

City of Gainesville

*City Hall
200 East University Avenue
Gainesville, Florida 32601*



Minutes - Final

June 1, 2021

5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

*Jay Reeves - Chair
Bill Warinner - Member
Michelle Hazen - Member
Danielle Masse - Member
Kyra N. Lucas - Member
Elizabeth Hausauer - Member
Nicole Nesberg - Member
Elizabeth Hauck - Member
Michael Hill - Member
Jason Simmons - Staff Liaison*

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equal Opportunity at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS French Creole relay, please call 1-877-955-8707.

CALL TO ORDER**ROLL CALL**

Members Present: Jay Reeves, Bill Warinner, Kyra Lucas, Michael Hill,
Danielle Masse, Nicole Nesberg

Staff Present: Jason Simmons and Brittany McMullen

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion to approve with modification to move information item 210062 to the beginning of the agenda.

Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Lucas
Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

ANNOUNCEMENT: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[200794.](#)

Draft Minutes of the April, 2021 Historic Preservation Board Meeting (B)**RECOMMENDATION**

Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the April, 2021 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

Motion to approve the minutes

Motion by: Member Warinner
Seconded by: Member Hill
Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

OLD BUSINESS:

[201016.](#)

University Heights Historic District - South. Construction of a sorority

house. (B)

Petition HP-21-00025. Kary Huffman, Florida House Corporation of Alpha Phi, agent for Michelle Ardern, Phi Sigma Sigma, Inc., owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a sorority house with a request for modification of the front building placement line. Located at 505 & 517 SW 10th Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to HP-21-26, HP-21-27, & HP-21-28.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board:

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following condition(s):

- 1. Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.*
- 2. Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.*
- 3. Notify staff of any changes during construction.*

Jason Simmons, Planner, re-introduced the item. Craig Brasher, CHW, gave an overview of the applicant proposal. Dart Davis, project architect, explained the revised elevations for the proposed sorority house and answered questions from the board. Kary Huffman, applicant, answered questions from the board about the use of the existing single-family buildings and the garage.

Motion to approve with conditions

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 4-2 vote

[201017.](#)

Relocation of a house within the same lot (B)

Petition HP-21-26. Kary Huffman, Florida House Corporation of Alpha Phi, agent for Michelle Ardern, Phi Sigma Sigma, Inc., owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to relocate a single-family dwelling from tax parcel 13157-000-000 to tax parcel 13156-000-000. Located at 505 SW 10th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to HP-21-25, HP-21-27, & HP-21-28.

Project Description

This project involves the relocation of a single-family dwelling onto an adjacent lot. The structure is located at 505 SW 10th Street. The structure was built circa 1912, according to the Florida Master Site File and 1935 according to the property appraiser's office. The property is zoned Urban 5 and is approximately 0.28 acres

in size. The building is a contributing structure to the University Heights South Historic District. The proposal is to relocate the house to the adjacent tax parcel 13156-000-000, and place it on the south end of the property, east of where another house is to be located. Related petition HP-21-00028 proposes to relocate the building at 517 SW 10th Street to the northwest corner of SW 10th Street and SW 6th Avenue. The relocation of these structures will allow for more space for the proposed sorority house development that would be built on the combined development site of 505 and 517 SW 10th Street. The relocated house will be used as a potential guest suite for the Alpha Phi sorority.

The proposed placement of the house has to comply with the building placement standards for transect zones. At the proposed location SW 6th Avenue is a local street, with a building placement requirement of 15 feet minimum and 20 feet maximum from the curb. The placement on the SW 6th Avenue side may be greater than the 20 foot maximum. The board may want to consider a modification of the existing zoning requirement for the building placement along SW 6th Avenue.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following condition(s):

- 1. The board consider a modification of the building placement requirement on the SW 6th Avenue side of the relocated house.*
- 2. Care will be taken to ensure that all character defining features are adequately protected from damage/loss during the moving process.*

Motion to Approve relocation with staff recommendations and including the modification of the proposed building placement to no more than 27 feet maximum along SW 6th Avenue.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 4-2 vote

201018.

Demolition of an auxiliary structure (B)

Petition HP-21-27. Kary Huffman, Florida House Corporation of Alpha Phi, agent for Michelle Ardern, Phi Sigma, Inc., owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an accessory garage. Located at 517 SW 10th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to HP-21-25, HP-21-26, & HP-21-28.

Project Description

The existing principal structure is a two-story, Tudor Revival Period house, that was a residence turned sorority and features asymmetric, picturesque massing, cross gables with false half timbering and the small-paned, multi-lighted window type

characteristic of the revived 13th -14th century English country house. The exterior fabric includes the half timbering, brick and stucco, with a lifetime Dutch lap asbestos roof surface. There is a Florida Master Site File for the house where it was determined to be a fine university example of a Tudor Revival Period house. The contributing accessory structure is not described in the Florida Master Site file for the property. The house was built in 1960 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers office. However, both structures are shown on the 1928 Sanborn Map, and the detached accessory structure is indicated as a garage. The site file indicates that the house is located in the 1912 University Heights subdivision but was likely not built until the early 1920s. Brick is the primary building material on the garage structure with two wooden garage doors and a metal roof.

This project involves the demolition of the accessory structure. The approximately 441 square foot building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South and currently serves as a garage. The proposal is to demolish the structure to allow space for a new residential building. As part of this request, if this petition is approved, the requirement for the 90-day demolition delay for the structure will be waived.

The applicants proposing demolition of the accessory structure indicate that there are no unique qualities specific to the structure other than its connection to the existing principal structure at 517 SW 10th Street. The building is in poor condition and needs to be refurbished. However, the building does not fit within the fabric of the overall project, which includes the relocation of the principal structures at 505 and 517 SW 10th Street, the construction of a sorority house, and associated parking. The relocation of the structure has been considered but the function of the building as a garage and the condition of the building does not make it feasible to move.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-27 with the condition that the owner/developer recycles salvageable material from the structure, to the extent feasible, for re-use elsewhere on the development site.

Motion to approve with staff recommendations

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Upon Vote: 3-3 (Tie means no action was taken)

[201019.](#)

Relocation of a house within the same lot (B)

Petition HP-21-28. Kary Huffman, Florida House Corporation of Alpha Phi, agent for Michelle Ardern, Phi Sigma Sigma, Inc., owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to relocate a single-family dwelling within the same parcel. Located at 517 SW 10th Street. This building is a contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - South. Related to HP-21-25,

HP-21-26, & HP-21-27.**Project Description**

The existing principal structure is a two-story, Tudor Revival Period house, that was a residence turned sorority and features asymmetric, picturesque massing, cross gables with false half timbering and the small-paned, multi-lighted window type characteristic of the revived 13th -14th century English country house. The exterior fabric includes the half timbering, brick and stucco, with a lifetime Dutch lap asbestos roof surface. There is a Florida Master Site File for the house where it was determined to be a fine university example of a Tudor Revival Period house. The contributing accessory structure is not described in the Florida Master Site file for the property. The house was built in 1960 according to the Alachua County Property Appraisers office. However, both structures are shown on the 1928 Sanborn Map, and the detached accessory structure is indicated as a garage. The site file indicates that the house is located in the 1912 University Heights subdivision but was likely not built until the early 1920s. Brick is the primary building material on the garage structure with two wooden garage doors. The roof type of the house is intersecting gables with pressed metal and a brick chimney while the accessory structure has a metal roof.

The structure to be shifted is a two story single-family house that is approximately 2,814 square feet in total area. The proposed placement of the house has to comply with the building placement standards for transect zones. At this location both SW 10th Street and SW 6th Avenue are local streets, with a building placement requirement of 15 feet minimum and 20 feet maximum from the curb. On a corner lot the street setback is applicable for both street frontage sides meaning 15 feet minimum and 20 feet maximum distance is required along SW 10th Street and SW 6th Avenue. The placement on the SW 6th Avenue side is greater than the 20 foot maximum. The board may want to consider a modification of the existing zoning requirement for the building placement along SW 6th Avenue.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following condition(s):

- 1. The board consider a modification of the building placement requirement on the SW 6th Avenue side of the relocated house.*
- 2. Care will be taken to ensure that all character defining features are adequately protected from damage/loss during the moving process.*

Motion to Approve relocation with staff recommendations and including the modification of the proposed building placement requirement from 15 -20 feet to no more than 27 feet along SW 6th Avenue.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 4-2 vote

NEW BUSINESS:

[210045.](#)

Construct a new multiple-family development in University Heights Historic District - North (B)

Petition HP-21-17. Gary Anglin, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two building multiple-family development. Located at 131 NW 9th Terrace. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the University Heights Historic District - North.

Project Description

The subject property is located in the University Heights Historic District - North and is approximately 0.25 acres in size. The development site consists of tax parcels 13706-000-000, 13704-000-000, & 13704-002-000 and is located between NW 9th Street and NW 9th Terrace. The parcels are currently vacant. The proposed two buildings in the multiple-family development will be non-contributing structures to the University Heights Historic District - North. The tax parcel 13704-002-000 is the only one with an address, which is 131 NW 9th Terrace. The properties have a zoning designation of U6 (Urban 6).

The project involves the construction of two new multiple-family buildings with 8-units. There will be a 2-story building on the north with 4 units and a 3-story building on the south that will have parking on the ground level, and 2 units each on the second and third floors. The development also includes a center driveway, parking, and an open courtyard between the two buildings.

Historic design features from the neighboring area such as frame and masonry construction, are incorporated into the proposed buildings. Features are to include:

- Covered concrete front porches for the ground floor units with steel handrails. There are also 2 smaller street-side covered porches accessing the 2 ground floor units on the north side of the project.
- Four fluted columns support each porch; other fluted columns support the walkway and the stairs. The fluted column design is on the masonry walls separating the streets from the center courtyard.
- Tall and narrow windows. There are 18 pieces of fixed glass in aluminum frames in the masonry walls separating the two streets from the center courtyard, in order to comply with COG glazing requirements.
- Roof to be covered with a 24 gauge standing seam metal roof.
- Textured cement stucco exterior (real cement, not acrocrete). Exterior walls

are concrete block filled solid with concrete. The outside surface is cement stucco. Project will use a rough textured stucco at the exterior of the first floor. The second story changes to a medium stucco texture; the third story is a smoother finish of stucco.

- All entry doors at the front porches are hollow metal raised panel.
- The balcony doors on the second and third floors are 5 foot wide aluminum sliding glass doors.
- Windows to be single hung vinyl, the SHORELINE series manufactured by Vinyl Window Technologies (Vi Win Tech).
- The overhang is 30 inches wide; the soffit is a flat horizontal projection while the fascia is 2 x 8 cement board, wood texture. The soffit is flat panel Hardie cement sheets.
- Footings are continuous concrete. The foundation walls are concrete block covered with stucco.
- The first, second, and third floor front porches are all concrete, as well as the walkways between them. The porch columns are fluted concrete.
- Asphalt driveway and parking spaces; 5 foot wide concrete sidewalks running N/S along the adjacent streets.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-00017 with the following conditions:

§ Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.

§ Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve with staff recommendations

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

[210046.](#)

Obtain COA for fencing installed around the side and back yard of a single-family dwelling (B)

Petition HP-21-42. Nestor Perez, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to gain approval of installed fencing along the side and rear of a single-family dwelling. Located at 236 NW 3rd Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking the approval of a six foot tall wood picket fence that was installed without receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the proposal. The owners have been cited by the Code Enforcement Division for a fence installation without receiving a COA. The front of the structure faces NW 3rd Avenue with a highly visible side and rear yard on NW 3rd Street. This petition makes the request that the installed fence remain in place. The fence begins at a point almost 4 feet from the front wall plane of the house. It provides privacy to the

back yard for the family on the west side and in the rear. The applicants feel that the fence is consistent with many other vertical wood picket fences found throughout the Pleasant Street neighborhood. The applicants consider the six foot high fence to be a privacy fence, requested to provide some useable private family area in the back yard.

The six foot tall wood picket fence does not extend in to the front yard beyond the front wall of the house, but this property is a corner lot with a highly visible side and rear yard. The two sides of the fence on the west and the north, are highly visible from the right-of-way. The wood fence for the west elevation is not more than six feet in height and is an appropriate material. The rear elevation fencing meets the City of Gainesville's Historic Preservation Rehabilitation and Design Guidelines for fencing because it is constructed of wood and is no greater than six feet in height.

In the past the HPB has heard discussion about fencing on corner lots in the historic districts. Design considerations at these times included consideration of a six foot fence that was solid for four feet in height and then more of an open design for the remaining two feet in height, and location of the fence relative to the sidewalk. On this segment of NW 3rd Street, the east side of the street does not have a sidewalk. The six foot tall fence is approximately 39 inches off of the back of the curb. The corner lot is on the northeast corner of NW 3rd Avenue and NW 3rd Street. NW 3rd Avenue is a major east-west route through the neighborhood from NW 6th Street to the heart of downtown while NW 3rd Street is a way to get through the neighborhood from NW 8th Avenue to West University Avenue, meaning that this corner gets vehicle traffic as well as pedestrian traffic. The board should deliberate on the height issue of the fence located along the east side of NW 3rd Street.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Motion to Approve the petition noting that this is a unique condition and that the owner has agreed to seek the modification of the top of the fence to make it visually more compatible with those fences that are established in the neighborhood and move the location of the south part of the fence from near the southwest corner of the house to the northwest corner of the house, all on a one time case basis.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

[210047.](#)

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

Petition HP-21-43. Evan Chance, owner. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 616 SE 4th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Southeast Residential Historic District.

Project Description

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story bungalow that was built in 1933 according to the property appraiser's office, and in 1925 according to the Florida Master site file AL02082. It appears on the 1928 Sanborn map. It had been severely altered by the enclosure of its porch and the addition of asbestos shingle siding. Since then the porch has been opened back up. The house is a wood frame structure on a brick pier foundation with lattice work, a gable roof with a secondary gable for the porch, and a chimney on the east wall. The building has approximately 1,338 square feet of heated space and 1,482 square feet of total area. The building is a contributing structure to the Southeast Residential Historic District.

The proposal under consideration with this application is the installation of a 26 gauge Polar White standing seam metal roof over underlayment, manufactured by Tri-County Metals. It is a 1 inch standing seam metal roofing system. The work involves removing the existing drip edge and flashing and installing Rex underlayment over the existing shingle roof, installing deck tie plumbing boots and valley metal on ridge ventilation and ridge cap, replacing plywood if necessary, and using dimensional lumber if necessary.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The installation of a metal roof on this structure will have very little visual impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The applicants are asking to use Polar White panels, which differs somewhat from the standard recommendation for metal roof colors which are Galvalume or a light to medium gray finish. The board should discuss the color choice for the proposal. Staff finds that the proposed metal roofing is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Staff recommends approval of the reroof from shingle to metal with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to Approve reroof with a Galvalume finish.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Masse

Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

[210048.](#)

Reroof single-family dwelling with a metal roof (B)

Petition HP-21-49. Carson James, Whitton Roofing Company, agent for David Harlos and Darcie MacMahon, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to reroof an existing single-family dwelling with a metal roof. Located at 618 NE 9th Avenue. This building is a contributing structure to the Northeast

Residential Historic District.**Project Description**

The existing single-family dwelling is a one-story, stone bungalow that was built in 1926 according to the Alachua County property appraiser's office, and c. 1928 per the Florida Master Site File AL00776. It appears on the Sanborn map of 1928. The house is masonry structure with stone and rubble for exterior materials, a masonry wall foundation, a stone columns porch, a port cochere, stucco covered chimney, and a hip roof with a hip, cross gable secondary roof structure with composition shingles. The building is approximately 1,949 square feet of heated space and 2,567 square feet of total area and it is a contributing structure to the Northeast Residential Historic District.

The proposal under consideration with this application would remove the existing architectural shingles from the house and the detached garage and install a 5V Crimp metal roof over 1 x 4 purlins. The proposed roofing is Galvalume in color and is manufactured by Tri-County Metals.

Roofs are a highly visible component of historic buildings and are an integral part of a building's overall design and architectural style. The Historic Preservation Board discussed and adopted a policy on April 2, 2013 concerning styles of metal roofing which would be allowed within the historic districts. The Historic Preservation Board approves metal roofing on a case-by-case basis depending on the style and use of the building. Recommended metal roofing for most buildings in the historic district is a 5-V crimp or standing seam metal, as spacing of these roofs is more sympathetic with historic metal roofs, and exposed fasteners are not as numerous or visible. The principal structure has a hip roof that is somewhat screened from the street because of the amount of trees in the front yard, such that it is not easy to see the full surface of the roof from the right-of-way. The installation of a metal roof on this structure will have very little visual impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed metal roofing is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood. However in light of recent discussions among the board members about the suitability of 5-V crimp metal roofs on architecturally significant homes in the Northeast Residential Historic District, the board should discuss how suitable this style of metal roof is for this particular structure.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Staff recommends approval of the reroof from shingle to metal with the condition that the finish be Galvalume or a light to medium gray paint finish.

Motion to deny

Motion by: Member Lucas

Seconded by: Member Hill

Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

[210050.](#)

Construct a new single-family dwelling in Pleasant Street (B)

Petition HP-21-55. Tidewater Properties LLC, owners. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling. Located at 425 NW 2nd Street. This building will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

Project Description

The property is located at 425 NW 2nd Street on the east side, with a zoning designation of DT (Downtown) (See Figure 1). The site under tax parcel 14792-002-000, parcel 1 is located within a recently approved minor subdivision. The subject property is located in the Pleasant Street Historic District and is approximately 4,422 square feet in size. The proposed single-family dwelling will be a non-contributing structure to the Pleasant Street Historic District.

The project involves the construction of a new single-family residence. The house will be 3 bedrooms and 2 bathrooms, with approximately 1,206 square feet of living area. It will be a 1 story structure that will be facing NW 2nd Street. The house will feature a raised monolithic concrete foundation, Hardie fiber-cement lap siding exposed wood fascia and trim, Plastpro fiberglass exterior doors, Tamko 30 year Dimensional shingles in Rustic Black, and MI Fin Frame vinyl windows. The proposed windows are white single-hung vinyl with 4 / 1 mullion arrangements. The porch will be made from 3000 PSI concrete.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Approve Petition HP-21-00055 with the following conditions:

§ Windows shall utilize the Simulated Divided Light grilles for the grille pattern or actual divided light grilles for the chosen window.

§ Provide information sheets for the proposed windows, doors, and roofing material.

§ Notify staff of any changes during construction.

Motion to approve with staff recommendations

Motion by: Member Lucas

Seconded by: Member Hill

Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

PUBLIC COMMENT

STAFF APPROVED CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

[200666.](#)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness (B)

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness. March 2021 to April 2021.

Project Description

This is a list of staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness from March 2021 to April 2021.

RECOMMENDATION

Historic Preservation Board review the information.

INFORMATION ITEM(S):

[210062.](#)

**Dangerous building designation by Code Enforcement at 315 NW 4th Place.
(B)**

Information Item: Declaration of a dangerous building by Code Enforcement. Located at 315 NW 4th Place.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board review the information about the declaration of a dangerous building.

Motion to Approve the request for demolition of a dangerous building and waive the 90-day demolition delay.

Motion by: Member Warinner

Seconded by: Member Nesberg

Motion passes following a 5-1 vote

MEMBER COMMENT

NEXT MEETING DATE: July 6, 2021

ADJOURNMENT