: Member Hauck Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

#### 200789.

#### Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-4.</u> Kim Popejoy, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 300 NE 13th Avenue. This building is a non-contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

## Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a two-story, non-contributing structure, that was built in 1996-1998 in its current state. The original structure which was a one-story brick house was built in 1935. It has a gable/hip roof and wood shingle and brick exterior walls. The building is approximately 2,328 square feet of heated space and 2,798 square feet of total area. The existing roof has architectural asphalt shingles that are at the end of their useful life.

The proposal under consideration would overlay the current shingles with metal roofing. The project involves the installation of purlins over the top of the existing roof material. The purlins will be installed and nailed to the decking as well as the rafters. A 29 gauge galvalume, ultra-rib metal roofing panel system will be placed over the top of the purlins. Panels will be fastened to the purlins with metal roofing screws and all

flashings will be installed over the eave, gable, ridge, valley, chimney stack, vent, and pipe boots. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The existing structure is a non-contributing single-family building. The structure has a high slope roof but it is not highly visible from the street since the slope faces away from the street. In addition, there is currently extensive tree cover on either side of the house, further limiting the visual impact of a metal roof on the adjacent neighboring properties. The installation of a metal roof on this structure will have very little visual impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed metal roofing is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-4 with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to Continue
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hausauer
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

200894.

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-13.</u> Tidewater Properties LLC, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 427 NW 2nd Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

**Project Description** 

The property is located at 427 NW 2nd Street on the east side, with a zoning designation of DT (Downtown). The site under tax parcel 14792-001-001 is located within a recently approved minor subdivision. The subject property is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.07 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house

will be 3 bedrooms and 2 bathrooms, with approximately 1,110 square feet of living area. It will be a 1 story structure that will be facing NW 2nd Street. The house will feature a raised monolithic concrete foundation, Hardie fiber-cement lap siding with Kaycan aluminum vented fascia and trim, Plastpro fiberglass exterior doors, Tamko 30 year Dimensional shingles in Rustic Black, and MI Fin Frame vinyl windows. The proposed windows are white single-hung vinyl with 4 / 1 mullion arrangements. The porch will be made from 3000 PSI concrete.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-00013 with the following conditions:

- § Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.
- § Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.
- § Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve with multiple changes including removing the aluminum soffit, changing the soffit, change the front windows to one over one style, have a two-foot raised foundation, do not cover the piers with the lattice accent, and remove the shutters on the front windows.

Motion by: Member Nesberg Seconded by: Member Warinner Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

#### <u>200895.</u>

Reroof office building with a metal roof, add shaker shingles & general repairs (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-14.</u> Eric Leightman, University Realty, LLC, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing office building with a metal roof, add shaker shingles to a front elevation, and general repairs. Located at 1107 SW 2nd Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South.

## **Project Description**

The existing office building was built as a single-family dwelling in 1906, according to the Florida Master Site File AL001125. It is a 1 ½ story frame Craftsman style house featuring a battered pier porch. There is an intersecting gable roof with composition shingles, wood weatherboard siding with 2 inch and 4 inch planks, a pier foundation, and wood windows. The property is zoned Urban 5 and is approximately 0.14 acres in size. The building is approximately 2,419 square feet in total area, and 2,077 square feet in heated area. It is located in the University Place subdivision, platted in 1909.

The proposal would replace the existing shingle roof with a new 26 gauge 5V

Crimp style roofing system, with a Galvalume finish from Tri County Metals. The project also involves the placement of shaker shingles (Hardieshingle siding) to replace the siding surrounding the second floor window on the front side of the building; the removal of the existing light fixture on the front porch to be replaced by a light fixture on each side of the porch; repair/removal of broken wood on the ceiling of the entry porch to be stained with an oak finish; and repair/removal of broken wood on the exterior floor of the front porch if needed, to be replaced with similar wood planks and painted dark brown.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible.

The proposed shaker shingles around the second floor window involves the removal of the existing siding to be replaced with the shingles. The applicant wants this to be an accent to the overall design of the building. They note that the building next door to the west (1113 SW 2nd Avenue) has shaker shingles and that two houses to the east at 1023 SW 2nd Avenue also has shaker shingles. They feel that the addition of the shaker shingles will help the building fit in better with the historic district.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approval of the reroof from shingle to the 5V-Crimp metal roof and staff recommends the board hear the request for the shaker shingle siding around the second story window above the front porch as proposed in the application.

Motion to approve with conditions including changing the proposed Hardieshingle on the front gable to a wood shingle.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Hausauer Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

#### <u>200896.</u>

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

<u>Petition HP-21-15.</u> Ricardo Cavallino, Ricardo Cavallino and Associates, Inc., agent for Martine Lowe, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 622 NW 1st Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

#### **Project Description**

The property is located at 622 NW 1st Street on the west side, with a zoning designation of RC (Residential Conservation). The site under tax parcel 14192-000-000 is located just to the south of a recently reviewed Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction at 626 NW 1st Street. The subject property is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 0.110 acres in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 4 bedrooms and 4 ½ bathrooms, with approximately 2,008 square feet of conditioned space. It will be a 3 story structure that will be facing NW 1st Street. The house will feature a 16 inch raised finished floor foundation (16 inches from the existing adjacent grade elevation); 8 inch horizontal cementitious siding with accent cementitious shake and matching vertical and horizontal trim material of a different width. The front porch will be cement. The proposed windows are Jeld-Wen single-hung white vinyl windows with 3 / 1 mullion arrangements. The proposed exterior doors will be Jeld-Wen painted fiberglass doors with a stamped rectangular design in a pastel color, while the proposed roof for the house including the porch will be a metal 5V-Crimp style, in Galvalume, manufactured by Tri-County Metals.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-00015 with the following conditions:

- § Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.
- § Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.
- § Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to continue
Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hausauer
Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

#### REQUEST TO ADDRESS THE BOARD:

Gary Anglin, Presentation on a possible two-building multiple-family development. Located at 131 NW 9th Terrace. These buildings will be non-contributing structures to the University Heights Historic District- North.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS:**

200897.

Gainesville Community Reinvestment Area (GCRA) Community

**Enhancement and Housing Initiatives (B)** 

RECOMMENDATION Hear update from GCRA staff and provide feedback

## STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

200666.

**Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness (B)** 

<u>Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness</u>. September 2020 through December 2020.

**Project Description** 

This is a list of staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness from September of 2020 to December of 2020.

RECOMMENDATION Historic Preservation Board review the information.

**PUBLIC COMMENT** 

**MEMBER COMMENT** 

**NEXT MEETING DATE: April 6, 2021** 

**ADJOURNMENT**