City of Gainesville

City Hall 200 East University Avenue Gainesville, Florida 32601



Minutes - Final

May 3, 2022 5:30 PM

City Hall Auditorium, 200 East University Avenue

Historic Preservation Board

Jay Reeves - Chair Bill Warinner - Member Michelle Hazen - Member Elizabeth Hauck - Member Michael Hill - Member Nathaniel Courtney - Member Philip Haight - Member Rachel Iannelli - Member Azza Kamal - Member Bridgette Murphy - Student Seat Kathleen Kauffman - Staff Liaison

If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in this meeting, please contact the Office of Equity and Inclusion at (352) 334-5051 at least two business days in advance. TTY (Text Telephone Telecommunication Device) users please call 711 (Florida Relay Service). For Speech to Speech (STS) relay, please call 1-877-955-5334. For STS Spanish to Spanish relay, please call 1-877-955-8773. For STS Spanish to English relay, please call 1-844-463-9710.

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Reeves at 5:33 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Nathaniel Courtney, Phil Haight, Liz Hauck, Rachel Iannelli, Dr. Azza Kamal, Bridgette Murphy (student), Jay Reeves (Chair), Bill Warinner (Vice-chair)

Staff Present: Kathleen Kauffman (HPO)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

<u>211189.</u>

Draft Minutes of the March 2022 Historic Preservation Board Meeting (B)

RECOMMENDATION Staff is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board review the draft minutes from the March 2022 meeting and vote to approve the minutes.

Staff to the Historic Preservation Board - Review and approve the draft minutes.

Motion to approve Motion By: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Liz Hauck Motion passes following a 6-0 vote

PUBLIC COMMENT

Tana Silva – Wanted to bring a few items of concern to the Board's attention. The first being the GCRA's Historic Home Stabilization Program, a grant program to prevent demolition by neglect. Ms. Silva asked the Board to please support the GCRA's efforts to get this program off the ground, even though there is little funding for it at this time. The second item was to encourage the City Commission to not demolish the Old Fire Station, that it is a fine example of mid-century architecture and what would potentially replace it (most likely more student housing) would never have the character this existing building has and it is such a nice piece of Gainesville history, it would be a shame to lose this for more of the same (new buildings). The third item was to please support the restoration of the Thelma Bolton Center, which is significant to Gainesville's history and an integral part of the community.

Betsy Waite, Director of Wild Spaces, Public Places – Gave an update on the Thelma Bolton Center. Explained that they were asked to provide an update to the Commission on the building. This project came before the Historic Preservation Board in the spring of 2021 with 60% complete design plans and the Board had approved those plans on May 4, for renovations and an addition. Since that time, the project stalled due to the Covid pandemic. The hollow walls have since started separating from the roof, the roof is caving in, and the foundation has been found to be undersized. It is Parks desire and intent to work hand in hand with the Historic Preservation Board to do the right thing for the Thelma Bolton Center, and will not do anything to the building before getting a COA for the projected course of action.

Melanie Barr - Spoke in favor of preserving the Thelma Bolton Center. Gave a brief history of the building and talked about its significance to the community. Mentioned that part of the City's strategic plan is to maintain and update public facilities, not demolish them. Showed some examples of buildings in worse off condition that were brought back to life through proper preservation efforts.

Kathleen Pagan – Has been a part of a preservation/educational organization called the Living New Deal (www.livingnewdeal.org) which records the public works buildings that were built under the New Deal in the United States. This organization has surveyed the Gainesville area and has recognized the Gainesville Serviceman Center as 1 of 9 sites in Gainesville, and it is only 1 of 210 still existing in Florida. Of buildings of this type and function, it is only 1 of 456 in the nation. Ms. Pagan reminded the Board that the greenest and most sustainable building is the one that is already built.

PUBLIC HEARING

- A. Swearing in of the Public
- B. Requests for Deferral
- C. Continued Items: N/A
- D. New Item(s):

<u>211187.</u> <u>Petition COA-22-000023.</u>

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval with the following condition: Condition 1: Applicant shall provide additional photo-documentation to staff regarding the existing two windows on the historic portion of the house. Applicant shall work with staff to see if the historic window that is being replaced by the door can be reused as part of the other window enlargement. If it is proven this cannot be done, then a more appropriate window type which matches the existing windows (materials and configuration) shall be used for the triple-window enlargement.

Motion for applicant to resubmit the application, and include a dated engineer's report, and the requested demolition will be contingent upon the new design Motion By: Bill Warinner, Motion Seconded By: Phil Haight Motion passes following a 6-1 vote

<u>211188.</u> Petition HP 21-00134.

RECOMMENDATION Staff recommends approval with the following conditions: Condition 1: The vernacular architectural vocabulary of the new project shall be retained as designed but shall be reconfigured to be a one-story residence.

> Condition 2: The gable eave vent feature shall be changed to the vertical slat configuration as exists on the building now, as a way to pay homage to the lost historic structure.

> Condition 3: The windows shall be designed as 2/2 SHS as a way to pay homage to the lost historic structure, since that was the original configuration, according to the Florida Master Site File form and survey.

Motion to Approve with Conditions

Condition 1 – additional photo documentation will be provided on the one window on the rear of the historic portion of the house which is proposed for removal, and applicant shall work with staff to see if the historic window that is being replaced by the door can be reused as part of the other triple window enlargement for the kitchen. If it is shown this cannot be done, a more appropriate window type which matches the existing historic windows (materials and configuration) shall be used for the kitchen window enlargement.

Condition 2- The west facing fenestration is visually inconsistent with the rest of the house and is incompatible. It is also highly visible from the side street. Windows (size and sash) shall be better proportioned and in harmony with the fenestration found on the rest of the house, and may not be vinyl. Motion by: Bill Warriner Seconded By: Liz Hauck Motion passes following a 7-0 vote.

BOARD BUSINESS:

A. Resolution regarding Pleasant Street Historic District access due to road closure at NW 2nd Street

Motion to approve Resolution 2022-01 Motion by: Bill Warriner Seconded by: Liz Hauck Motion passes following a 7-0 vote

B. Historic Preservation Month (May) Activities

C. Board "Items of Interest" were provided by email

MEMBER COMMENT

1. Staff gave an update on the community charrette/workshop that was held last Saturday at Old Mount Carmel Baptist Church.

2. Board brought up the fact that the Thomas Center is looking run down and supports the City finding funding to perform some much needed maintenance.

3. New City Planner Phimetto Lewis was introduced to the Board.

4. Board Chair asked for an update on the Plan Board application for the 12-story building next to the University Heights- South Historic District. Staff explained that it had been deferred to the May Plan Board meeting. Board is adamant about protecting the 4-story height restrictions within the 100' buffer zone around that particular historic district (other districts have a 3-story height restriction in the zone.) The concern is that once the precedent is set that the 100-foot buffer requirements can be ignored, then there will be nothing to protect the context and setting of any or all of our historic districts.

Motion to approve Resolution 2022-02 stating that the Historic Preservation Board opposes the change in zoning and the approval of plans as submitted, and that the buffer next to the Historic District should be maintained at the 4-story height level as in current code, and requests that the Plan Board help maintain the character and context of our historic districts by requiring projects maintain the appropriate scale and visual compatibility. Motion by: Bill Warinner Seconded By: Nathaniel Courtney. Motion passes following a 7-0 vote.

NEXT MEETING DATE: Tuesday, June 7, 2022

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Reeves adjourned the meeting at 7:29 p.m.

DECORUM: Public decorum is required of all persons present at this meeting. Impertinent or slanderous remarks, clapping, heckling, or verbal outbursts of any kind, in support or opposition to a speaker's remarks, shall not be permitted. Individuals acting in a disorderly or disruptive manner shall be required to leave.

AUTHORITY OF THE BOARD: Section 30-3.5 of the Land Development Code establishes the Historic Preservation Board including its composition and duties and authority. The Historic Preservation Board procedures are set forth in Sec. 30-4.28G of the Land Development Code. Appeals of Historic Preservation Board decisions are to the Hearing Officer and must be filed within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the board decision at issue. The appeal procedure is specified in Sec. 30-3.58C. of the Land Development Code.